



Sustainability and Halal: Procedure, Profit and Ethical Practice

Shaheed Tayob

Department of Sociology and Social Anthropology, Stellenbosch University, South Africa

ARTICLE INFO



Article history:

Received 7 July 2021

Accepted 22 September 2021

Published 30 October 2021

Keywords:

Halal, Ethics, Exchange,
Sustainability, Precarity.

ABSTRACT

Halal certification is a technological and technocratic transformation that facilitates increasingly complex food production and global supply chain management. However, the discourse and materiality of global trade and the growth of consumers for which halal certification is in demand have been the target of ethical criticism that puts forward the vulnerabilities of human, non-human, and environmental relations. This paper proceeds through some steps to elucidate questions of halal ethics in practice, halal certification, and Muslim trade and exchange networks. The research method uses a descriptive qualitative approach, using library sources. The results of the analysis and discussion show that the halal discursive tradition that centralizes intra-Muslim networking, trade, and exchange, is significant to consider the ethical stakes of halal certification for marginalized and precarious Muslim populations around the world. Drawing on ethnographic insights on the meat market in Mumbai, I argue that exclusive political intimacy and economic growth mean halal certification can play a part in the marginalization of the Muslim workforce and trade in the city. Therefore, the question of sustainability and halalness must consider the new formation of halal's ethical requirements to bridge the gap between the ethics of trade and intra-Muslim exchange and global trade conditions.

@2021 Journal of Digital Marketing and Halal Industry

Introduction

Around the globe, the halal certification industry increasingly finds itself confronting questions of food security, quality, and sustainability around the globe. Muslim

activists and consumers challenge the technical focus of halal certification and its intimacy with capitalist, industrial production. They call for a return to the 'essence' of halal, which they argue is related to the notion of *tayyib* (goodness) (Amalia, 2019; Aniqoh, 2019; Fauzi et al., 2020; Mubarak & Imam,

2020). Tayyib situates halal as not merely a question of permissibility but turns attention to procurement, production, and care processes for both non-human animals and human consumers (Yasin, 2017). At the same time, the halal certification industry finds itself amid a global critique of capitalism that foregrounds harm to humans, non-human animals, and the environment that has been the outcome of a political and economic dispensation of profit, production, and growth and any cost. Here the very premise of the halal-certification industry to ensure and stimulate Muslim consumption runs up against a discourse that posits industrial production and consumption as the very issue of environmental and ethical concern. The certification industry is thus challenged to navigate between its role as a facilitator of Muslim public consumption and mediator of the always debated and contested question of halal quality. What does it mean to certify and assure halal quality globally? Considering Muslim precarity in the contemporary, what is the ethics and politics of halal certification as a technocratic and bureaucratic formation of halal?

I argue that halal certification radically transforms and prefigures a discursive halal tradition in practice. The turn to what I have called 'molecular halal' situates expert scientific intervention, large-scale capital investment, and audit procedures as central to halal quality assurance (Tayob, 2019b). The certification aims to design procedures through the halal wct of the Muslim trading network. However, the development of audit processes and procedures is not simply the translation of past practices into new forms, as if these practices were untouched by new forms. In this regard, there are new demands

for evidence and new spaces for production and consumption. Instead, the shift in evidence and relationships from Muslim trade and exchange networks to industrial production allows Muslim consumers to enter global markets. Products produced industrially at the same time change the material and ethical basis on which halal determination and practice are based. To speak of sustainability without recognizing this crucial transformation and its contemporary critiques is to misapprehend the nature and problem of halal quality, ethical relation, and industrial production in the contemporary world.

This paper thus proceeds through several steps to illuminate questions of the ethics of halal in practice, halal certification, and Muslim networks of trade and exchange, given the proximity of neoliberal capitalist development to exclusive politics. First, halal quality and sustainability questions must be confronted by discussions of vulnerability, labor, and small business practices.

Literature Review

A Discursive Tradition of Halal in Practice: Trade and Exchange

A common thread in the sociology, anthropology, and industry analysis of halal is that halal certification and halal practice are taken as interchangeable. Sociologists and anthropologists write about the commercialization, standardization, and bureaucratization of halal as a contemporary post-modern and neoliberal capitalist phenomenon whereby consumer concerns about food quality, purity, and health have translated into a desire for labeling,

transparency of production, and ethical supply chain management (Bergeaud-Blackler, Fischer, & Lever, 2016) (Bonne & Verbeke, 2008). The novelty of halal practice in the contemporary is seen as a form of post-modern reflexive consumption (Lever, 2018), a meeting of technoscience and ritual purity (Fischer, 2016), or as an insidious practice 'invented' by Islamic fundamentalism (Bergeaud-Blackler, 2017). Arguments on novelty and contemporaneity and the Islamophobic claims of invention fail to consider the long history of halal in practice as a ritual concern, human-animal consideration, and inter-personal and communal trade and exchange ethics. Even the brilliant historical study by Armanios and Ergene treats the introduction of scientific reason into halal practice as a matter of direct translation, whereby historical forms of reasoning are quantified, measured, and observed (Armanios & Ergene, 2018). There is little consideration of the phenomenon of halal in practice as both technical and ethical, nor of the way that new materiality of substances and the scientific gaze may radically transform the kinds of ethical relations of consumption, sharing, and trade (Tayob, 2020a).

Historically halal entails technical and ethical questions regarding what to eat? How to kill? And with whom to consume and trade? Prophetic guidelines accompany divine instruction on the avoidance of pork and carrion on the method of slaughter and animal treatment. And an embodied discursive tradition of intention (*niyyat*), identity, doubt, and salvation set up an entanglement between everyday culinary practice, social relations, and ultimate salvation. It is important to consider both the materiality and ethics of halal to gain a clear understanding of the stakes of halal certification in an increasingly unequal and

precarious world (Afendi, 2020; Fataron & Rohmah, 2019; Nadhifah & Adinugraha, 2020).

The Prophet Muhammad (*Sunnat*) advised his early followers on the basic ritual guidelines for halal slaughter. Widely practiced by Muslims worldwide, the basic requirements are that *tasmiya* (*Bismillah-Allahu-Akbar*) is recited upon slaughter and that at least two of the three main arteries are severed. In addition, the spinal cord must remain intact so that the heart is not paralyzed and the blood drains from the carcass before preparation and consumption. Given the prevalence of debate between different Muslim schools and sects, and the absence of Quranic references, there are differences of opinion on the necessity of even these basic requirements. Moreover, there are different readings of the meaning of these practices. Nevertheless, it is widely accepted that prayer and non-paralyzing slaughter constitute the basic requirements of halal slaughter.

In addition, there are also a set of recommended practices (*Sunnat*) that are usually not complied with during industrial and commercial slaughter but which are crucial for understanding the ethics of halal in practice. These include that the animal should be offered a sip of water before slaughter, and the knife must be sharp. The animal should not see the knife before slaughter nor witness the blood or the slaughter of other animals. Upon slaughter, the animal must be placed in a clean area facing the direction of Mecca. The prayer is then recited, and slaughter proceeds. Muslim gatherings and sacrifice events in South Africa and Mumbai, where I conducted my ethnographic research, often explained that these practices ensure that the animal remains calm before slaughter. I argue that

these requirements are not simply ritual repetitions, meaningful only within some kind of cosmological order. Rather, taking an embodied and practical approach, these stipulations entail a recognition of the subjectivity of animal life, that while hierarchical, recognizes the responsibility of human care and consideration for animals (Tayob, 2019a). The concern for the well-being of the animal before slaughter is not the same as modern debates about slaughterhouse employee safety (which originally mobilized the debate on stunning) (Bonne & Verbeke, 2008) or post-Enlightenment doubts over animal sentience (Singer, 2009). Halal slaughter includes recognition of animal sentience and subjectivity and concern for navigating the imperative of sacrifice and human consumption with an ethics of care (Tayob, Brill forthcoming, 2021).

In practice, however, the Muslim consumer of meat is usually not the person who slaughters. The profession of butchering and meat trade is not new. Consuming meat is a market practice outside of ritual occasions and rural communities. Yet, the butcher (store owner) is often not the person who performs the slaughter (slaughterer). Trust is therefore central to halal practice in that the consumer trusts the butcher who trusts his employees that the procedures of halal slaughter have complied. Stabilizing these relations of trust is an ethical discourse that articulates a link between *niyyat* (intention/orientation), intra-Muslim trade and exchange, doubt, and salvation. According to an *embodied discursive tradition of halal*, it is considered *makruh* (detestable) or even sinful (*gunah*) to doubt the food of a fellow Muslim. The *niyyat* to consume halal within intra-Muslim trade and exchange networks ensure compliance.

On the other hand, if a supplier has deviously provided non-halal food to a fellow Muslim, then the sin for the transgression accrues to them. Within Muslim networks of trade and exchange, signs of identity and community are the basis through which trust in halal is established. Doubt is frowned upon as an offense to the moral integrity of the supplier. In the absence of clear evidence of a transgression, consumption within Muslim networks of trade exchange is the basis for halal practice. Material integrity is of secondary concern. The desire for evidence is an anathema to a community of shared belief. For this reason, sectarian debates often turn on the unacceptability of the food of Other Muslims, since to deny the halal status of a meal offered is to deny inclusion in the Muslim community (al-Munajjid,).

Halal practice is ritual and ethical in that it prescribes a set of guidelines for slaughter that concern animal subjectivity and infer a community of trade and exchange. Doubt and suspicion are frowned upon, and gifting and exchange are central to a halal imaginary of a group of Muslims sharing, trading, and eating together. The inseparability of ritual prescription, ethical guidelines, and circulation means that halal analyses cannot simply infer the meeting point of religion, ritual, and economy. Halal is a ritual practice that entails a communal economy of trade and exchange. Assessments on the novelty, transformation, or sustainability of halal must reckon with the ethics and materiality of an *embodied halal archive* now disrupted and challenged by new ideas of science, technology, production, and trade.

Halal Certification in Practice: Consumption, Evidence, and Community

<http://journal.walisongo.ac.id/index.php/JDMHI/index>
DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.21580/jdmhi.2021.3.2.9586>

Halal certification is a recent development. Some scholars attribute its emergence to the Iranian revolution and the demand for halal meat imports, while others situate it as central to the 1970's Malaysian government's Islamisation efforts (Fischer, 2011). Regardless of origin, halal certification is inseparable from global trade, capitalist market formation, increasingly complex food production technology, and the Muslim diaspora. Into the 1990s, as the pace of neoliberal reforms took effect around the world, municipal and state regulation of meat production turned towards privatization, regulation through standards rather than direct intervention, and the reduction of import tariffs for meat and non-meat products. Technological developments in industrial food production and the new scale and scope of trade shifted halal concerns in two significant ways. The first is that food technology introduced opacity to food production since even non-meat items could potentially contain products of animal origin, rendering them subject to halal concern. The second is that global trade complicated the trajectory of food and meat, rendering intra-Muslim trade and exchange almost impossible given the complexity of global supply chains. In response, halal certification introduced audit procedures and scientific testing to assure halal's material substance on a global scale. Yet halal certification does not merely respond to new material conditions. Still, it seeks to actively demystify the complexity of industrial food production and global supply chains to assure and promote Muslim public consumption (Tayob, 2016).

Halal certification as a kind of 'supply chain capitalism' (Tsing, 2009) does not consider abstinence a viable option in the face of halal uncertainty. Rather, the industry mobilizes

expert knowledge, molecular testing, and technocratic concerns for data and traceability to assure Muslim consumers of halal consumption even beyond Muslim networks. In doing so, it shifts the basis of halal practice from intra-Muslim networks of trade and exchange to the material integrity of the substance consumed. This is not only a translation of halal reason into a technical language of enzymes, proteins, DNA, and measure; since new technologies and pieces of knowledge are always also implicated in the question of subject formation and ethical relation (Foucault, 2007). This is most apparent when we consider the question of *al-istihaalah* (metamorphosis), for how a new scientific gaze changes the very base upon which halal can be known and consumed.

Here I refer specifically to a South African debate on the permissibility of gelatin between two prominent halal certification organizations over a period of two decades. In 1983 the Muslim Judicial Council (MJC), the first halal organization in the country, obtained an inquiry about the halal status of corporate gelatin manufacturing plant. The MJC is a predominantly Shafii organization based in Cape Town whose ulama are mostly comprised of what is known as the Cape Malay community, decedents of slaves imported to the Cape from the Indonesian archipelago (Tayob, 1999). Upon investigating the manufacturing facility and supply chain, the MJC was faced with the difficulty that the largest and most prominent gelatin manufacture in South Africa regularly uses bones and hides from non-halal slaughtered animals in its production process. According to halal reason, what seems like a mere matter of haram (non-halal) is more complex. In Islamic legal discussions on purity and permissibility, the principle of *al-istihaalah*

(metamorphosis) is established as the total and irreversible transformation of a haram substance into halal. The examples used to illustrate *al-istihaala* are manure in farming that yields fruit on trees and the oxidation of wine into vinegar. The latter is based on a prophetic tradition whereby wine that has become vinegar is now halal for Muslim consumption. Upon inspection of the manufacturing process, the MJC ulama determined that since gelatin crystals are physically indistinguishable from raw bones and hides used in the manufacture and that the process is irreversible, *al-istihaalah* has occurred. According to the MJC fatwa, gelatin produced from the bones and hides of non-halal slaughtered animals is halal.

SANHA is a competing organization founded in 1996 by a group of Deobandi-aligned ulama who follow the Hanafi school. Given that *al-istihaalah* is a Hanafi legal principle, SANHA originally accepted the MJC fatwa. But developments in the genetic modification of food and new medical technologies have introduced new questions about the ontology of substances and the scientific gaze into Muslim legal discussions (Padela, Furber, Kholwadia, & Moosa, 2014). Therefore, in the early 2000s, SANHA revised its position. It argued that collagen is a dominant protein found in bones, muscles, skins, and tendons on a molecular level, and gelatin is an irreversibly hydrolyzed form of collagen. Since collagen is the main substance before and after manufacture, SANHA ruled that gelatin manufacture is a process of *extraction* instead. In making the shift from *al-istihaalah* to *extraction*, SANHA disregarded observable transformation in taste, color, and smell in favor of molecular level continuity. It advises clients to use imported Pakistani-produced

gelatin.

On one level, this shift, which is happening worldwide and continuously debated, is simply a kind of scientific consideration of a discursive tradition. For proponents of the scientific gaze, *al-istihaalah* occurs when wine becomes vinegar through chemical oxidation. The medieval test of transformation of taste, color, and smell is, from this view, an outdated scientific method applied to a valid and sacred prophetic injunction (Moosa, 2021). This kind of technocratic reason, however, fails to appreciate the ethical networks of trade and exchange within which halal reason obtains its force. Halal in practice, as I argued, is a set of technical procedures of slaughter, a concern for questions of purity and permissibility, and a practice that infers a community of trade, gifting, and exchange. The sensory observation that establishes *al-istihaala* also ensures that Muslim signs of identity, clothing, names, and greetings are the basis for trust, trade and consumption. Emphasizing a scientific gaze necessarily disrupts the communal and interpersonal assertion of halal quality, since expert mediation and intervention are the only means of assuring halal.

Situating halal as a question of material integrity rather than a community of intention (*niyyat*), trade and trust mean that even Muslim suppliers, friends, and family may now be a source of impermissible consumption. For example, in South Africa, an early SANHA publication called on housewives to inspect the ingredients of their kitchens since ignorance of complex food production could surreptitiously permit the entry of non-halal substances into the home (SANHA, 2008). *Niyyat*, a subjective assertion of will central to Islamic ritual practice (Powers, 2004)

(Mahmood, 2011), is here sidelined in favor of scientifically 'objective' material information. Halal is thus reduced to a question of what to eat, rather than with whom.

Practically, householders must consume food that has been halal certified and consumers should visit establishments that have been subject to a halal audit. But what of the networks of Muslim traders, butchers and entrepreneurs who have historically serviced Muslim consumption? What is the impact of a system of audit inspection and standardization on small businesses, home manufacturers and traders who do not have the financial means, stable premises and complex organizational structure, so central to audit practice? Finally, what are the stakes of sustainability for halal certification given the increasing confluence between neoliberal economics and exclusionary politics that have particularly affected Muslim minorities worldwide?

The Method, data, and analysis

This study used a qualitative approach by producing descriptive data in words from the behavior being studied. A qualitative approach is a complex picture examining words, detailed reports of the respondent's viewpoint, and conducting case studies of natural situations. The paradigm used in this research is the constructivist paradigm. The constructivist paradigm is a paradigm that is almost the antithesis of the understanding that places observation and objectivity in discovering a reality or science. The data collection technique used in this research is document study because it is necessary to analyze content related to research. Document study itself is a qualitative data collection method by viewing or analyzing documents created by the subject

himself or others. Researchers do this to obtain accurate data results according to the source. The data analysis technique used a qualitative approach with descriptive analysis.

Result and Discussion

Sustainable Capitalism, Precarity and the Anthropocene

Questions on the sustainability of halal or the development of a sustainable halal industry must consider the debates and critiques of sustainable capitalism as entangled with questions of the precarity of labor and the natural environment. Halal certification, I have shown, entails an ethical shift whereby technical questions of material integrity partially displace the question of ethical relations of consumption and trade. Sustainable capitalism, in contrast, is a corporate response to the ethical critique that situates human, non-human, and environmental relations as central to questions of inequality, poverty, and environmental destruction. According to the critique, the capitalist ideology of infinite growth and the refusal to consider environmental externalities as part of the industry's cost have wrought immeasurable damage to natural environments and precarious human populations. Where halal certification entails a shift of ethical consideration from human and animal relations to technical rules, the critique of capitalism moves in the opposite direction, seeking to insert questions of relation into what has been conceived and practiced as a technocratic, functionalist process.

Sustainable capitalism introduces measures, metrics and standards to report on the environmental footprint of products. Termed,

Life Cycle Analysis (LCA), corporations now employ LCA-consultants to trace, measure, and evaluate the environmental impact over its life cycle. But, LCA analysis, although presenting a discourse of sustainability and environmental concern, remains profit-driven. For example, Walmart famously installed methane digesters at a supply facility that reduced greenhouse emissions and yielded costs savings of \$250 million (Freidberg, 2013, p. 579). According to Freidberg, for Walmart, 'eco-efficiency does not challenge their business model; it does not require consumers to buy less and 'does not necessarily challenge yield-maximizing practices' (Freidberg, 2013, p. 582). Comparable to halal certification, LCA reports on certain measures regarding the supply chain quality (environmental impact quality or halal quality). But thus far, both fail to challenge the ethical presumptions of growth and profit. LCA practitioners, in particular, have promoted environmental solutions that are, in the long term, as equally destructive as established practices (Freidberg, 2013, p. 587). Moreover, the establishment of measures and metrics is on closer inspection subject to the 'green-washing' critique. Companies mobilize environmental concern as a marketing technique to promote the consumption that environmentalists recognize as the cause of environmental decay.

Sustainability practitioners often subdue ethical concerns in favor of technical and technological solutions. For example, in Masdar City in Abu Dhabi, an eco-city built for zero-carbon living, consultants are clear that zero-carbon living aims not to rethink the question of lifestyles and consumption but rather to secure a future where consumer lifestyles can continue, carbon-neutrally. Gunel's term 'technical adjustment' captures

how sustainable capitalism focuses on responses that sustain the status quo by sidelining 'ethical, moral and political entailments' (Gunel, p. 11). The aim is a future 'where humans will continue to enjoy technological complexity without interrogating existing social, political and economic relations' (Gunel, p. 10). The problem for consultants is not growth per se or the 'simple realization that humans cannot continue to live and consume as they do' (Gunel, p. 10), but rather a utopian ideal of a carbon-free living for a select and elite few. At Masdar, technical adjustments and reporting technologies that market and represent sustainability for a consuming public ignore critical analyses that situate the ideology of capital and consumption as central to environmental destruction, human inequality, and precarity.

As I presented it, Halal certification is a technical, technological, and market-friendly translation and transformation of halal practice. Aiming to facilitate and assure the halal quality of global trade, it is predominantly focused on the certification of industrially produced packaged food and mass-produced meat. Intensive manufacturing plants, the excessive use of packaging, and large transportation distances are aspects of manufactured food that question the sustainability of the halal industry in lieu of environmental critique (Peristiwio, 2021). Moreover, the provision of certification contracts to large meat producers who are responsible for the ecological entailments of mass farming, the unethical treatment and rearing of animals as if they are inanimate inputs, and the terrible working and pay conditions of slaughterhouse labor (Pachirat, 2011) are all questions of ethics that have not

been central to halal certification as a technical and technological project. And the consumer-centric neoliberal policies within which halal certification obtains its legitimacy and demand have been responsible for the increasing precarity of disadvantaged populations across the world as land, bodies, and labor become subjects to the demands of global trade and the relentless search for profit, given the discursive tradition of halal and intra-Muslim networks of trade and exchange. It is important to consider how halal certification impacts small traders and labor in precarious conditions. Whose bodies and profession of faith have been so central to their livelihoods for a long time and are now threatened by the demands of neoliberal aesthetics and ethics of the trade.

Notes From the Field: Muslim Trade and Exclusionary Politics in Mumbai

In India, neoliberal economic policy is closely associated with the rise of a virulent form of right-wing Hindu nationalism, *Hindutva*. For *Hindutva* ideologues, Muslim bodies, labor, food, and ritual practice are evocative of disgust, inimical to their idea of a Hindu majoritarian nation. *Hindutva* discourse imagines the Muslim-as-butcher, who is always intimate with violence and death through Islam and livelihood, and therefore worthy of expiatory sacrifice (Ghassem-Fachandi, 2012). Their idea of a modern, financially and militarily powerful, and globally competitive India is one in which Muslim bodies and labor do not figure in public life. In Mumbai, in particular, the Hindu middle-class imagination of neoliberalism is a shiny new cityscape devoid of Muslim presence (Appadurai, 2000). Materially this means that Muslim neighborhoods and infrastructural facilities have been subject to a process of state neglect and decay that further authorizes the stigma of

Muslim neighborhoods as crowded, dirty and dangerous (Anand, 2012).

But Mumbai is a diverse, meat-consuming city. While the Muslim population comprises only 20% of the total, Muslim butchers, laborers, and traders are responsible for most of the meat supply to small businesses and large hotel chains, restaurants, and fast-food outlets. Inner-city meat markets, the Municipal Deonar Abattoir, and small inner-city butchers are all dominated by Muslim networks of labor and trade. The aesthetics of these spaces is crucial since, in inner-city markets and butcher shops, live slaughter and meat preparation is performed upon customer request. At many butcher stores, live chickens in cages await customer orders. The birds are then weighed, slaughtered, skinned, and prepared according to customer specification, all within a period of two to three minutes. The meat production process is not hidden from view, and the halal quality of the Muslim-slaughtered and supplied meat is rarely in doubt.

In contrast, a new form of packaged chicken, known in Mumbai as 'frozen chicken,' is produced in large corporate production facilities on the city's outskirts. Chickens are slaughtered, cleaned, hygienically packaged, and refrigerated before being delivered to retail outlets and butchers across the city. Partaking in ethics and aesthetics of concealment, the process of slaughter is hidden from view. The form of corporate-produced chicken has two significant impacts on the economy of meat in the city. First, these products threaten the place and profits of small Muslim butchers, who have more to gain from value-added in-store than from working as labor on large corporate abattoirs (Ahmad, 2014) (Ahmad, 2013). Second, the very

presence of these products in hygienic packaging, where slaughter and its by products are concealed, threatens to mark the place and body of the Muslim butcher as a site of disgust, potentially confirming the rhetoric of the Hindu right. For this reason, the butchers I researched on were always certain to promote live-slaughtered chicken and are critical of the new form of packaged consumption increasingly taking hold in Mumbai.

Regarding halal, both forms of chicken are slaughtered by Muslim labor and therefore considered halal. Yet only the latter (packaged chicken) complies with the supply chain management practices of meat safety standards and halal certification, which requires fixed premises, a set of operating procedures, and infrastructural requirements such as packaging and labeling. This means that halal certification potentially partakes of the same exclusion of Muslim bodies as does the ideology of Hindu-nationalist economic development. This fact is not lost on Muslim butchers, and meat traders in Mumbai who actively negotiate and evade halal certification demands increasingly encroaching on their livelihood.

This became most apparent during my research conducted in Mumbai between 2012-2014. I spent time at the Crawford Mutton Market, a prominent wholesale market situated at the Muhammad Ali Rd area entrance in Mumbai. The Muslim majority neighborhood is famous for its Muslim majority population. The Crawford Mutton Market is housed in an old and now derelict structure in need of basic maintenance and repair, an example of how the state neglects Muslim infrastructures in the city. Inside the market are stalls where licensed butchers

display and prepare meat. In the early morning hours, sheep and goats are slaughtered at the Deonar Municipal Abattoir. The carcasses are transported in tempo vans to the vendors for preparation and wholesale supply. Outside is an area where live chicken is slaughtered, processed, and delivered to restaurants and hotels across South Mumbai. Siraj, the nephew of the owner of one of the largest chicken wholesalers in the market, introduced me to his operation, which includes the slaughter, cleaning, de-feathering, and cutting of 5000-6000 chickens per day. Un-skinned chicken is in high demand by 4- and 5-star hotels and restaurant chains in the city. During the past decade, the elite hotel chains have begun demanding that all meat supplied is halal-certified to cater to the certification demands of foreign Muslim visitors. Siraj's operation is not certified, so he supplies the hotels via an intermediary. Agents send him their orders daily. The slaughtered chickens are then transported to separate premises, washed, packaged, labeled, and sent to the hotels. For Siraj, the contravention of the procedure is an ethical practice through which he remains competitive and profitable. The halal certificate is just a documentary supplement to the necessary activity of halal slaughter. As a butcher, his duty to ensure the provision of halal meat to the Muslim community does not necessitate compliance with the documentary demands of the halal certification industry. On the contrary, evading certification is ethical in that it allows him to partake in a competitive industry that is increasingly closed off to small businesses, both due to discriminatory anti-Muslim politics and the bureaucratic demands of halal certification.

Sustainable Capitalism or Sustainable Consumption

<http://journal.walisongo.ac.id/index.php/JDMHI/index>
DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.21580/jdmhi.2021.3.2.9586>

Sustainability is a buzzword of the contemporary moment that is as ambiguous as popular. According to the Oxford English Dictionary, sustainable has a general and specific meaning. Its specific meaning is the property of being 'environmentally sustainable; the degree to which a process or enterprise can be maintained or continued while avoiding the long-term depletion of natural resources' (OED, 2021). Sustainability is thus directly related and opposed to the ideology and practice of capital growth and profit at all costs, which has been a dominant feature of industrial capitalism, responsible for widespread ecological damage. Against a capitalist ideology of unlimited resources, sustainability posits the finiteness of the world and its fragility in sustaining human and non-human life. However, the general definition is more revealing: sustainability refers to 'the quality of being sustainable at a certain rate or level' (OED, 2021). In this general meaning, sustainability is the ability to maintain a certain speed, growth, or profit. Not necessarily relating to economics, the general definition nevertheless illuminates how sustainability has been appropriated as a language of marketing and consulting, where the aim is sustainable growth, profit, and market development (Hirsch, 2020). These two articulations of sustainability are potentially antagonistic as the desire for sustainable growth or profit may compromise environmental and human sustainability.

Halal-certification is intimate with neoliberalism's ideology, industrial food production practices, livestock handling and slaughter, and global trade. Focusing on the materiality and forms of relation that halal certification introduces has illuminated the ethical stakes of halal auditing in potentially

disrupting and marginalizing Muslim networks of labor and trade. Of course, halal certification does not disrupt Muslim networks per se, since the very relations of halal certification have given rise to new halal specialists and auditors whose Muslim identity remains central to their industry practice (Tayob, 2020b). But marginalized populations, small traders and labor, are cut off from halal certification's organizational, technological, and financial demands. This is particularly significant given a discursive tradition of halal that establishes trust in halal quality through intra-Muslim trade and exchange networks. Shifting the evidence of halal from persons to substances necessarily alters the kinds of relations and ethics of exchange.

Given this exclusionary political context, sustainability and halal are complex. Even the desire for environmental sustainability and halal must reckon with exclusionary ethics and politics of capital-intensive production. And industry goals of expanding the reach of halal certification into new markets and increasing the efficiency and technological aspects of halal research also need to consider the ethics of technocratic forms of production and trade. I argue that one way of thinking about sustainability and halal ethics is strengthening Muslim labor, trade, and exchange networks. Not by submitting these networks to the technocratic demands of new materiality and economy, but rather by finding ways of facilitating the interactions and translations between local intra-Muslim practices of halal and global networks of trade. Doing so will mean altering the premise of halal certification today to consider the ethical stakes of trade, exchange, and food production on human, non-human, and environmental life.

Conclusion

Based on the analysis and discussion, it shows that Halal certification is a technological and technocratic transformation that facilitates food production and increasingly complex global supply chain management. However, halal certification is obtained by the discourse and materiality of global trade and consumer growth. As a result, his demands have been subject to ethical criticism that puts forward the vulnerabilities of human, non-human, and environmental relationships. Given the discursive halal tradition centered on labor, trade, and intra-Muslim exchange networks, it is imperative to consider the ethical stakes of halal certification for marginalized and precarious Muslim populations worldwide—based on ethnographic insights on the meat market in Mumbai. Therefore, the question of sustainability and halalness must consider the ethical requirements of the new formation of halal to bridge between the ethics of trade and intra-Muslim exchange and global trade conditions.

Recommendations

There are deficiencies in this study. It is hoped that further research can carry out a further analysis because the results of our analysis can be developed into more comprehensive research through in-depth data collection techniques related to this topic.

References

- Afendi, A. (2020). The Effect of Halal Certification, Halal Awareness and Product Knowledge on Purchase Decisions for Halal Fashion Products. *Journal of Digital Marketing and Halal Industry*, 2(2), 145. <https://doi.org/10.21580/jdmhi.2020.2.2.6160>
- Ahmad, Z. (2013). Marginal Occupations and Modernising Cities: Muslim Butchers in Urban India. *Economic & Political Weekly*, XLVIII(32), 121-131.
- Ahmad, Z. (2014). Delhi's Meatscapes: Cultural Politics of Meat in a Globalizing City. *IIM Kozhikode Society & Management Review*, 3(1), 21-31.
- al-Munajjid, S. M. S. Ruling on meat slaughtered by the Shi'ah (Raafidis). Retrieved 18 April, 2018, from <https://islamqa.info/en/60046>.
- Amalia, F. (2019). The Role of Religiosity on Halal Product Purchasing Decision Case Study: Wardah Cosmetics. *Journal of Digital Marketing and Halal Industry*, 1(1), 19-24. <https://doi.org/10.21580/jdmhi.2019.1.1.4774>
- Anand, N. (2012). Municipal disconnect: On abject water and its urban infrastructures. *Ethnography*, 13(4), 487-509.
- Aniqoh, N. A. F. A. (2019). A Strategy Framwork For Deciding Between Alliances Or Acquisition Of Johnson & Johnson Pharmaceutical Company (Case Study: Strategy Farmwork of Johnson & Johnson And Cipla Inc in The Production of Anti-Infectious Drugs). *Journal of Digital Marketing and Halal Industry*, 1(1), 25-46. <https://doi.org/10.21580/jdmhi.2019.1.1.4774>

- 1.1.4730
- Appadurai, A. (2000). Spectral Housing and Urban Cleansing: Notes on Millennial Mumbai. *Public Culture*, 12(3), 627-651.
- Armanios, F., & Ergene, B. E. (2018). *Halal Food: A History*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Bergeaud-Blackler, F. (2017). *Le Marché halal ou l'invention d'une tradition*. Paris: Le Seuil.
- Bonne, K., & Verbeke, W. (2008). Religious values informing halal meat production and the control and delivery of halal credence quality. *Agriculture and Human Values*, 25, 35-47.
- Fauzi, M., Azizah, A. N., & Nurfauziyah, L. (2020). The Concept of Ifta 'in Establishing Halal Law (Study of Usul fiqh on Legal Determination Methods). *Journal of Digital Marketing and Halal Industry*, 1(1), 83. <https://doi.org/10.21580/jdmhi.2019.1.1.4776>
- Fischer, J. (2011). *The Halal Frontier: Muslim Consumers in a Globalized Market*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Fischer, J. (2016). *Islam, Standards, and Technoscience: In Global Halal Zones*. New York and London: Routledge.
- Bergeaud-Blackler, F., Fischer, J., & Lever, J. (Eds.). (2016). *Halal Matters: Islam, politics and markets in global perspective*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Fataron, Z. A., & Rohmah, H. (2019). Effect Analysis of Trust, Ease, Information Quality, Halal Product on Online Purchase Decision of 2016-2018 Batch Students of Islamic Economics Study Program in UIN Walisongo at Shopee Marketplace. *Journal of Digital Marketing and Halal Industry*, 1(1), 1-18. <https://doi.org/10.21580/jdmhi.2019.1.1.4772>
- Foucault, M. (2007). *Security, Territory, Population: Lectures at the Collège De France*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Freidberg, S. (2013). Calculating sustainability in supply chain capitalism. *Economy and Society*, 42(4), 571-596.
- Ghassem-Fachandi, P. (2012). *Pogrom in Gujarat: Hindu Nationalism and Anti-Muslim Violence in India*. Princeton, Oxford: Princeton University Press.
- Gunel, G. Spaceship in the Desert: Energy, Climate Change, and Urban Design in Abu Dhabi.
- Hirsch, E. (2020). Sustainable Development. Retrieved 14 September, 2021, from <https://doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190854584.013.155>.
- Lever, J. (2018). *Consuming halal in the age of globalised mass production: compound practice - knowing what to eat?* Proceedings from Rethinking Halal: Genealogy, Current Trends, and New Interpretation, Louvain-la-Neuve.
- Mahmood, S. (2011). *Politics of Piety: The Islamic Revival and the Feminist Subject*. Princeton University Press.
- Moosa, E. (2021). Considering Being and Knowing in an Age of Techno-Science. In I. A. Padela (Ed.), *Medicine and Shariah: A Dialogue in Islamic Bioethics* (pp. 87-119).
- Mubarak, F. K., & Imam, M. K. (2020). Halal

- Industry in Indonesia ; Challenges and Opportunities. *Journal of Digital Marketing and Halal Industry*, 2(1), 55-64.
- Nadhifah, H. H., & Adinugraha, H. H. (2020). Analysis of Factors influencing the Purchasing Decision of Facial Foam labeled Halal. *Journal of Digital Marketing and Halal Industry*, 2(1), 65-80.
- OED. (2021). sustainability. Retrieved 14 October, 2021, from <https://www.oed.com/view/Entry/299890>
- Pachirat, T. (2011). *Every Twelve Seconds: Industrialized Slaughter and the Politics of Sight*. New Haven and London: Yale University Press.
- Padela, A. I., Furber, S. W., Kholwadia, M. A., & Moosa, E. (2014). Dire Necessity and Transformation: Entry-Points for Modern Science in Islamic Bioethical Assessment of Porcine Products in Vaccines. *Bioethics*, 28(2), 59-66.
- Peristiwo, H. (2021). Impact of the Covid-19 Pandemic on Indonesia Halal Tourism Transportation. *Journal of Digital Marketing and Halal Industry*, 3(1), 19-36. <https://doi.org/10.21580/jdmhi.2021.3.1.7814>
- Powers, P. R. (2004). Interiors, Intentions, and the "Spirituality" of Islamic Ritual Practice. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 72(2), 425-459.
- SANHA. (2008). Brush With Haraam: Dont Sweep It Under the Carpet. *Halaal Gazette*, 10, 4.
- Singer, P. (2009). *Animal Liberation: The Definitive Classic of the Animal Movement* (4). New York: HarperCollins Publishers.
- Tayob, A. (1999). *Islam in South Africa: Mosques, Imams, and Sermons*. Gainesville: University Press of Florida.
- Tayob, S. (2016). O you who believe, eat of the ṭayyibāt (pure and wholesome food) which we have provided you' - The Role of Risk and Expertise in Producing Certified Halal Consumption in South Africa. *Journal of Religion in Africa*, 46(1), 67-91.
- Tayob, S. (2019a). Disgust as Embodied Critique: Being Middle Class and Muslim in Mumbai. *South Asia: Journal of South Asian Studies*, 42(6), 1192-1209.
- Tayob, S. (2019b). Molecular Halal: Producing, Debating and Evading Halal Certification in South Africa. In K. Dmitriev, J. Hauser, & B. Orfali (Eds.), *Insatiable Appetite: Food as Cultural Signifier in the Middle East and Beyond* (pp. 100-118). Leiden and Boston: Brill.
- Tayob, S. (2020a). The material semiotics of halal: neoliberal Islam in practice. *Anthropological Theory Commons* Retrieved 1 July, 2020, from <http://www.at-commons.com/2020/04/12/the-material-semiotics-of-halal-neoliberal-islam-in-practice/>.
- Tayob, S. (2020b). Trading Halal: Halal Certification and Intra-Muslim Trade in South Africa. *Sociology of Islam*, XX, 1-21.
- Tsing, A. (2009). Supply Chains and the Human Condition. *Rethinking Marxism: A Journal of Economics, Culture & Society*, 21(2), 148-176.

Yasin, D. (2017). Tayyib: The Foundation of Ethical Eating & Conscious Consumption. Retrieved 10 July, 2019, from <https://medium.com/@zaytunacollege/tayyib-the-foundation-of-ethical-eating-conscious-consumption-b397f728617f>.

