

Tarling Hybridity in the Digitalization Arena: Digital Sociology Study of Modern Music Production

Khaerudin Imawan^{1*}

¹Department of Communication Science, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Swadaya Gunung Jati, Cirebon – Indonesia

Abstract

Tarling music is referred to as a hybrid cultural product, in addition to being based on historical aspects as an art form that has been acculturated, its development cannot be separated from the influence of technology and communication. The shift in the production, distribution, and consumption practices of *Tarling* music from classical to modern proves the relationship between analog production methods and digital output. This qualitative research uses a constructivist paradigm to answer the question of how *Tarling* music as a hybrid cultural product is viewed in the context of global concerns about the interaction of social agents in the digitalization arena. The analysis was conducted based on Deborah Lupton's digital sociology study, supported by Pierre Bourdieu's analysis of the cultural production arena. As a result, through the role of producer agents, managers, and singers, *Tarling* music revolutionizes itself from analog to digital with the presence of digital music files. The performance of interaction agents with the cyber ecosystem in the digitalization arena to produce, distribute, and consume music through digital platforms.

Musik *Tarling* disebut sebagai produk budaya hybrid, selain berdasarkan pada aspek historis sebagai sebuah bentuk kesenian hasil akulturasi, juga dalam perkembangannya tidak dapat dilepaskan dari pengaruh teknologi dan komunikasi. Pergeseran praktik produksi, distribusi dan konsumsi musik *Tarling* dari klasik menjadi modern, membuktikan adanya relasi antara cara-cara produksi analog ke dalam produksi digital. Penelitian kualitatif ini menggunakan paradigma konstruktivis, untuk menjawab pertanyaan bagaimana musik *Tarling* sebagai produk budaya hybrid dipandang dalam konteks global menyangkut interaksi sosial agen di dalam arena digitalisasi. Analisis dilakukan berdasarkan kajian sosiologi digital Deborah Lupton, didukung dengan analisis teori arena produksi kultural Pierre Bourdieu. Hasilnya, melalui peran agen produser, manajer dan penyanyi, musik *Tarling* merevolusi diri dari cara analog ke digital dengan hadirnya file musik digital. Kinerja agen tunduk berhadapan dengan ekosistem cyber di dalam arena digitalisasi untuk melakukan produksi, distribusi dan konsumsi musik melalui platform digital.

Keywords: digitalization; digital sociology; hybridity; *Tarling*

***Corresponding Author:** Khaerudin Imawan (khaerudin.imawan@ugj.ac.id), Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Swadaya Gunung Jati, Jl. Pemuda Raya No.32, Sunyaragi, Kesambi, Cirebon, Jawa Barat 45132, Indonesia.

Introduction

Tarling is closely tied to the cultural development of the coastal communities in West Java, particularly Indramayu and Cirebon. Cimanuk port, which divides the coastline with residential areas, served as a geographical center for cultural acculturation between the local population and foreign visitors. During that time, traders who stopped at Cimanuk port included merchants from China, Arabia, India, and Europe (Portuguese and Dutch). They often stayed for uncertain periods, depending on weather conditions and favorable winds for their voyages. To pass the time, these traders played various musical instruments. For instance, Portuguese traders played *Keroncong* music using guitars, jittery guitars, and harmonica (Munandar, Kasim, and Nugroho 2016). Dutch arrivals also brought *tonel*, an art form performed to entertain Dutch soldiers. Their presence at Cimanuk port indirectly left traces of their art.

Cross-border trade through port routes as entry points facilitated cultural acculturation between the coastal communities of Indramayu-Cirebon and visiting traders. The influence of this interaction extended beyond language in *Tarling* lyrics; it also affected the musical instruments used in *Tarling* and how they evolved into other music genres due to changing digital communication technologies. From the aforementioned background, *Tarling* music production is a fascinating subject from a digital sociology perspective. This research aims to explore how *Tarling* music, sociologically, relates to various communication aspects within the contexts of individual, group, societal, cultural, and global environments influenced by communication media technologies in the digitalization arena (Imawan and Sari 2019). As the research object is music as a hybrid cultural

product, where hybridity confronts pure identity, the study cannot be detached from the ecosystem of *Tarling* music and the interactions among agents involved in the digitalization arena. Various changes in social interactions among agents in the digitalization arena, including advertising in the production, distribution, and consumption practices of *Tarling* music, will be examined.

This study refers to previous research on *Tarling* music conducted by Chaerul Salam and Siti Chamamah Suratno. The results of this study with the ethnoscience or phenomenological paradigm reveal that the image of women in *Tarling* song texts is a subordinate patriarchy that is defeated by the dominance of men around them. Women fight for equality and even against patriarchal domination. Through its lyrics, *Tarling* depicts a woman beaten by patriarchal domination, but her heart is patient in fighting in various ways.

Sandra Bader (2011) explores how female dangdut *Tarling* performers negotiate the practice of "*nyawer*" through their creative actions on stage. *Nyawer* involves direct money transactions between the audience and the singer. This case study highlights the diverse nature of the subjectivity of the performers in negotiating the process, where the dynamics between the singer and the audience are volatile and consent is in constant change. The creative improvisation of the singers illustrated above reveals the active contribution of '*dangdut*' and '*Tarling dangdut*' singers on stage (Bader 2011).

Qualitative research conducted by Siti Rohmah Soekarba and Embun Kenyowati E., concludes that the culture of the Indramayu community represented through the lyrics of *Tarling Indramayuan* songs is a representation as well as the construction of local cultural politics that perpetuates tragedy, as an aesthetic

pleasure, as well as a reflection of the lower class political economy, poverty, backwardness, modernization on the surface, consumerism and oppression (Soekarba and Kenyowati E. 2011).

Supriatin mentioned two interesting things in *Tarling*. First, it is seen as a hybrid cultural product; second, compared to other Javanese-Cirebon oral literature types. Through the representation of *Tarling*, which is liminality literature, the results of this researcher describe how the characteristics or nature of the philosophical liminality society are represented through *Tarling* music lyrics (Supriatin 2016).

Furthermore, research uses the historical materialism paradigm is Harry Tjahyodiningrat's research, shows that the development of Cirebon *Tarling* Art, as an art developed in the Pantura area, has undergone many changes caused by textual transformation and contextual aspects. The old group is referred to as classic/traditional *Tarling*, while the young group tends to choose to open themselves up to modernity by using the term 'Cirebonan and Panturaan' dangdut *Tarling* (Tjahyodiningrat, Kasmahidayat, and Haryana 2019)

The perspective of digital sociology refers to two terms: social interaction practices and digitalization, which focus on cyberspace practices. The emergence of cyberspace through social media platforms provides an alternative process of transforming public space into digital form, presenting new forms of mass media in delivering information to the public (Susanti and Hantoro 2022). The intersection between public space and cyberspace becomes a meeting point for many agents to communicate and interact without being constrained by physical space and time (Jati 2016). If "media sociology" is used to study social interactions involving media in general, "digital sociology" focuses explicitly on sociological practices within the

digitalization arena. This research, with *Tarling* music as a hybrid culture in the digitalization arena, covers social interaction practices of individuals within cyberspace, including the use of the internet, digital platforms, social media platforms, and digital cultural practices within society. Adopting Deborah Lupton's perspective, digital sociology is seen as a form of social interaction practice that leads to the cyber sociological space (Lupton 2012).

Based on the literature review above, it was found that the novelty of this study lies in the combination of the perspective of digital sociology with the concept of the theory of the practice of the cultural production arena. In a network society, the media is no longer seen as an institution controlled by society regarding social interactions. On the contrary, the cyberspace or digitalization arena controls and shapes society socio-culturally. Within digitalization, society as digital media users must comply with and adapt to digital devices, consciously altering their behaviors to fit in social and cultural interactions. This research refers to what Deborah Lupton (2012) said, digital sociology emphasizes four important aspects: digital professional practices, digital technology analysis, digital data analysis, and critical digital sociology. The concept of digital sociology is illustrated in Table 1.

Through the perspective of digital sociology, this study formulates the following research questions: 1) How can *Tarling* music, as a hybrid cultural product, be produced, distributed, and consumed in the digital arena? 2) How do *Tarling* music agents enhance their professional performance sociologically in the digital arena? and 3) How do digital platforms reach a wider audience for *Tarling* music consumption in the digital arena?

Table 1
Operational Concept of Digital Sociology (Lupton 2012)

Digital Sociology	Indicators	Operational Concepts
Digital Professional Practices	Using digital tools, building networks, creating online profiles, and publishing digital content.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Analog-to-digital transformation - Interactions within digital platforms - Publishing on social media platforms
<i>Sociological Analysis of Digital Media Usage</i>	Understanding how digital media technologies are used, configuring the roles of agents, examining social relationships among agents, exploring the role of digital media, and reproducing digital social institutions.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Transition from classical to modern - Connection between content producers and publishers - Content reproduction
<i>Digital Data Analysis</i>	Utilizing digital data in social interactions for social research.	Optimizing digital search engines (SEO).
<i>Critical Reflection on Digital Sociology</i>	Reflective and critical analysis of digital media technologies through social and cultural theories.	Applying cultural and media studies to Pierre Bourdieu's theory of cultural production arenas.

This study uses a qualitative method with a constructivist paradigm. The research data source comes from historical literature and several informants, namely musicians and *Tarling* music production agents. Data was collected through literature studies, in-depth interviews (Yin 2015), documentation studies, and observations of social media platform agents, consisting of three *Tarling* music groups: Nada Ayu, Dian Prima, and Nirwana Mandala. The data collected was then reduced and analyzed to find compatibility between research questions and alternative answers that form the basis of this research discussion (Hollweck 2015).

Analytic tools in this study use the theory of digital sociology (Lupton 2013), where the practice of individual social interaction and society leads to cyberspace sociology, supported by the theory of cultural production arena (Bourdieu 1993). This research focuses on the role of agents through their habitus in the

Tarling music ecosystem. Real social space and cyberspace strengthen the identity of *Tarling* music as a hybrid culture in the global context of the social interaction of agents in the digitalization arena.

Hybridity in the Production, Distribution, and Consumption Processes of *Tarling*

Tarling is one of the popular music genres in the coastal areas of West Java, particularly in Indramayu and Cirebon (Masduki et al. 2018). The name "*Tarling*" is associated with the guitar and flute (*seruling*) instruments, as well as the phrase "*Yen wis mlatar gage eling*" (If you have many sins, repent immediately) (Abdillah and Koentjoro 2015). Supali Kasim noted that the origins of *Tarling* began to emerge around 1930 in Kepandean Village, Indramayu District. At that time, a Dutch commissioner asked for assistance from a resident named Sakim to repair his guitar (Kasim 2012).

Sugra, the son of Sakim, then studied the tones produced by the guitar and was able to synchronize the pentatonic tones of the gamelan with the guitar strings. Sugra conducted experiments by transferring the gamelan's pentatonic tones to the diatonic strings of the guitar (Lasmiyati 2020). The guitar and bamboo flute melodies that presented *Dermayonan* and *Cerbonan* music began to spread around the 1930s. People from various villages in Indramayu and Cirebon embraced *Tarling* as a way of life (Setiawan, 2018)¹.

In the 1940s, *Tarling* developed and became popular among young people. It was during this time that classic *Tarling* emerged. The second phase of *Tarling*'s development was marked by modified tempo songs. If classic *Tarling* had a slightly slower rhythm, then *Tarling* was made more upbeat with shorter durations. The third phase saw *Tarling* evolving with songs influenced by dangdut music. There were remixes, pop-style songs, and even rock influences. Since the 1980s, the musical instruments used have expanded beyond guitars and flutes to include modern instruments such as saxophones, drums, and others.

Tarling often involves the audience in spontaneous dramatic performances, similar to the *Lenong* art in Jakarta or *Ludruk* in East Java. It is a combination of dramaturgy that captivates

the audience. In Indramayu, the *Tarling* figures can be divided into pioneering and development figures. Sugra is considered a pioneering figure in *Tarling*, while Jayana is known for her contributions to developing this art form. Jayana, born in Karangampel, Indramayu, is skilled in guitar playing (Kasim 2012).

In the book "*Abdul Adjib dan Tarling Putra Sangkala*," Undang Sunaryo noted that *Tarling* continued to develop by the dynamics of society and the market. From traditional to pop music, *Tarling* entered the contemporary entertainment industry (Sunaryo 2009). *Tarling* grew and evolved without strict rules or standard conventions as a form of folk art. The generation of Jayana and Raden Sulam in the 1950s brought *Tarling* as a meaningful performance. The presentation of humorous dramas, family dramas, classic songs, and pop songs added color to the community's aesthetics, as seen in Figure 1. According to Nurdin M Noer's notes titled *Cirebonan Music from Tradition to Pop*, *Tarling* songs are characterized by improvisation, simplicity, and spontaneity (Sunaryo 2009).

If in the Indramayu region, *Tarling* is referred to as "Melodi Kota Ayu" (The Melody of Ayu City), it is different in the Cirebon region, where *Tarling* was previously called "Melodi Kota Udang" (The Melody of Shrimp City). The name *Tarling* was officially recognized when Radio Republik Indonesia (RRI) frequently broadcasted this genre of music. On August 17, 1962, the Regional Government Body (currently the Regional Representative Council) officially recognized *Tarling* as the official name of this music genre. *Tarling* became a magnet that brought singers and audiences close together, freely interacting with one another. It is common to see the singer performing on stage while the audience joins in dancing and giving tips '*saweran*' (Kamaluddin 2017).

¹ The melodies of the guitar and bamboo flute that presented *Dermayonan* and *Cerbonan* music began to spread around the 1930s. People from various villages in Indramayu and Cirebon embraced it as a way of life. As the favored and popular trend, young people started playing and developing a fondness for this musical art. In 1935, *Tarling* music was accompanied by a soapbox used as a *kendang* (drum) and a clay pot (*kendi*) used as a gong. Then, in 1936, *Tarling* melodies were supplemented with other musical instruments such as a basin and a *ketipung*, serving as percussion instruments (Setiawan 2017).

Figure 1
Perform of *Tarling* Art



Note: (a) Jayana, a *Tarling* musician performing (source: Kasim (2012)),
(b) *Tarling* stage in Indramayu (Source: (Tosu 2015)).

The *Tarling* music industry has transformed in terms of production, distribution, and consumption. However, it doesn't mean that other aspects of the ecosystem, such as the social and environmental aspects from which *Tarling's* music originated, can be disregarded. The characteristics of the coastal communities in the northern region (Pantura) of Cirebon and Indramayu tend to showcase the uniqueness of their region. Their identities are reflected by incorporating cultural values into *Tarling* performances from both Cirebon and

Indramayu. Identity also reveals the ideology of the community regarding cultural values and how they enjoy performances through the form or structure of *Tarling* itself, which consists of structured and integral parts. For example, the lyrics of *Tarling* songs reflect the local themes of culinary delights, family life, and the love stories of men and women working overseas.

The *Tarling* music ecosystem depicts a network of interconnected values and its developmental environment, referred to as the "nurturance environment" (Paramasatya et al.

2020). This network connects *Tarling* music from its birth to the transformation process from classical to modern. The *Tarling* music ecosystem also includes old agents based on classical and modern periodization. The meeting point between classical and modern *Tarling* cannot be ignored since the relations between them are still intertwined. Agents from different generations are connected within the arena, although modern *Tarling* musicians appear to be dominant in the digital space. The *Tarling* music ecosystem explains the existence and role of these agents in the digitalization arena.

The transformation of *Tarling* music from the analog to the digital era is influenced by musicians such as songwriters, instrumentalists, and all those involved in music groups. It is not limited to the iconic figure of the *Tarling* music group's lead singer but also other agents involved, including producers, managers, and *Tarling* singers. Technological conditions and the hybrid utilization of digital spaces greatly influence the working methods of these agents. Digitalization becomes part of the music ecosystem, where music creation will never cease as long as the artistic ecosystem and habitus thrive. The ecosystem provides benefits for agents through interaction in terms of capital ownership, inspiring and supporting agents' well-being. Thus, an ideal infrastructure and property are required to maximize creativity within an arena (Coscieme 2015).

The dynamic process of *Tarling* music production influences the acculturation or assimilation of the local coastal community's culture with Western musical identities. Therefore, the identity of classical Indonesian music and hybridity becomes the meeting point in *Tarling* music production. Through the habitus of the agents and the music ecosystem that is built within the social space, the identity

of *Tarling* music is strengthened as a hybrid culture. Habitus guides agents to act and provides a foundation for forming practices (Susilo 2014).

Agent Performance in the Digitalization Arena

In the year 2000, the introduction of digital music in full songs in MP3 format and monophonic and polyphonic ringtones, especially as CDs and cassettes were widely pirated, marked the beginning of the transformation from analog to digital practices. Peer-to-peer technology and song duplication became easier to carry out. Then, in 2005, the era of Ring Back Tones (RBT) emerged. RBT and change the behavior of modern individuals in enjoying music, as it can be accessed according to their preferences, anytime and anywhere. Technological changes have resulted in both desired and undesired consequences. There are always parties who feel disadvantaged, but new models emerge from technological advancements (Creeber and Martin 2008).

The advent of digital platforms, particularly social media, has had an impact on the music industry. This can be seen from the aggressive activities carried out by music labels, indicating the great potential they harness from digital platforms. Video streaming services have become a popular choice for music fans as they can find the songs they want without the need to register or pay, whether from a laptop, mobile phone, or tablet. For record labels, the more frequently their music videos are viewed and the more advertisements are displayed within those videos, the higher the potential for generating revenue.

The classical *Tarling* music ecosystem, which has transformed into the digital era, relies on agents such as songwriters, instrumentalists, and all those involved in music groups. It doesn't only revolve around the iconic figure of the *Tarling* music lead singer or Sinden but also includes other agents within the group, such as producers, managers, and *Tarling* singers. Their working methods are greatly influenced by the technological conditions and utilization of digital spaces. The *Tarling* music ecosystem depicts a network consisting of interconnected values and its developmental environment (nurturance environment) (Paramasatya et al. 2020).

The performance of agents within the digitalization arena, which includes production, distribution, and consumption sub-arenas, is closely tied to the old ecosystem, necessitating adaptation to the new ecosystem where the performance transformation from analog to digital occurs (Alves 2004). The *Tarling* music ecosystem still accommodates old agents based on classical and modern periodization. The meeting point between classical and modern cannot be eliminated since their relations are still interconnected. They coexist within the arena, although modern *Tarling* musicians appear to be dominant in the digital space.

Looking at the phenomenon of the changing production, distribution, and consumption of *Tarling* music in digitalization, it is important to consider the social aspect of the artist's presence and their interaction with the environment. The music ecosystem helps identify and address specific issues, reflecting the visible changes from conventional (analog) ways to digital practices (Allen and Dawe 2015). To understand how the music ecosystem copes with the various transformations that have occurred throughout the historical timeline of

classical *Tarling* to "modern" *Tarling* in the face of digitalization. The transformations encompass various variant designations of *Tarling* music amidst technological changes as *Tarling* migrates from generation to generation.

Music Consumption *Tarling* via Digital Platforms

The production of *Tarling* music in the coastal communities of Indramayu-Cirebon is inseparable from efforts to preserve the purity of *Tarling* music (classical) itself and the hybridity that is a fundamental element. Audio-visual products are utilized through virtual space and social media platforms as a form of hybridity in cultural industry products. The process of digitalizing music in the production sub-arena as in Figure 2.

The pleasure obtained by the audience comes from the new product itself, which holds its value. The audience no longer thinks and takes pride in watching *Tarling* concert performances but rather focuses on the symbolism and brand of the concert itself, which is considered to have prestigious value and labels (Strinati 2004).

Through the network of live streaming, interactions are formed via digital platforms. Online agents and *Tarling* music audiences can directly interact by giving likes, comments, and sharing links. They can even easily greet *Tarling* singers by recording audio-visual messages that can be uploaded through the comment section or sent privately. The network of interactions among agents in the sub-arena of *Tarling* music consumption presents virtual concerts as a choice. Audiences are free to choose the form of creativity in music, which is further developed through virtual concerts (Mbhele and Ramnandan 2020).

Figure 2
Adaptation of digital devices in the production sub-arena



Source: Imawan, Ahimsa-Putra, and Simatupang (2023a)

The interactions between producers, managers, and *Tarling* singers with the audience cannot be done directly because virtual concerts are conducted at home or in mini studios (Imawan, Ahimsa-Putra, and Simatupang 2023b). *Tarling* music has to adapt by replacing the live audience with cameras and digital devices. Technological advancements accompany the adaptation of virtual concerts to determine the most appropriate form of interaction with each artist. They can interact online through live streaming by giving likes, comments, and sharing links. They can even easily greet *Tarling* singers by recording audio-visual messages that can be uploaded through the comment section or sent privately.

Tarling music audiences can adapt to new habits, such as enjoying *Tarling* music through live streaming and replacing the tradition of *nyawer* (audience members giving money to the performers) by sending their donations through the singer's or their favorite *Tarling* idol group's bank account. For example, the music group Diana Prima held a virtual concert with a relaxed appearance without excessive makeup. Their performance intentionally mirrored the costume conditions as if they were on stage,

even though it was done virtually in their mini studio. Table 2 shows data samples from three *Tarling* music groups obtained through the network of interactions on social media platforms.

Since digital devices are used, audience appreciation is also conveyed through social media platforms, which serve as a medium for live streaming. This includes the tradition of *nyawer*, which was typically performed on stage but has now been adopted (Bader 2011). *Nyawer* can now be done by transferring funds to the official bank account under the name of Diana Sastra or by scanning the displayed OVO barcode during the performance. Once the virtual concert concludes, the manager's role expands to assisting the digital marketing team in repackaging raw *Tarling* music materials into digital music files for distribution and promotion across various media platforms.

The utilization of social media platforms for distributing *Tarling* digital music files has become a new norm for agents within *Tarling* groups. The dynamics of performing in a mini studio setting differ greatly from live performances in front of an audience. The technical

aspects are managed by a small team comprising two cameramen, an editor, and a social media account handler who facilitates live streaming. Digital streaming platforms have rapidly transformed how people consume digital content and have become crucial for content producers to reach their audience in

various music industries (Bender, Gal-Or, and Geylani 2021). The audience finds enjoyment in the new products' unique value, shifting their focus from attending *Tarling* concerts to associating with the concert's symbol and brand, which carry a sense of prestige and recognition (Strinati 2004).

Table 2
Agent Interactions on Social Media Platforms

Music Group	Sosial Media Accounts	Interactions with Social Media Fans	Interactions through Community	Live Streaming Interactions	Volume
Nada Ayu Group	<i>Facebook:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Nunung Alvi_Official @nunungalviofficial <i>Instagram:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> nunungalvi.official <i>YouTube:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Nunung Alvi Official 	Allow for comments on social media platforms, actively engage with and remove any negative comments, and share new music releases.	Responding to group messages and posting event agendas.	Stream live performances from the studio or home.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Upload at least twice a day. Conduct daily live streaming sessions.
Dian Prima Group	<i>Facebook:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> diana_sastra Diana Sastra Official <i>Instagram:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> diana_sastra dianasastra_official <i>YouTube:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Diana Sastra Official Diana Sastra Vlog 	Encourage interaction through comments on social media, actively engage with and address negative comments, and promote the release of new songs.	Interact with group messages, share event schedules, consistently engage with fans by offering greetings, provide inspirational content, and promote digital business opportunities.	Stream live performances from the studio, personal accounts, community events, with guest stars, and on community stages.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tentative (every day). Conduct daily live streaming sessions.
Nirwana Mandala Group	<i>Facebook:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Susy Arzetty Susy Arzetty Real <i>Instagram:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> suka_wijayanew susyarzetty_real <i>YouTube:</i> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Susy Arzetty Official Responding to group messages and posting event agendas.	Allow comments to be active, engage with fans by welcoming them and responding to positive feedback. Additionally, share the latest song releases.	Engage with fans through greetings, provide updates on upcoming concerts, and share daily experiences with the public.	Stream live performances on personal accounts and at community events.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Every event. Conduct daily live streaming sessions.

Source: Primary Data

Tarling music audiences who choose to access through internet-based social media platforms are different from audiences at virtual concerts. They become audiences with the freedom to access *Tarling* music outside of live streaming. The audience category on social media platforms consists of those who intentionally make time to enjoy *Tarling* music according to their preferences without having to be online during live streaming schedules. They also become *Tarling* music audiences without time constraints, allowing them the freedom to enjoy *Tarling* music whenever they have free time. The audience has unrestricted access to the *Tarling* music they choose, with songs they like.

The more clicks or views obtained from a website and social media, the higher the chances of selling the music they produce. Musicians can also post teasers of their albums that will pique the curiosity of netizens. It will also increase the selling power of their works and enhance the popularity of *Tarling* musicians. Official websites of artists or musicians still have more control than other social media platforms. Pageviews on the social media platform Facebook rank second in driving song sales, followed by Instagram and YouTube, which also boosts song sales (Imawan and Sari 2019).

Tarling singer Diana Sastra admits to still receiving high appreciation and enthusiasm from her fans. From the live-streaming concert on social media platforms in her mini studio, she raised around Rp. 2.15 million. During the concert streamed on the YouTube channel "Diana Sastra Official," her fans requested her to sing some of her signature songs. Approximately 2,000 viewers witnessed Diana Sastra's performance for 1 hour and 50 minutes. The viewers came not only from Cirebon but also from other areas such as Kuningan, Tegal, Brebes, Tangerang, and Bekasi, as well as from abroad, including Hong Kong and Taiwan.

When examining the phenomenon of changes in the production, distribution, and consumption of *Tarling* music, it is essential to consider the social aspects that come into play in the interaction between artists and their environment (see Table 3). It is not only the singers or *Sinden* who serve as icons of *Tarling* music groups but also other agents involved, such as producers, managers, and *Tarling* singers. The working methods of these agents are greatly influenced by the technological conditions of the devices and the utilization of digital space. Ethnographically, the *Tarling* ecosystem can be seen as a network consisting of chains of values and a nurturing environment for its development (Paramasatya et al. 2020). These chains connect *Tarling* music from its inception and throughout the transformation process from classical to modern forms.

In its periodization, the production of *Tarling* music is not separate from the habitus or norms that serve as the foundation for how agents carry out the steps of production, distribution, and consumption. The practices involved in *Tarling* music production do not follow a static pattern but instead involve processes and dynamics that vary across different contexts. With the advancement of technology and information, coupled with the emergence of new media, the production process also influences the habitus of agents within the social space.

The production of *Tarling* music before the digital era (digitalization) was carried out by major labels through collaborations with a producer. Among the processes they undertook were music arrangement, audio editing, and creating music video clips for each *Tarling* song produced. It was not limited to that; these technical agents were also the creators responsible for converting the music's raw materials into cassette tapes, CDs, and DVDs.

Table 3
Adaptation from Classical to Modern

Steps	Classical	Modern
Production	Music recording on major labels	Planning the creation of songs and instrumentals
	Hiring video shooting services	Creating audio and video raw materials
	Packaging music in cassette, CD/DVD formats	Packaging music as digital files
Distribution	Sales distribution through stores	Distribution on stage
	Music sales distribution on stage	Distribution through Publishing service
	Sales distribution at live radio events	Distribution through New Media Platforms
Consumption	Stage audience as consumers	Concert audience as consumers
	Radio listeners as consumers	Social media platform audience as consumers

Source: Primary Data

In addition to the services provided by major labels, the production of *Tarling* music also involved the assistance of video makers. They produced video clips to be compiled with the musical instruments. The resulting video clips could be used as marketing tools to enhance the business image of *Tarling* Music Groups. The video maker team facilitated the producer's production of video clips for *Tarling* songs.

The rapid development of technology required video makers to adapt their work to the use of tools or props that followed the trends. The skills and expertise of the video maker team were utilized not only during the production of video clips for single songs or albums but also often worked as documentation teams for *Tarling* group activities and the singers' non-performance events. While the video maker team's skills were generally self-taught, they had experience producing documentary videos. Meanwhile, the consumption of *Tarling* music currently tends to

leverage media platforms through smartphones and gadgets.

Listeners of *Tarling* music via radio also experienced trends during the 1980s-1990s, long before the advent of social media and digital music applications. To enjoy music entertainment daily, the radio became the main effective medium in music activities, including *Tarling* music. Radio presenters could fulfill song requests from loyal listeners during broadcasts. Almost all radio stations in Cirebon, targeting lower to middle-class listeners aged 25-45, broadcast *Tarling* music. Radio programs provided relaxation by playing *Tarling* music, which listeners eagerly awaited. Not only music listeners or fans, but musicians also benefited from the rapid information provided by the radio, as it directly introduced their works to listeners.

Tarling music agents subsequently transformed their artistic habitus through independent productions (indie). The

digitalization of *Tarling* music posed challenges for them, requiring the preparation of their production equipment to produce songs and process them into digital music files. Gradually, they also adapted to distributing and presenting their digitally produced music to fans, resulting in both financial and popularity benefits. They can now virtually attend concerts of *Tarling* groups and singers through social media platforms such as YouTube, Instagram, and Facebook. Moreover, to satisfy their longing for their favorite singers, clients and devoted fans no longer need to meet them in person after concerts.

The connection between content producer agents and publishing services is crucial in the digitalization of *Tarling* music. The production of digital music files has introduced a new habitus where distribution is closely related to how *Tarling* music consumers listen to and obtain digital music materials. Digital music files can be listened to and obtained through portable devices and computers. Digital files are highly flexible as they can be easily transferred between devices without consuming physical storage space. Digital downloads have impacted the overall music industry, including independent singles (non-albums) with long durations. The reason is that digital downloads are sold through individual channels.

MP3 is a highly popular audio format, and the discovery of digital files has contributed significantly to the development of digital music available online. Although various advanced digital music formats exist today, MP3 has not been completely overshadowed. This is because MP3 files can be played directly on personal computers (PCs) or portable digital music players like Apple's iPod or converted to CDs. Publishing companies distribute *Tarling* music through paid music applications such as Spotify

and Joox, targeting fans outside the country (Sebayang and Surbakti 2018). Indonesian migrant workers (TKI), in particular, are willing to listen to music by downloading it from paid applications.

The development of MP3 technology has had a significant impact on *Tarling* music production, especially in the early 2000s. Although there are now many advanced formats for enjoying music, MP3 is still widely accessed by *Tarling* music fans. Digital music distribution essentially involves the process of placing or mobilizing music albums in stores. Many record labels enter contracts with distribution companies to distribute and sell all their label's products. Distributors profit from each unit of the album sold, and their earnings depend on how well the album sells in music stores. This is the conventional way of music distribution. Technological advancements enable faster music distribution.

The internet provides an amazing platform for marketing, selling, and distributing various products, including music and music albums. In addition to platforms like Myspace and Reverbnation for distributing streaming-based music releases, there are other platforms such as Spotify, iTunes, Deezer, Joox, YouTube Music, and Soundcloud. YouTube is available as a video-sharing platform. Furthermore, web profile platforms such as Instagram, Twitter, Facebook, Bandcamp, and others are also available. The availability of various marketing media demands that musicians to be more discerning and wiser in their usage. Musicians can choose platforms according to their promotional needs and the type of work they want to distribute. Through streaming platforms, musicians can effectively distribute their work through audio media. As for video-sharing platforms, musicians can distribute their carefully packaged works in the form of

videos, including music videos and live performances.

Digital music sales platforms make it easier for *Tarling* music fans to choose the songs they need. Internet users who are fans of *Tarling* music can select their favorite songs without high costs. For example, Spotify is considered cheaper than purchasing CDs/DVDs. With an internet package worth Rp.50,000, hundreds or even thousands of songs can be listened to through Spotify. In the 2010s, the distribution of *Tarling* music in the form of digital music files depended on how internet-based information technology devices were utilized. The emergence of internet-based work and the ability to distribute and consume music through new methods have made the distribution of digital file formats more widespread. The *Tarling* music industry, unknowingly, has influenced the growth of distributing digital music files in the form of MP3.

Content reproduction involves all activities related to reprocessing the results into new products that are adaptive and responsive to digital platforms. It encompasses manpower training, recording and compiling audio and visual raw materials within the allocated budget, and considering copyright plans. The production process involves diverse individuals, including producers, songwriters, arrangers, sound engineers, and audio-visual teams. In the current era of various new media practices, the *Tarling* music industry positions itself as an independent music industry "Indie Label". The production process and reporting focus on how the results can be utilized as marketable products within the digital space based on the internet. Therefore, the distribution system employed by most *Tarling* music groups involves different techniques across pre-production, production, and post-production stages.

The production and reproduction of *Tarling* music no longer rely on traditional analog devices used during the era of vinyl records and compact discs (CDs), which required significant capital investment due to the production of physical materials, often involving thousands or even hundreds of thousands of units. Currently, *Tarling* music production can be independently carried out through mini studios managed by a small team or even within a musician's own home. Digitalization processes also allow *Tarling* music groups to manage their production plans, aligning them with their budgetary capabilities when producing music videos.

The availability of music recordings in digital file formats has compelled a shift in *Tarling* music production that must be faced, whether willingly or not. According to Zacky Qomarudin, a producer who works with the *Tarling* music group Nada Ayu, the development of *Tarling* music is closely tied to the team's ability to package compilation songs in audio-visual formats. For him, *Tarling* has become modern music. During the recording production of *Tarling* music in Jakarta, artists from Indramayu and Cirebon secretly attempted to learn how recording producers worked.

Although all music groups and artists can perform their works live on stage, the results may not be as good as those produced in a studio. Studio recordings, comparable to a "dish," represent a meticulously planned production process. The "cooking" process conducted by producers and their teams goes through various stages of production, such as music audio production, video recording, editing, overdubbing, mixing, and mastering. This "cooking" process takes place in a recording kitchen carefully curated with diverse menus and recipes to ensure the production of

recordings that are truly perfect, visually appealing, well-arranged, and worthy of being listened to, watched, and enjoyed (Holt 2010).

The production process of an album, which includes recording, mixing, and mastering, is sometimes not only done in the studio but also outdoors to achieve optimal results and build branding if the music is truly produced professionally. In an audio-visual production studio, content needs are met for live streaming on social media platforms such as Facebook, Instagram, and YouTube. The production of content for publication on social media is scheduled to maintain a consistent performance in the virtual space, to entertain and engage with fans through the official and personal accounts of the singer.

As the practice of digitizing music continues to evolve, audio-visual media production creators are developing new habits by engaging in mediation and remediation processes. *Tarling* music performances on stage can now be enjoyed by the audience present in front of the stage and by fans through live streaming. Fajar Andiyanto, the manager of the Dian Prima *Tarling* music group, utilizes their video production team during post-production, which is recognized as facilitating the determination of visual material for audio-visual products that will be marketed. The digital music files resulting from post-production are then adjusted to the appropriate file format for uploading to the official Diana Sastra YouTube channel and Diana Sastra Real's accounts on Facebook and Instagram. To enhance the performance of virtual concerts and live streaming on social media platforms, *Tarling* music agencies have implemented various methods to compete with their competitors. The agencies have improved their ability to maintain digital platforms through self-learning

or digital marketing training. One of the practices adopted by the agencies is to apply techniques for increasing viewers, subscribers, and followers on both official and personal accounts. They also aim to increase page views through analytics and Search Engine Optimization (SEO) on their websites. SEO optimization is performed to ensure that the content produced and published on social media platforms ranks highly in Google search results (Bhandari and Bansal 2019).

The practice of SEO optimization is based on the principle that "content is king." It is important for agencies in transforming and marketing their content through digital marketing strategies. The goal of SEO optimization is to increase the popularity of the produced music content, making it a trending topic and easily accessible in the online world. In practical terms, *Tarling* music agencies, producers, managers, and singers implement SEO practices starting from the pre-production stage, analyzing content creation objectives, building brand awareness, introducing products, providing service information, offering additional knowledge, or launching new products. Agencies also conduct audience research to determine target markets and segmentation. The research findings help agencies determine suitable marketing strategies aligned with their goals.

Tarling managers acknowledge that the digital landscape of music digitization offers opportunities for cost-effective promotion through SEO techniques. As a result, *Tarling* music agencies find it effective to promote their music through social media platforms to gain a larger fan base, including Indonesian overseas workers (Tenaga Kerja Indonesia or TKI). These fans often become devoted supporters who frequently book performances when they

return to their hometowns for family events such as weddings, circumcisions, and other celebratory occasions. SEO also contributes to increasing the enthusiasm of *Tarling* music fans among TKI communities abroad, such as Hong Kong, Taiwan, Korea, and Abu Dhabi, thus establishing a growing fan network. Fans play a significant role in the development of *Tarling* music in its places of origin. SEO has enabled *Tarling* music audiences to enjoy live concerts on YouTube to communicate with fellow TKI members and their families in their hometowns.

Based on the discussion above, critical reflection on research on *Tarling* as a hybrid cultural product in the digitalization arena through the perspective of digital sociology, Deborah Lupton and supported by the analysis of Pierre Bourdieu's cultural production arena theory, focuses on the practice of digitalizing *Tarling* music starting from the production, distribution, and consumption stages. These stages are classified according to the phase of using conventional (classical) technology and digital (modern) technology. In the realm of production, the transformation is in the form of music recordings, video shooting services, and music packaging. While in the realm of distribution, the transformation is carried out by selling digital music files, selling CDs/DVDs on stage, and distributing sales through social media accounts. In consumption, adaptation is carried out from watching *Tarling* music on stage to consuming *Tarling* music through digital platforms.

Empirically, understanding the practice of digitalizing *Tarling* music cannot be separated from the performance structure of production agents in social interactions of society (agents) in digitalization. The use of digital devices, the production of digital music content, and the building of networks in digital ecosystems and

platforms are performance relations that cannot be separated. What Lupton defines as digital sociology as a professional practice and analysis of the use of digital technology becomes relevant in this study.

Explicitly, there is a relationship between sociology and other disciplines such as anthropology, communication science, cultural studies, and cultural and media studies. Digital sociology bridges different perspectives in observing and analyzing the connection between the use of digital technology devices and society as agents who perform the production, distribution, and consumption of digital products' results in digital music files. Digital sociology has facilitated other theories focusing on social relations and digitally mediated cultural production.

The transformation of production, distribution, and consumption performance in *Tarling* music becomes a practical point that can contribute to Lupton's thinking on using hardware, software, and interconnected network interactions among agents facilitated by digital technology devices. The relevance of Lupton's perspective, which centers on digital social life, can also assist in unpacking the research object regarding *Tarling* as a hybrid cultural production through Pierre Bourdieu's theory of artistic production. Bourdieu's assumptions regarding cultural production, utilizing practices of habitus, field, and capital, reinforce the performance relations among agents in social interactions. Both Lupton and Bourdieu emphasize social interactions among agents within the field. In this case study, social interactions occur within the sub-fields of production, distribution, and consumption arenas. The *Tarling* music agents often unconsciously, construct their existing habitus structures while striving to adapt to their new habitus within the digitalization arena.

Using Pierre Bourdieu's theory, the research conducted by the author offers another explanation regarding the digitalization of *Tarling* music as a cultural production, as it is generated by agents within a social realm. These individuals have a habitus formed by their dispositions, starting from changes within a particular arena. Therefore, digitalization is seen as an arena where agents adapt their performance from analog to digital and from classical to modern. In terms of distribution, *Tarling* music cannot be separated from its business aspect, as music is marketed for profit. Through digitalization, performance can transform agents' traditional role into a modern digital-based performance.

However, the critique that arises from Lupton's perspective and Bourdieu's theory is the impact of digitalization on the *Tarling* music industry, where agents are predominantly subjected to and dependent on the continuously adaptive and responsive performance in digital platforms. As a result, the relationships among agents in their social practices become dominated. Media products or content outside the mainstream, particularly in music, have seen an increase in social media platforms. Digitalization practices in music production, distribution, and consumption tend to lack rigid guidelines and instead follow market forces that depend on digital platforms. Another critical reflection lies in the interconnected transformation of habitus and arenas, which are unconsciously formed and shape agents' practices, behaviors, and actions through their performance in digital social interactions.

Conclusion

Digital sociology, as a new perspective in the field of social humanities, bridges this research to address issues of social interaction, cultural

practices, and media communication in the realm of digitalization. As a hybrid cultural product, *Tarling* music can be produced, distributed, and consumed within the digitalization arena through professional practices using digital devices. *Tarling* music producers, managers, and singers can employ strategies within the digitalization arena through interactions with agents and the ecosystem of the digitalization community. Managers and singers transform and distribute digital *Tarling* music files through adaptation and mastery of professional performance to generate a network of interactions among agents. The perspective of digital sociology, as a complex domain, addresses new challenges in unraveling the involvement and roles of individual agents within the digitalization arena, ranging from social interactions to cultural production and communication media integrated into the digital realm. This research also addresses efforts to transform digital *Tarling* music files to build a fan base within the digitalization arena through digital marketing practices. Social media platforms such as Facebook, Instagram, and YouTube serve as realms that need to be mastered to enhance agent interactions with a broader audience. Digital sociology serves as a perspective for developing new theories in studying digital media and communication culture. In the case of *Tarling* music production, the perspectives of Deborah Lupton and Pierre Bourdieu's theory of the cultural production arena provide relevance to digitalizing *Tarling* music and offer criticism. They suggest that non-independent agents tend to "escape from reality" by directly interacting with other agents within the digital ecosystem and are dominated by a dependence on digital performance.[]

References

- Abdillah, Rijal, and Koentjoro Koentjoro. 2015. "Nilai dan Pesan Moral Tarling menurut Perspektif Pelaku Kesenian Tarling Cirebon: Studi Psikologi Budaya." *Psikologika: Jurnal Pemikiran dan Penelitian Psikologi* 20(1):79–89.
- Allen, Aaron S., and Kevin Dawe, eds. 2015. *Current Directions in Ecomusicology*. New York: Routledge.
- Alves, K. 2004. "Digital Distribution Music Services and the Demise of the Traditional Music Industry: Three Case Studies on Mp3.Com, Napster and Kazaa [Honour Thesis]." University of Wollongong.
- Bader, Sandra. 2011. "Dancing Bodies on Stage." *Indonesia and the Malay World* 39(115):333–55. doi:10.1080/13639811.2011.614085.
- Bender, Mark, Esther Gal-Or, and Tansev Geylani. 2021. "Attracting Artists to Music Streaming Platforms." *European Journal of Operational Research* 290(3):1083–97. doi:10.1016/j.ejor.2020.08.049.
- Bhandari, Ravneet Singh, and Sanjeev Bansal. 2019. "An Analysis Between Search Engine Optimization Versus Social Media Marketing Affecting Individual Marketer's Decision-Making Behavior." *Jindal Journal of Business Research* 8(1):78–91. doi:10.1177/2278682119829607.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. 1993. *The Field of Cultural Production*. edited by L. D. Kritzman. Columbia: Columbia University Press.
- Coscieme, Luca. 2015. "Cultural Ecosystem Services: The Inspirational Value of Ecosystems in Popular Music." *Ecosystem Services* 16:121–24. doi:10.1016/j.ecoser.2015.10.024.
- Creeber, Glen, and Royston Martin. 2008. *Digital Culture: Understanding New Media*. 1st ed. London: McGraw-Hill Education.
- Hollweck, Trista. 2015. "Robert K. Yin. (2014). Case Study Research Design and Methods (5th Ed.)." *Canadian Journal of Program Evaluation* 30(1):108–10. doi:10.3138/cjpe.30.1.108.
- Holt, Fabian. 2010. "The Economy of Live Music in the Digital Age." *European Journal of Cultural Studies* 13(2):243–61. doi:10.1177/1367549409352277.
- Imawan, Khaerudin, Heddy Shri Ahimsa-Putra, and G. R. Lono Lastoro Simatupang. 2023a. "Tarling Music Industry Ecosystem in The Digitalization Arena." *Sociología y Tecnociencia* 13(2):24–48. doi:10.24197/st.2.2023.24-48.
- Imawan, Khaerudin, Heddy Shri Ahimsa-Putra, and G. R. Lono Lastoro Simatupang. 2023b. "Tarling Music Virtual Concert Remediation Strategies in the COVID-19 Pandemic Era." *Kata: A Biannual Publication on the Study of Language and Literature* 25:74–80. doi:10.9744/kata.25.00.74-80.
- Imawan, Khaerudin, and Tribuana Sari. 2019. "Tarling Music Digitalization and Transformation in Network Society Era." *KnE Social Sciences*. doi:10.18502/kss.v3i20.4946.
- Jati, Wasisto Raharjo. 2016. "Cyberspace, Internet, dan Ruang Publik Baru: Aktivisme Online Politik Kelas Menengah Indonesia." *Jurnal Pemikiran Sosiologi* 3(1):25–35. doi:10.22146/jps.v3i1.23524.
- Kamaluddin, Muhammad. 2017. "Strategi Pelibatan dalam Konser Tarling Cerbonan." Pp. 551–56 in *The 5th URECOL Proceeding*. UAD Yogyakarta.

- Kasim, Supali. 2012. *Budaya Dermayu: Nilai-Nilai Historis, Estetis, dan Transendental*. edited by S Kasim. Indramayu: Gapura Publishing.
- Lasmiyati, Lasmiyati. 2020. "Sugra: Tokoh Perintis dan Dinamika Tarling Indramayu (1930-1997)." *Patanjala: Journal of Historical and Cultural Research* 12(2):261. doi:10.30959/patanjala.v12i2.633.
- Lupton, Deborah. 2012. "Digital Sociology: An Introduction." *SSRN Electronic Journal*. doi:10.2139/ssrn.2273418.
- Lupton, Deborah. 2013. *Introducing Digital Sociology*. Sydney: University of Sydney.
- Masduki, Aam, Tjetjep Rosmana, Suwardi Alamsyah P., Lasmiyati Lasmiyati, Wildan Nirmala, and Yeti Tresnawati. 2018. *Potensi Budaya di Kabupaten Indramayu: Laporan Penyusunan Dokumentasi Pelestarian Nilai Budaya Jawa Barat*. Bandung: BPNB Jawa Barat.
- Mbhele, Thokozani Patmond, and Praveena Ramnandan. 2020. "The Digital Ecosystem and Entrepreneurial Music Distribution: A Force Field Perspective." *Acta Tecnología* 6(4):89–103. doi:10.22306/atec.v6i4.87.
- Munandar, Agus Aris, Supali Kasim, and Agung Nugroho. 2016. *Cimanuk: Perspektif Arkeologi, Sejarah, dan Budaya*. Indramayu: LovRinz Publishing - Festival Cimanuk.
- Paramasatya, Harits, Ratri Ninditya, Andana Kusuma, and Zulkhair Burhan. 2020. *Potret Ekosistem Musik di Indonesia: Studi Kasus dengan Pendekatan Ekologi Budaya di Kota Bogor dan Makassar*. edited by N. Dalidjo. Jakarta: Koalisi Seni.
- Sebayang, Vanesia Amelia, and Asmyta Surbakti. 2018. "Streaming Music and Millennials on Popular Culture Perspective." Pp. 35–42 in *Proceedings of the 1st International Seminar on Foreign Language Teaching, Linguistics, and Literature (ISFLATEL-1) 2018 - Unimed*.
- Setiawan, Irvan. 2017. *Tarling: Formulir Warisan Budaya Takbenda*. Bandung: BPNB Jabar.
- Soekarba, Siti Rohmah, and Embun Kenyowati E. 2011. "Tragedi Cinta dan Rumah Tangga dalam Lirik Lagu Tarling Indramayuan: Studi Kasus terhadap Lirik Lagu Tarling Indramayuan." Pp. 373–422 in *Prosiding ICSSIS 2011*.
- Strinati, Dominic. 2004. *An Introduction to Theories of Popular Culture*. 2nd ed. London & New York: Routledge.
- Sunaryo, Undang. 2009. *Abdul Adjib dan Tarling Putra Sangkala*. Indramayu: Dinas Pemuda Olahraga Kebudayaan dan Pariwisata Kabupaten Indramayu.
- Supriatin, Yeni Mulyani. 2016. "Teks Tarling: Representasi Sastra Liminalitas (Analisis Fungsi dan Nilai-Nilai)." *Metasastra: Jurnal Penelitian Sastra* 5(1):92–101. doi:10.26610/metasastra.2012.v5i1.92-101.
- Susanti, Dwi, and Prihatin Dwi Hantoro. 2022. "Indonesian Netizens' Digital Self and Identity Creation on Social Media." *Komunikator* 14(2):104–13. doi:10.18196/jkm.16541.
- Susilo, Y. Edhi. 2014. "Orkes Simfoni dalam Perspektif Habitus Bourdieu." *Jurnal Kawistara* 4(1):87–103. doi:10.22146/kawistara.5235.
- Tjahyodiningrat, Harry, Yuliawan Kasmahidayat, and Warli Haryana. 2019. "The Cultural Transformation of Seni Tarling in Cirebon." P. 35 in *Proceedings of the International Conference on Arts and Design Education (ICADE 2018)*. Vol. 255. Paris, France: Atlantis Press.

Tosu, Mas. 2015. "Asal Usul Kesenian Tarling (Bagian 2)." <https://www.tosupedia.com/2015/02/asal-usul-kesenian-tarling-bagian-2.html>.

Yin, Robert K. 2015. *Qualitative Research from Start to Finish*. New York: Guilford Publications.