Portrait of Equality, Justice, and Humanitarian Crisis in Scopus Database: A Bibliometric Study

Syihaabul Hudaa, Luo Ying, Matteo D’Agostino

1Institut Teknologi dan Bisnis Ahmad Dahlan Jakarta, Indonesia
2Guangxi Minzu University, China
3TU Delft University of Technology, Netherlands

Abstract: Equality, justice, and humanitarian crises are complex issues for people worldwide. These issues have always interested researchers worldwide and have been published in the Scopus database. The purpose of writing this article is to analyze articles that have been published in the Scopus database. Researchers try to find exciting research throughout the year using keywords in research that are trending research topics. This research is included in a literature study using descriptive qualitative analysis. Researchers traced the keywords in this study: equality, justice, and humanitarian crises, then collected them in CSV files. The collected data was analyzed using bibliometric analysis using biblioshiny. It was found that authors from the Americas and Europe dominate the Scopus database. In addition to the authors, the journals that published the issue were from the Americas and Europe. The topics researchers are talking about from the results of bibliometric mapping include human and humanitarian crises, war, mental health, military intervention, migration, and others.

Keywords: Bibliometric Analysis, Equality, Justice, Humanitarian Crisis, Trend Topic

menerbitkan masalah ini berasal dari Amerika dan Eropa. Topik yang dibicarakan peneliti dari hasil pemetaan bibliometrik meliputi krisis manusia dan kemanusiaan, perang, kesehatan mental, intervensi militer, migrasi, dan lain-lain.

Kata Kunci: Analisis Bibliometrik, Kesetaraan, Keadilan, Krisis Kemanusiaan, Topik Tren

**Introduction**

Equality, justice, and humanitarian crises are issues that are interesting to discuss. From 1993 to 2024, these issues are still comprehensively discussed in research in the Scopus database. The emergence of research on this topic in the Scopus database is based on threats to equality that impact injustice. Some aspects of equality that are often discussed in research include race (Felix & Trinidad, 2020), gender (Kabeer, 2021), religion (Ghanea, 2017), or other backgrounds (Pope, 2008). Discrimination on race, gender, or religion that occurs in the global sphere can trigger wars, even genocide (Luft, 2012).

A case in point is the war in Yemen in 2015, but surprisingly, this conflict received no global attention. The global legal system has failed to provide a clear path for the Yemeni people to hold their leaders accountable for their crimes. This note analyzes the international legal mechanisms to prosecute Yemen's war crimes and human rights violations (Vadapalli, 2023). However, the justice attempted to be served in Yemen is theoretical, as it does not have sufficient power to enforce justice.

In addition to war being a hot issue throughout the year, cases of genocide against people with low incomes are also prevalent internationally. In 2016, Duterte took more than 30,000 lives, with more than 40% of the killings taking place in Manila, the capital of the Philippines. Experts describe this humanitarian crisis as a genocide against people with low incomes. Most of the dead are from urban slums: men, women, teenagers, and children shot or killed in crossfire, their bodies found in gutters, on dimly lit roadsides, at busy intersections, near shops, inside vehicles, and on motorcycles. Some of the bodies had signs of torture, such as heads wrapped in duct tape, making it challenging to identify. Bodies have been found with handwriting in Filipino that reads, "I am a drug dealer" (Balce & See, 2020).

Conflicts of equality and justice also occur in other countries, such as Nigeria. Nigeria has a long history of terrorist activities that have evolved into sophisticated armed conflict and violent Terrorism in contemporary times (Jinadu, 2016). Terrorism has destroyed many settlements in the Northeast, North Central, and Southeast of the country. A total of 2,152,000 internally displaced persons (IDPs) face many humanitarian crises in refugee camps (Omaka, 2016). Conflicts in the African continent (Ziv et al, 2019) and the Americas have not been explored internationally to date (Smith, 2016), so murder cases are taken for granted (Aranda, 2022; Aureliani, 2023; Ziv et al, 2019).

A case of mass murder that is currently the talk of the world community is the Israeli-Palestinian conflict (Imtiaz et al., 2022; Murray, 2016; Wambrauw et al., 2024). The Israeli-Palestinian conflict has been going on for a very long time and is arguably the worst case of war in history (Dwiastuti, 2021; Kumar, 2019; Westfall et al., 2023). In addition, the genocide of the Rohingya ethnics in Myanmar has caused massive migration of this ethnicity (Roy & Pedron, 2021). Conflicts occurring in various parts of the world and causing migration (O'Mathúina & Hunt, 2020) have created new problems for other countries (Owens, 2008). The problem other countries face is the empowerment of people to live
independently (Roy & Pedron, 2021). However, on the other hand, the host country must have options for where the refugees can live (Muñoz, 2010).

Equality, justice, and humanitarian crises have a massive impact on health (Amebelu et al., 2021). People who experience war directly and migrate require specific treatment from the world government (Wheeler & Dunne, 1996). Health problems suffered by refugees can be transmitted to other communities that are not experiencing conflict (Speed et al., 2020). Therefore, the world government must investigate war victims to minimize other negative impacts (Wood, 1996).

Bruno & Haar, 2020 have researched equality, justice, and humanitarian crises titled "A Systematic Literature Review of the Ethics of Conducting Research in the Humanitarian Setting" (Bruno & Haar, 2020). Bruno and Haar's research found that interest in humanitarian crises has increased dramatically in recent years. Although critical concepts in all research settings, such as beneficence, justice, and respect for human beings, are very relevant, there are some considerations in the humanitarian context.

Meanwhile, Sweileh, in 2018, conducted bibliometric research with the title "Bibliometric Analysis of Peer-Reviewed Literature on Syrian Refugees and Displaced People (2011-2017)" (Sweileh, 2018). It found that the Syrian conflict has created the worst humanitarian crisis of our time, with around half of Syria's pre-war population killed or forced from their homes. In total, 323 documents were retrieved. Research articles constituted 71.2% (n=230) of the retrieved documents. Most (61.6%; n=199) of the retrieved documents were in the health field. The research domains of the retrieved health-related documents were mainly in the areas of mental and psychosocial (17.3%; n = 56), infectious diseases (15.2%; n = 49), health policy and systems (16.4%; n = 53), maternal and reproductive health (15.2%; n = 49), and non-communicable diseases (NCDs) (7.4%; n = 24). Authors from research institutions in the United States produced the highest number of publications (24.5%; n = 79), followed by Turkey (21.4%; n = 69) and Lebanon (10.2%; n = 33). The American University of Beirut was the most active research institution (5.6%; n = 18). Apart from Lebanon and Jordan, there were few contributions from other Arab countries. Conflict and Health was the most active journal (5.3%; n = 17) in publishing on Syrian refugees and IDPs.

Saraiva and Monteiro conducted research in 2023 titled "Climate Change as a Risk to Human Security: A Systematic Literature Review Focusing on Vulnerable Countries of Africa - Causes and Adaptation Strategies." (Saraiva & Monteiro, 2023). The research conducted by Saraiva and Monteiro found that there are four dominant themes in the literature that explain the relationship between climate change and human security: 1) food security related to agricultural systems; 2) water security related to water scarcity and its management; 3) humanitarian crises, with an emphasis on conflict and climate migration; 4) adaptation and mitigation strategies. The results underscore the ineffectiveness of current responses to climate change and demonstrate the urgency of action to mitigate its impacts on communities most vulnerable to its effects, particularly in vulnerable countries in Sub-Saharan Africa.

The difference between this study and previous research is that it seeks to highlight research in the Scopus database on equality, justice, and humanitarian crises. Researchers offer novelty in the form of researchers who focus on these issues, the keywords studied, the country of origin of researchers, word clouds, and others. This bibliometric study can later be used as a reference in conducting other current trending topics among international researchers (Barja-Ore et al., 2023). In addition, through
bibliometric research, researchers can map research being discussed by the world community (Pedraja-Rejas et al., 2022).

This research is a descriptive qualitative study with a literature study approach. The stages in this research began with a keyword search in the form of "equality," "justice," and "humanitarian crisis" in the Scopus database. The data obtained was taken as CSV files and combined into one file. Then, the data was entered into the R-Studio (bibliophily) application for mapping. In addition to the bibliophily application, researchers use the BERTopic application to find topics that international researchers are discussing. The data that has been obtained is presented descriptively in this article.

Results and Discussion

Data Overview

Research with the keywords equality, justice, and humanitarian crisis in the Scopus database was found from 1993 to 2024. From 1993 to 2024, there were 1,820 search sources with 3,015 documents. The authors who participated in the topic of equality, justice, and humanitarian crises were 8,548, with a total of 121,034 references. In addition, the average citation per document was relatively high at 9,286 with 5,526 keywords.

Figure 1. Main Information Data

Research Topic

Research on equality, justice, and humanitarian crises has undergone significant topic changes since its inception in 1993. Several keywords, such as humanitarian crisis, conflict, mental health, war, public health, and migration, are the dominant keywords that always exist every year. Several authors, such as Essar, Roberts, Blanchet, Islam, Checci, and others, write these keywords. In addition, collaboration between authors on this topic is also dominated by authors with the exact research topic correlation and keywords.

Figure 2. Keyword, Author-Reference-Keyword, and Author Collaboration
Trend Topics

From the research topics above, the topic trends in research related to equality, justice, and humanitarian crises refer to interrelated topics. The topics in Figure 3 below show that ethnicity, Palestine, health disparity, humanitarian crisis, pandemic, coronavirus disease 2019, human, humans, etc., show that researchers at the international level highlight this issue. The high frequency of the trend topics below shows that researchers are very enthusiastic about conducting research related to these topics. Some trend topics show that there are topics that discuss peace issues.

Figure 3: The Trend of Research Topics and Sustainable Keywords
Collaboration Between Countries

Issues of equality, justice, and humanitarian crises are of concern to writers from around the world. USA-UK has the highest number of writing collaborations related to equality, justice, and humanitarian crises, with a frequency of 125. This is followed by USA-Switzerland with 60, USA-Canada with 51, UK-Switzerland with 49, and UK-Dutch with 30. The data shows the five highest ranks of countries that conduct writing collaborations on equality, justice, and humanitarian crises. However, the overall collaboration is dominated by countries in the Americas and Europe.

Figure 4. Intercountry Collaboration and Author Correspondence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country Pair</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PAKISTAN - AFGHANISTAN</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITED KINGDOM - AUSTRALIA</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITED KINGDOM - CANADA</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITED KINGDOM - FRANCE</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITED KINGDOM - GERMANY</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITED KINGDOM - NETHERLANDS</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNITED KINGDOM - SWITZERLAND</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA - AUSTRALIA</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA - CANADA</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA - FRANCE</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA - GERMANY</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA - ITALY</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA - LEBANON</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA - NETHERLANDS</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA - SWITZERLAND</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA - UNITED KINGDOM</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The keywords that are the main data in this research are: human, human, female, humanitarian crisis, war, and others. The distribution of article writing in the Scopus database is shown in the network connection on the right. Keywords such as equality, justice, human rights, gender, freedom, and rule of law have a fairly wide distribution. Many researchers have studied these keywords with diverse research that shows a correlation between studies.

**Figure 5. WordCloud**

**Affiliations and Article Sources**

From the mapping results through research in the Scopus database, it was found that the dominance of affiliations came from the American continent. In addition, the journals that publish these articles are also dominated by journals from the Americas and Europe. In addition, the institution's origin also shows the same thing with journals that consistently publish articles on equality, justice, and humanitarian crises.

The results of this study indicate that the topics of equality, justice, and humanitarian crises are interesting to research from 1993-2024. Researchers found through mapping made using the bibliophily application that the dominance of countries conducting research with keywords of equality, justice, and
humanitarian crises are the US, UK, Pakistan, Afghanistan, Germany, Lebanon, and Switzerland. Conflicts that occurred in the Americas and discrimination against certain races led to the emergence of inequalities that resulted in war. Humanitarian crises and wars are two things that become issues from the keywords of equality and justice. A researcher’s search of the main themes in the research in the Scopus database found that the research showed the long-term health effects of war.

Data obtained using bibliophily shows that discrimination has an impact on humanitarian crises. Humanitarian crises around the world are based on several issues, such as war, ethnic conflict, discrimination, and health. Research in the Scopus database shows the potential for other post-war outbreaks, which can lead to the death of large numbers of people (Islam, 2006). In addition, keyword shifts in Scopus database research suggest another possibility: the difficulty of making peace (Ellis et al., 2018). This problem then has an impact on the weakening of law at the international level, such as several cases of large-scale killings in several countries (Muñoz, 2010).

Some of the journals in this research are dominated by journals with a health focus and scope. This means that the keywords equality, justice, and humanitarian crisis have brought other negative impacts that can lead to the extinction of humanity (Chung & Hunt, 2010). In addition to the threat of human extinction, equality, justice, and humanitarian crises can lead to an age of ignorance where humans cannot learn properly (Kagawa, 2007). However, from the findings of the mapping conducted by researchers, there are no countries in the Asian continent that dominate these issues. Peace-loving countries dominate countries on the Asian Continent, and the majority are Muslim.

Several factors may explain why Muslim-majority Asian countries rarely address the issue of humanitarian crises. Some of these factors can be political, social, and cultural. Here are some potential reasons:

1. **Political and Economic Priorities:**
   Governments in these countries may be more focused on domestic issues such as economic development, political stability, and security. Humanitarian crises, especially abroad, maybe a low priority.

2. **Media Control and Freedom of Speech:**
   Some Muslim-majority countries have strict controls on media and free speech. This can limit public discussion and reporting on humanitarian crisis issues, especially those deemed sensitive or potentially threatening political stability.

3. **Diplomatic Dynamics:**
   Diplomatic relations and alliances with other countries can influence discussion of humanitarian crisis issues. States may be reluctant to criticize important allies or trading partners or may want to avoid getting involved in complex conflicts far from their borders.

4. **Identity and Solidarity Issues:**
   International Muslim solidarity may influence attention to humanitarian crises. However, this attention is often selective and dependent on cultural, geographic, and political proximity to the country in crisis.

5. **Access and Information:**
Limited access to accurate and reliable information about humanitarian crises in other regions can also be a factor. Local media may need more resources to report in-depth on international issues.

6. Research Priorities:

In an academic context, researchers in Muslim-majority countries may focus more on issues that are more relevant to their local or national context. Research resources may also be directed towards other areas considered more urgent or important.

7. Institutional and Organizational Limitations:

In some countries, there are limitations in the number and capacity of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) and international organizations active in the humanitarian field. This can limit data collection and advocacy on humanitarian crises.

From the distribution of keywords obtained in this research mapping, only a few keywords discuss the issue of injustice that occurred in Palestine and the Rohingya Ethnicity. However, the countries that conducted the research were not dominated by countries from the Asian continent. This bibliometric research shows the weakness of international law in cases of war and mass killings. In addition, the weak legal system governing warfare has a more dangerous impact, namely the global humanitarian crisis. In addition, a lack of research seeks to address the crisis of humanity, equality, and justice at the international level.

Conclusion

Humanitarian crises are happening all over the world. However, Asian countries rarely talk about humanitarian conflict issues. This statement arises based on data obtained by researchers through bibliometric reviews. Through this bibliometric analysis, researchers found that issues related to equality, justice, and humanitarian crises have been discussed since 1993—2024. Some topics discussed from 1993—2024 include human and humanitarian crises, mental health, war, military intervention, ethnicity, and disaster. However, the authors and journals publishing articles on these issues are dominated by authors from the Americas and Europe. In addition, this mapping also shows that the handling of war in various parts of the world is weak. As a result, conflicts that occur last for a long time and cause many human lives to be killed.

References


