

Review Article

Received: 4 April 2023, Revised: 9 April 2023, Accepted : 9 April 2023, Published: 10 April 2023

Practical Experience of School-Based Management Development in Madrasas: A Systematic Literature Review

Virgiawan Listanto^{*1}, Citra Permatasari²

Research Center for Education¹, Research Center for Public Policy² Researcher at the National Research and Innovation Agency of Indonesia

ABSTRACT:

School-Based Management is a breakthrough taken by the Government of Indonesia by giving autonomy to schools to manage and make decisions in a participatory manner to improve the quality of schools. This literature review research aims to know the participants' characteristics in the articles, the type of measurement, and school-based management development practices in madrasah. A total of 11 articles in 2003-2022 were used to carry out this literature review taken from the Google scholar database with the help of Harzing's Publish or Perish 8 software for data mining. The article search was done online using the keywords "School-Based Management in Madrasah" in both English and Bahasa. The literature review results show that the participants were school committees, principals, vice principals, teachers, administration staff, students, parents, academics, and school program managers. The studies' setting is mainly in Java Island. The measurements used in the quantitative studies were questionnaires, while interview guides were used in the qualitative approach. There were mainly four points that should be underlined from reviewed articles: (1) the principal's leadership is essential in SBM to achieve school goals, (2) the teacher as SBM supporting factor must have knowledge, skills, and attitudes as well as have sufficient insight and are willing to use their potential optimally, (3) encourage the participation of school members and the community to be directly involved in providing education, and (4) needs analysis should carry out at the outset to assist planning and managing resource availability.

Keywords; school-based management, madrasa, systematic literature review

ABSTRAK:

Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah (MBS) merupakan terobosan yang dilakukan oleh Pemerintah Indonesia dengan memberikan otonomi kepada sekolah untuk mengelola dan mengambil keputusan secara partisipatif dalam rangka meningkatkan kualitas sekolah. Penelitian tinjauan pustaka sistematis ini bertujuan untuk mengetahui karakteristik partisipan, jenis pengukuran, dan praktik pengembangan manajemen berbasis sekolah di madrasah dalam suatu artikel. Sebanyak 11 artikel terpilih yang terbit pada rentang tahun 2003-2022 digunakan sebagai tinjauan pustaka ini. Artikel tersebut diambil dari database Google scholar dengan bantuan perangkat lunak Harzing's Publish or Perish 8. Pencarian artikel dilakukan secara online dengan menggunakan kata kunci "Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah di Madrasah" dalam bahasa Inggris maupun Indonesia. Hasil tinjauan pustaka menunjukkan bahwa para partisipan diantaranya: komite sekolah, kepala sekolah, wakil kepala sekolah, guru, staf administrasi, siswa, orang tua siswa, akademisi, dan ketua program sekolah. Lokasi studi paling banyak ditemukan di Pulau Jawa. Alat ukur yang digunakan dalam studi kuantitatif adalah kuesioner, sedangkan untuk pendekatan kualitatif digunakan panduan wawancara. Ada empat hal yang perlu digarisbawahi dari artikel-artikel yang diulas: (1) kepemimpinan kepala sekolah sangat penting dalam MBS untuk mencapai tujuan sekolah, (2) guru sebagai faktor pendukung MBS harus memiliki pengetahuan, keterampilan, dan sikap serta memiliki wawasan yang cukup dan mau menggunakan potensinya secara optimal, (3) kesuksesan MBS diantaranya didapat dari partisipasi warga sekolah dan masyarakat untuk terlibat secara langsung dalam penyelenggaraan pendidikan, dan (4) analisis kebutuhan perlu dilakukan sejak awal untuk membantu perencanaan dan pengelolaan sumber daya. Kata kunci; manajemen berbasis sekolah, madrasah, tinjauan pustaka sistematis

Email address., virgiawan.listanto@brin.go.id (Virgiawan Listanto)

©2022 Jawda : Journal of Islamic Education Management, doi: 10.21580/jawda.v3i2.2022.15355

^{*}Corresponding Author,

THE INTRODUCTION

A sound education system includes physical resources, such as classrooms, teachers, and textbooks, and better teaching and learning ¹. Several factors dominate the issue of education First. national education administration: policies and implementation use an input-output analysis approach that is not implemented consistently; second, education regulations are carried out centrally, so that schools as education providers are very dependent on the bureaucracy; and third, community participation, especially parents, in the implementation of parenting is meager ². The change of government system in Indonesia has changed from centralization to decentralization. This condition is characterized by the granting of significant autonomy to the regions. It has opened up opportunities for the community to increase their participation in governance, including the education sector ³.

The emergence of the School-Based Management (SBM) policy is a breakthrough taken by the Government of Indonesia since 2000 by giving autonomy to schools to manage and make decisions in a participatory manner to improve the quality of schools ⁴. SBM allows schools to manage existing resources by

¹ Yuyun Elizabeth Patras and others, 'Meningkatkan Kualitas Pendidikan Melalui Kebijakan Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Dan Tantangannya', *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 7.2 (2019), 800–807 <https://doi.org/10.33751/jmp.v7i2.1329>.

² Muhammad Nur Hakim, 'Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Dalam Mewujudkan Sekolah Islam Unggulan', *Nidhomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 1.2 (2016), 104–14 <https://doi.org/10.31538/NDH.V1I2.7>.

³ Dra Samsidar, 'Peran Komite Sekolah Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan', *Al-Muaddib : Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial & Keislaman*, 3.1 (2018), 1–15 <https://doi.org/10.31604/muaddib.v1i1.364>.

⁴ Pengawas Sekolah and Muda Tingkat, 'PENTINGNYA OTONOMI PENDIDIKAN DALAM UPAYA MENINGKATKAN MUTU PENDIDIKAN DI INDONESIA Pendidikan Di Daerahnya Sendiri . Hal Ini Dimaksudkan Sebagai Pemberian Sebagian Wewenang Pusat Dan Standarisasi Nasional . Kerja Tenaga Pendidikan Serta Menciptakan Suatu', 1.1 (2022), 151–61.

involving school members and the local community in national education policies. SBM is the embodiment of decentralization in the education sector which includes structuring the dimensions of education administration from the old model to the new model ⁵. Law Number 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System emphasizes that the function of National Education is to develop skills and form valuable national character and civilization in the context of educating people's lives. Education policy is based on guidelines and instructions for administering education in educational activities. The foundation of education policy is the instructions and guidelines for implementing education in educational activities. Education policy is understood as part of public policy, namely general policy in education. Therefore, the educational policy aims to achieve the goals of the state and national development in education as one of the nation-state development goals ⁶.

Alternative solutions to Indonesia's education problems can be found by changing social systems related to the education system and improving teacher quality and student performance. Improving the quality of education can be assumed to create higher quality human resources to lead this nation to fair competition in the global arena ⁷. Management strategies and techniques applied by Islamic Education institutions in improving the quality of human resources by gradually adjusting the institutional structure with the behavior of the academic community to achieve the desired performance (efficiency). Every

⁵ Indra Saputra and Riska Ahmad, 'Penerapan Desentralisasi Pendidikan Pada Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Dari Pola Lama (Sebelum Desentralisasi Pendidikan) Ke Pola Baru (Era Desentralisasi)', *Keguruan: Jurnal Penelitian, Pemikiran, Dan Pengabdian*, 10.2 (2022), 66–70.

⁶ Angelika Bule Tawa, 'Kebijakan Pendidikan Nasional Dan Implementasinya Pada Sekola Dasar', *SAPA - Jurnal Kateketik Dan Pastoral*, 4.2 (2019), 107–17 <https://doi.org/10.53544/sapa.v4i2.82>.

⁷ Abdul Hafid, 'MODEL MANAJEMEN BERBASIS SEKOLAH Oleh: Abdul Hafid *', *Lentera Pendidikan*, 14.2 (2011), 189–201.

manager, starting from managers, administrators, trainers, and educators in educational institutions, must be committed to the quality objectives, timeliness, and effectiveness of the program to be able to provide renewal of the process of teaching and learning activities in service and the best capacity in management practices and administration of the development of educational institutions⁸.

Indonesia has madrasas as an Islamic educational institution that teach the Islamic religion. There are two types of madrasas in Indonesia: formal and non-formal. The main difference between formal and non-formal madrasas is their status and governmentregulated curriculum. The formal madrasas must follow the curriculum set by the government and teach subjects such as mathematics, social sciences, etc ⁹. However, non-formal madrasas are educational institutions outside formal schools that primarily organize Islamic religious education and are not bound to the same curriculum ¹⁰. In this research, the word "madrasa" refers to formal madrasa as formal educational institutions in Indonesia, which are mandated by the Indonesian 1945 Constitution to educate the Nation's life.

Recently, the number of the madrasa, increasing every year and spreading throughout Indonesia, has contributed to educational equity and 9-year compulsory education ¹¹. However, classic problems related to management and quality are still found.

⁸ M Ihsan Dacholfany, 'Inisiasi Strategi Manajemen Lembaga Pendidikan Islam Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Sumber Daya Manusia Islami Di Indonesia Dalam Menghadapi Era Globalisasi', *At-Tajdid: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pemikiran Islam*, 1.01 (2017), 1–13 < https://doi.org/10.24127/att.v1i01.330>.

⁹ Afida Nurriqi, 'Karakteristik Pendidikan Agama Islam Di Madrasah Prespektif Kebijakan Pendidikan', *BINTANG*, 3.1 (2021), 124–41.

¹⁰ Tedi Priatna, 'Demography of Madrasah Diniyah Takmiliyah and Revitalizing the Institutional Function of Islamic Education', *Journal of Southwest Jiaotong University*, 55.1 (2020).

¹¹ Faridah Alawiyah, 'Pendidikan Madrasah Di Indonesia', Jurnal Aspirasi: Jurnal Masalah-Masalah Sosial, 5.1 (2014), 51–58.

In addition, the slow development of the internal scope of madrasas and the declining public interest in sending their children to madrasas need attention at the level of the younger generation of Indonesian people who are currently experiencing a desacralization of religious values ¹². Therefore, the principles of managing education in madrasas to strengthen the quality of madrasas need to be studied again.

In the era of autonomy, there has been a change in the direction of the implementation of education. It previously used centralized to a decentralized pattern. There is a model known as School-Based Management, which is an effort to improve the quality of education by giving schools/madrasahs broad authority to make policies to improve the quality of education. As an Islamic educational institution, madrasah-based management can be implemented and adapted to problems within the madrasah ¹³. widespread Besides that. the criticism of school-based management practices that are not transparent, too bureaucratic, and transparent has considered improving education governance a practical solution ¹⁴.

Studies related to school-based management in madrasas have previously discussed the influence of the roles of actors involved in school-based management, such as school principals, school committees, etc. ¹⁵. In line with that, another studie had also

¹² Imam Turmidzi, 'Pengelolaan Pendidikan Bermutu Di Madrasah', *Tarbawi: Jurnal Pemikiran Dan Pendidikan Islam*, 4.2 (2021), 165–81.

¹³ Ahmad Zaini Aziz, 'Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah: Alternatif Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Madrasah', *El-Tarbawi*, 8.1 (2015), 69–92.

¹⁴ Arismunandar Arismunandar, Nurhikmah H Nurhikmah H, and Widya Karmila Sari Achmad, 'Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah' (Badan Penerbit Universitas Negeri Makassar, 2015).

¹⁵ Suyitno Suyitno, 'Pengaruh Keterampilan Manajerial Kepala Sekolah Dan Peran Komite Terhadap Efektivitas Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah', *Jurnal Basicedu*, 5.3 (2021), 1564–76; Heryon Bernard Mbuik, 'Pengaruh Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah Terhadap Penerapan Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Di SD', *Indonesian Journal of Primary Education*, 3.2 (2019), 28–37; Nela Seriyanti, Syarwani Ahmad, and Destiniar Destiniar, 'Pengaruh

revealed study revealed there is a simultaneous influence between Principal leadership and the Role of the School Committee for the Success of School-Based Management ¹⁶. Furthermore, the success of School-based management is also determined by the extent to which the institution is able to establish professional rules or management ¹⁷. Additionallly, many case studies also focus on implementing school-based management ¹⁸. This study analysis will not be repeated from various existing studies. Based on previous studies, this study shows that a systematic literature review is needed to verify the development of madrasah management in achieving the school's vision. This study also discusses the research participants and methodology used to look practical experience of school-based management at the development in madrasas.

In academic research, a literature review is an essential feature. A systematic review is a formulated question that uses systematic and explicit methods to identify, select, and critically appraise relevant research and to collect and analyze data from the studies included in the review ¹⁹. By summarizing, analyzing, and synthesizing a group of related literature from the previous

Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah Dan Peran Komite Sekolah Terhadap Keberhasilan Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah', *JMKSP (Jurnal Manajemen, Kepemimpinan, Dan Supervisi Pendidikan)*, 6.1 (2020), 15–33.

¹⁶ Seriyanti, Ahmad, and Destiniar.

¹⁷ Abdulloh Hadziq, `Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah (School Based Management) Dalam Mewujudkan Sekolah Efektif (Studi Kasus Di Mts Nu Sabilul Muttaqin Jepang Mejobo Kudus)', *Quality*, 4.2 (2017), 351–71.

¹⁸ Sahril Muhammad and Mardia Rahman, 'Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Untuk Meningkatkan Mutu Sekolah Dasar Islam Insan Kamil Bacan Kabupaten Halmahera Selatan', *Edukasi*, 15.1 (2017); Karseno Handoyo, Mudhofir Mudhofir, and Maslamah Maslamah, 'Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Madrasah Dalam Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Di Madrasah', *Jurnal Ilmiah Ekonomi Islam*, 7.1 (2021), 321–32; Aulia Diana Devi, 'Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Dalam Meningkatkan Kualitas Di Sekolah Menengah Pertama', *Edukatif: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 3.3 (2021), 963–71.

¹⁹ David Moher and others, 'Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses: The PRISMA Statement', *BMJ (Online)*, 339.7716 (2009), 332–36 https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.b2535>. studies. We can assess a specific premise and/or develop new concepts ²⁰. This current study on a systematic literature review adopts the PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic reviews and Meta-Analyses) model. It uses the Google Scholar database to retrieve the data. The PRISMA model is pervasive in a systematic literature review (²¹. This study tries to answer the following questions; 1) who are the participants from the previous studies? 2) what type of measurement is being taken? and 3) what type of leadership usually appears in studies of leadership and its relevance to management? The purpose of this systematic literature review study is to 1) determine the characteristics of the participants in the research articles on school leadership, 2) to know the type of measurement, 3) to analyze and synthesize a group of related literature from the past studies on school-based management development in madrasas.

METHOD OF RESEARCH

This study used a qualitative systematic review method with the PRISMA model adapted from ²². It follows a set of standard guidelines, generally called protocols, to identify and synthesize all relevant studies and assess what is known from the study topic. The search protocols for articles were done online using the keywords "School-Based Management in Madrasah" in both English and Bahasa using Harzing's Publish or Perish 8 software

²⁰ Yu Xiao and Maria Watson, 'Guidance on Conducting a Systematic Literature Review', *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, 39.1 (2019), 93–112 https://doi.org/10.1177/0739456X17723971.

²¹ Marta Abelha and others, 'Graduate Employability and Competence Development in Higher Education–A Systematic Literature Review Using PRISMA', *Sustainability*, 12.15 (2020), 5900; Susanna Vonny N Rante and Harmelia Tulak, 'Far from Expectation: A Systematic Literature Review of Inclusive Education in Indonesia', *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 2020; Vivian Welch and others, 'Extending the PRISMA Statement to Equity-Focused Systematic Reviews (PRISMA-E 2012): Explanation and Elaboration', *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*, 70 (2016), 68–89.

²² Moher and others.

from the Google Scholar database. This data withdrawal was carried out on March 30, 2023. All articles that have passed the selection process have entered the topic. The Inclusion criteria in the current study include papers with an h-index > 0.00. It is because data from the Google Scholar database had enormous data variations and were sometimes unindexed. Furthermore, this study would use a paper with a citation quality h-index of 0.00 > or at least once cited, as shown in the Harzing's publish or perish program. Furthermore, the literature search was limited to articles published from 2003 to 2023.

RESEARCH FINDING AND DISCUSSION

The search begins by inputting "School-Based Management in Madrasas" keywords in Harzing's Publish or Perish 8 software. The data mining from the Google Scholar database obtained 109 articles written in both Bahasa and English. Meanwhile, using the English word as the keyword resulted in 15 articles.

We start has	Search territy		Source	Rome	Over	Cheske.	b	0 N	orri biao	al M	acc 10	Search date	Cache date	Log.			~	dialog addes
3 Tash		arbaris raise is h	d - G Goode Sch.		185	925		17		25 2	2	10/03/9/01	10/03/2021					
			d _ S Gosed	100	15	135	- 2			22 1	a.	30/08/2023	50/08/2025	523				Publication grants 30
			ra. S Crossel	300	\$35	40.00	15	24		41 2	a a		10/01/2003	522				Category years on (20 Phones
	2 leadership so	tool marageme	et . G Google Sch.	378	790	138.00	13	22	10	00 7	4	10/05/2022	13/05/2022	0				CENTON'S
	C sederalep sci	tool manageme	at _ RI Patrice	4	0	0.00	0	D	0 0	0 0	0	10/06/2002	10/06/2022	a.				categy years
	2 talent manag	errent public of	nn 🔓 Google Sch.	992	100619	10051.90	150	266	- 46	a) 🕫	377	19/04/2022	19/04/2022	0				cator/jagen: Authorshere:
	A sub-sub-sub-		to PE to the second	1.00	4.0	The set		- 11		a		110101	11000000				4	Trains.
	- Heaglo Adabit scorch											(miles)						
	Archorat														Tears: 1	0	Search	14 million
	Publication name														EG91	1	Search 2019	Lipping and
	Information		riber a wicken di medrer													-	Dist 61	Papers with ACCOM 5(2)
		Handle Anna	rear and a second at rear of													_		6,4,2,2,3
	Report to a																Front	
	Pathon surface finable 24 - Indiate (Contaction associal (Clearly) - Server -													Copy Denator				
												Seve Denits						
	Ches	Feryear Date	k Arthurs	THe												West 2	ublication 🗠	
	⊴h 115	10.17 I A Reamba Implementari mengementerbetaria arkoleh dalam pencaparan tapan penchikatan nasional di mechasiah 2017 Idatech Arma I									Report details Solid to popular the remains On the left of the parts) to a cetate remain							
	3d h 10																	
	⊿hn	2.20 86 L Ardangeh, A.D., Mangenen Boleja Sidolal Babeas Resarten D. Machash Senara yai Ah Makem Seven, Berkit, Yegyahata 2015. Juna Tembargu 2.00 4 M Minesterjene PERANA KOPPIA MARAN A WADASA I DALAM MENCIAPITAN MASIAN KANA KATA MANA FERANA SERUK AH (2015) UK. 2005. Kewa Teketek H																
	-7h6																	cistalla trans.
			M M hohand one								SIGN	ODN SEP MANA	EMEN FEED			2020 8	ins Thirth I	defails here.
loola	dhy	1.15 8	N Serd	Resource	Мандат	arsdokhi	Salese	Rouba	Di Nadrasa	laway	SIGN I	ON SEP MANA In Sala Alap 1	IDMEN FEEDA Real Articl Res	lary Sec	anular Barch	2000 A 2015		dataita tere.
	전h9 코 1	1.15 8	N Seld S Webyeri	Horisonau Implemente	i Marajan el Manaje	en Scholen I ren Derbad	Schluce In Sekoli	Hourbo h Di Nad	Di Madhasa atah Tomas	i barwiya yah Al-Dar	KICAL I Powró Id Davy	oon SEP MANK Ion Satu Alap I Mada Dava D	ITMEN FEEDA Good Arnol Ret emblea Kecam	lary Sec	anular Barch	2000 k 2015 2007	ern Tehrbild I	catalla ini ni.
ada a ser .	기h9 코그 코고	1.13 8 1.00 0 0.67 3	N Send S Weinyuni M Tehdric M Veset	Pelakonaan Implemente Analisis Imp	i Mangeri el Manaja Acmentasi	en Scholah I nen Derbasi Kebijakan N	Salvas Ir Sekoli Korojer	- Rounica In Di Mind Ion Berba	Di Madrusa anah Tranas Ri Sekoloh p	i lanvwys ysh Al-Dar do Nodias	SICAL I Pesaria Id Davy In Aliya	ote sta Make on Salo Alao I Muda Dea D di Kabupaten	IDMEN DEBEA Read Arnel Res embles Recent Lowe Utora	leng Kac dan Gau	ender Berch.	2000 N 2005 2002 2002	ern Tehrbild I	catalla livi ni.
	기ho 코 I 지 2 고 2	1.15 88 1.00 0 0.67 0 0.67 0	N Seld S Webyeri	Pelaksonaa Implemente Analisis Imp Analisis Imp	i Mangari di Manaja Jementasi Jementasi	en Sekolah I men Derbad Kebijakan N Kebijakan N	Serbean It Sekali Nangjer Nangjer	i Roanba eh Di Med en Berba en Berba	Di Madrusa asah Tsanas is Sekolah p Is Sekolah p	i banawiya yah Al-Ras da Nadisa da Nadisa	STOCK I Powerk Milliony Millio	otik STP MANA en Salo Alap I Mada Dava D di Kabupaten di Kabupaten	Instant Press and Arnol Ker emblos Kecam towe Utara towe Utara towe Utara Ta	teng Kac stan Gao amatu 4 (2, 210-223	2000 k 2015 2002 2020 k 2020 k	ern Tehrbild I	catulla ferre.
	기h9 코그 코고	1.13 8 1.00 0 0.67 3 0.57 3 0.57 3	N Sold S Weityuni M Talidik M Yeset. M Talidik N Yeset.	Heiskanaa Implemente Analisis Imp Analisis Imp Implemente	i Mangori di Manaja Jemertasi Jemertasi Jemertasi Jemertasi	en Sekolah I men Derbad Kebijakan A Kebijakan A Men berbad	Serbese In Sakoli Kanajen Kanajen Kanajen	i Reantra el Di Mad en Berba en Barba n unnik p	Di Madrusa anah Tonnas is Sekoloh p ni Sekolah p reingkaran n	i lashweya yah AHDas da Nodius da Nadius da Nadius	SIGAL I Pount M Days h Alyst h Alyst an di s	ote sta Make en Salo Alap I Made Deve G di Kabupaten di Kabupaten Koloh dan ma	ADMEN EFERA And Amel Re- embles Kecars Lowe Utora Lowe Utora Lowe Utora Lowe Utora	leng Koo dan Gao anah, 4 (ah aras ()	znalen Barde 19 2), 210-223 zudi melih kwau.	2000 k 2015 2002 2020 k 2020 k	ann Thhrib N:) dearsh	citato nevo.
Polances - Othe José Planci Ingenity Admit Question	지h9 코 1 코 2 코 2 코 2 코 4	1.15 88 1.00 0 0.67 3 0.57 3 0.57 4 0.50 A	N Seid S Weiyuni M Taldic M YeseL M Taldic M YeseL M Taldic N YeseL	Heisteinen Implemente Analisis Imp Analisis Implemente Implemente Implemente	i Mangeri el Manaje Acmentasi Acmentasi el remaje or Manaje	en Sekolah I men Derbad Kebijakan N Kebijakan N Kebijakan N men berbad nen berbad	Serbese In Sekoli Ranajen Ranajen In sekolin In Sekoli	Reantrea sh Di Mad sen Berba sen Berba sen Berba sen Berba sen Berba sen Berba sen Berba sen Berba	Di Madrusa anah Tranas is Sekolah p mingkatan p Sekolah p	i banaviya yah AHDar da Madhar da Madhar da Madhar da Madhar guan Kandid	SIGAN I Posanti M Dinya M Aliyah M Aliyah An Di Si Sikan Na	ote sta Make en Salo Alap I Made Deve G di Kabupaten di Kabupaten Koloh dan ma	ADMEN EFERA And Amel Re- embles Kecars Lowe Utora Lowe Utora Lowe Utora Lowe Utora	leng Koo dan Gao anah, 4 (ah aras ()	2, 210-223	2000 k 2015 2022 2020 k 2020 2016 k 2016 k 2017	ann Thhrib N:) dearsh	citato nervo.
Parlaments Deline Josef & Maraol Inspectify Advid Questions Denning Review res	지 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10	1.13 88 1.00 0 0.67 3 0.57 3 0.50 A 0.50 A	 N Soul S Wenyoni M Tatolic N Yeset, M Tatolic N Yeset, Avi Route Avi Route A Resentor 	Pelaksenaan Implemente Analisis Imp Analisis Imp Implemente Implemente Manajement	i Mangon el Manaje de mentasi de mentasi el remaje el Manaje Sekolah T	en Scholah I men Derbad Kebijakan N Kebijakan N Kebijakan N men Berbad Men Berbad Mara K Pera	Schluse In Seicole Sanajan Isanajan Isaskala Isaskala Isaskala Isaskala	Hoantra In Di Mad Ion Berba Ion Berba Ion Berba Ion Berba Ion Datam I Madraca	Di Madrusa anah Tranas is Sekolah p mingkatan p Sekolah p	i banawiya yah Al-Dao da Madika da Nadika da Nadika da Nadika guan Tandi Al-Iman Du	SICKET Positi Millionyi Mi	ook stip seven i in Satu Alap I i Mada Dava B i di Kabupaten i di Kabupaten kolah dan ma si orat Di Madi og Parwanjo	ADMEN EFERA And Amel Re- embles Kecars Lowe Utora Lowe Utora Lowe Utora Lowe Utora	leng Koo dan Gao anah, 4 (ah aras ()	znalen Barde 19 2), 210-223 zudi melih kwau.	2000 k 2015 2022 2020 k 2020 2016 2 2016 2 2017 2017 V	arra Tabute NE A	citato nerv.
Notice on a Define deer to Harris C Internet March Constants Transmy Researchs Marcher Constant	স h 9 ন । ন হ 2 ন হ 3 न হ 2 ন হ 3 न হ 2 ন হ 3 न 2 न 2 न 2 न 2 न 2 न 2 न 2 न 2 न 2 न 2	1.13 8 1.00 3 0.67 3 0.57 4 0.50 A 0.50 A 0.50 A 0.40 3	 N Send S Wanyuni M Tabala N Yasah, M Tabala N Yasah, A N Rowles A Roombu A Roombu 	Heisenen Implemente Analisis Impl Analisis Impl Implemente Manajemente Implemente	i Mangon al Manaja Admentasi Admentasi al remoja al Manaja Sekolan J al Manaja	en Sekolah I men Derbad Kebijakan N Kebijakan N Kebijakan N Men Derbad Men Derbad men Derbad	School Is Seicell Ranaj on Ranaj on Ran	Heantre sh Di Mid ien Berba in Berba in Berba in Datam I Madrosa in pada M	Di Nadrusa anah Transv is Sekolah p is Sekolah p is Sekolah p is Sekolah p is Transwigah atras h Aliy	i banawiya yah Al-Dao da Madhas da Madhas da Madhas da Madhas Al-Iman Bu h di Kota P	SIGAL I I Pount M Ringe In Aliyah In Aliyah M Aliyah Man Di Sa Silan Na Si Gelse Viccour	ook stip seven i in Satu Alap I i Mada Dava B i di Kabupaten i di Kabupaten kolah dan ma si orat Di Madi og Parwanjo	ADMEN EFERA And Amel Re- embles Kecars Lowe Utora Lowe Utora Lowe Utora Lowe Utora	leng Koo dan Gao anah, 4 (ah aras ()	znalen Barde 19 2), 210-223 zudi melih kwau.	2000 k 2015 2022 2020 k 2020 2016 2 2016 2 2017 2017 V	ina Tabéhiti b Isalah Isala Janajera	catalo tere.
Parlaments Deline Josef & Maraol Inspectify Advid Questions Denning Review res	স h 9 ন । স 2 ম	1.15 88 1.00 55 0.67 4 0.57 4 0.50 A 0.50 A 0.50 A 0.40 75 0.40 55	 N Send S Weinyumi M Tablic N Veset. M Tablic N Veset. M Tablic A Veset. A Resented A Resented A Resented A A Resented 	Polisionan Implemento Analisis Imp Analisis Imp Implemento Implemento Implemento Manajemento	i Mangoni el Manaje dementosi dementosi el consoje si Manajo si Manajo Peningkat	en Sekolah I Rebijakan N Kebujakan N Kebujakan N Rebujakan N Rebar k Pesa Rebusi an Vista Der	Serbuse In Sekoli Nanajier Nanajier Nanajier Nanajier Nanajier Sekoli Sekoli Sekoli Sekoli Sekoli Sekoli	Heantre sh Di Mud ten Berba ni umuk p ah Datam I Madrasa di pada M di pada M	Di Madrusa anah Transv is Sekolah p Is Sekolah p Is Sekolah p Isingkatan n Enceparen I Transwiyah adrosch Alty Jactanah Tra	i factoringo yah Al-Dae da Madras da Madras da Madras da Madras da Madras Al-Dae h di Kota P aranyah Al-	Silonto I Hosanti M Dinya In Aliyal In Aliyah In Aliyah In Aliyah In Gelse Integer Inggih B	ote STP MANAN Ion Suite Alao I Made Dava D Made Dava D Matauta di Kabupaten Kalah dan ma Ional D Mada ng Panantijo Iota Dandung	Inerni EFERA And And Re- enblik Kecam Lowe Utac Lowe Utac Lowe Utac Lowe Utac Lowe Utac Lowe Utac Lowe Utac	teng Koo stan Gau anatu 4 (ah aras () Jernal Tr	znalen Barde 19 2), 210-223 zudi melih kwau.	2000 k 2005 2002 2020 k 2020 k 2020 2016 k 2017 2001 V 2001 V 2005 A	ina Tabéhiti b Isalah Isala Janajera	catalo tere.
Notice on a Online Jour's Haraci In partic Advid Quantum Transmy Research Your due Council	र = + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + +	1.15 88 1.00 3 0.67 3 0.57 4 0.50 4 0.50 4 0.50 7 0.50 7 0	 N Sold S Weinyon M Tatal (M Yesh) M Tatal (M Yesh) A Natal (M Yesh) A Roseliu A Roseliu<!--</td--><td>Polision autorities Implemente Autorities Implemente Implemente Manajemente Manajemente Manajemente Trajoran Ma</td><td>i Mangen el Manaje de nertosi de nertosi de nertosi el nertosi se Manaje partogiano naje nerto la Madrea</td><td>en Sekolah I Kebijalan N Kebijalan N Kebijalan N Kebijalan N Kebijalan N Kebijalan N Kebijan B Kebijan B Kebijan B</td><td>Serbuse In Selection family on Annay on Annay on Selecti</td><td>- Koantea eh Di Med en Berba- en Berba- n Berba- h Datami I Metrosol di Datami H Metrosol di</td><td>Di Madrasa asah Tenera Si Sekolah p si Sekolah p si Sekolah p si Sekolah p si Sekolah p si Sekolah p tengangan tengangan si Sekolah Alip Astronah Te si Sekolah Palipan si Sekolah p si Sek</td><td>Harnswijs yah Al-Das da Madras da Nadras da Nadras da Nadras Al-Iman Ba h di Kota H maryah Al- basis Selo Sekotan di</td><td>SIGNU F Festive M Ricci h Aliyah h Aliyah h Aliyah h Aliyah kan di si kan Na an Gelae Masar hayah K h Di Ma</td><td>oth STP MANN ren Suto Alao I i Mada Dava G i di Kabupaten i di Stati Tencov Yangsewu</td><td>Ination PERSON Aural Arnel Ken en blog Kenano Lowe Utara Dave Utara Dave Utara te Issoh meneng usate odatoch</td><td>leng Kac dan Gau amatu 4 (ah ama (Arnal Fr Arnal Fr</td><td>enden Berek 9 21.210-223 20.11 mild Leon. 14 Percird Kan</td><td>2000 k 2015 2007 2009 k 2000 2016 k 2017 2016 k 2017 2001 k 2005 2018 2010</td><td>ern Tehrbin k deaich beadigen Aeth Manajers and Kepening</td><td>catalo tere.</td>	Polision autorities Implemente Autorities Implemente Implemente Manajemente Manajemente Manajemente Trajoran Ma	i Mangen el Manaje de nertosi de nertosi de nertosi el nertosi se Manaje partogiano naje nerto la Madrea	en Sekolah I Kebijalan N Kebijalan N Kebijalan N Kebijalan N Kebijalan N Kebijalan N Kebijan B Kebijan B Kebijan B	Serbuse In Selection family on Annay on Annay on Selecti	- Koantea eh Di Med en Berba- en Berba- n Berba- h Datami I Metrosol di Datami H Metrosol di	Di Madrasa asah Tenera Si Sekolah p si Sekolah p si Sekolah p si Sekolah p si Sekolah p si Sekolah p tengangan tengangan si Sekolah Alip Astronah Te si Sekolah Palipan si Sekolah p si Sek	Harnswijs yah Al-Das da Madras da Nadras da Nadras da Nadras Al-Iman Ba h di Kota H maryah Al- basis Selo Sekotan di	SIGNU F Festive M Ricci h Aliyah h Aliyah h Aliyah h Aliyah kan di si kan Na an Gelae Masar hayah K h Di Ma	oth STP MANN ren Suto Alao I i Mada Dava G i di Kabupaten i di Stati Tencov Yangsewu	Ination PERSON Aural Arnel Ken en blog Kenano Lowe Utara Dave Utara Dave Utara te Issoh meneng usate odatoch	leng Kac dan Gau amatu 4 (ah ama (Arnal Fr Arnal Fr	enden Berek 9 21.210-223 20.11 mild Leon. 14 Percird Kan	2000 k 2015 2007 2009 k 2000 2016 k 2017 2016 k 2017 2001 k 2005 2018 2010	ern Tehrbin k deaich beadigen Aeth Manajers and Kepening	catalo tere.
Notice on a Online Jour's Haraci In partic Advid Quantum Transmy Research Your due Council	<u>।</u> । । । । । । । । । । । । ।	1.15 88 1.00 3 0.67 4 0.57 4 0.50	 N Send S Wanyan M Tabalic N Yasah, M Tabalic N Yasah, M Tabalic A Rosenbu A Rosenbu A Narasynta W Samor A So Marin P Narta 	Polision autorities for a second seco	i Manajer di Manajer di mentasi di mentasi di mentasi di mentasi di mentasi di mentasi Sekolon T si Manajer Pentaspat majerasi la Madrose con Keper	en sekolah I men Derbad Kebujakan N Kebujakan N men Berbaar Metaar k Pea nen Berbaar an Viuta Der Secongen D hidalam Me	Serbuse is Sekoli fanajen fanajen fanajen fanajen is Sekoli fanis Seko	- Koantee en Berba- en Berba- en Berba- en Berba- en Berba- di Datam- Hierba- di Gatam- Hierba- di Gatam- Hierba- Hierba- Koba- Koba- Koba-	Di Madrasa asah Tanawa is Setoloh p sebelahan tekepaten h tercepaten h tercepaten h tercepaten h tercepaten h tercepaten h tercepaten h setoloh h tercepaten h te	I benavnys ysh AHDen ca Madras da Madras da Madras da Madras da Madras A I men Bu h ch Kota P new ysh AH had s Selec Selectan ch second Vac	Stickle I Pesanti In Pesanti In Aliyat In Aliyat	oth STP MANN ren Salo Alao I Made Dave G di Kabupaten di	Ination PERIA Aural Annal Ken en bloc Kenano Lawe Utara Lawe Utara Lawe Utara Lawe Utara Lawe Utara Aura Lawe Agen (Mis) Neg In Ewis Mission	leng Kec dan Gau anatu 4 (ah anatu 4 Jamat In Jamat In Jamat In Jamat In	enden Berek 9 2), 210-223 2011 milit best 10 Nordel best 10 Nordel best 10 Nordel best	2000 k 2007 2027 2020 k 2020 2016 k 2017 2016 k 2000 2018 2000 2019 2010 2015 k	ern Tehrbin k deaich beadigen Aeth Manajers and Kepening	catalo vev.
Notice on a Online Jour's Haraci In partic Advid Quantum Transmy Research Your de Courted	।	1.15 48 1.00 3 0.67 3 0.57 3 0.50 4 0.50 4 0.50 4 0.50 4 0.50 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4	 N Send S Wanguei M Toblic N Yosh, M Toblic N Yosh, M Toblic N Yosh, A Tosofie A Tosofie A Tosofie A Tosofie A Nameryte W Warner A O'CH YADIN F Marks N Non- 	Polision au Implemento Analisio Impl Analisio Impl Implemento Implemento Manajemento Implemento Trigo an Mi Penajemento Penaje	i Manajer di Manajer di mentasi di mentasi di mentasi di mentasi di mentasi Nanajer Pertagian najernen la Madrose eran Keper minunan	en Sekulah I men Derbad Kebijakan A Kebujakan A Kebujakan A men Berbaa erbaa K Penn nen Berbaa er Muta Der Secongen D Hidalam Mo Sittephan Ké Repela Wat	Serbuse is Sekoli fanajien fanajien fanajien fanajien is Schol- dramen di sistem Si sistem Si sistem Si sistem Si sistem Si sistem Si sistem Si sistem Si sistem Si	- Rearder is faile for Media en Berbar en Berbar in Unitarin I Mediae di I Gada Mile Jah di Reada Mile an Vienge Actab Ted Scient Mediae Media Scient Mediae	Di Nadrasa asah Toniwa Io Sololon p Io Sololon p Io Sololon p Io Denaviyah Jahasah Aliy Jahasah Aliy Jahasah To Io Denaviyah Io Denaviy	I Jamwaya yah Al-Dan da Madias da Madias da Madias da Madias di Madias Al-Imen Bu hidi Kota P anaryah Al- badis Selat Selati Selat Selati Selat Selati Selat Selati Selati Selati Selati Selati Selati Selati Selati Selati Selati Selati Selati Selati	Stickle I Powerfo In Powerfo In Aliyah In Aliyah In Aliyah In Aliyah In Celar Inayah I In Celar Inayah I In Celar Inayah I In Celar Inayah I Inayah I Inayah Inayah Inayah Inayah Inayah Inayah Inayah Inayah I Inayah Inayah Inayah Inayah Inayah Inayah I Inayah Inay	ote STP MANU ren Salo Alas I Made Dave 5 di Kabupaten di	Internet EFERN and Antel Ren enblow Clean Lowe Clance Lowe Clance Lowe Clance Internet isoch meneng asale oduloch Agen (Missi Niej in Rode Macien Ind Mediezeh	teng Kec dan Gao amatu 4 (ah amatu 4) Jamat In Jamat In Jamat In Jamat In Jamat In Jamat In Jamat In	enden Berek. 9 2), 210-223 ruch mithi kesu. 14 Provid Kar 14 provid Kar 15 provid Kasta	2000 k 2007 2007 2007 2016 k 2016 k 2017 2016 k 2000 2019 2010 2019 2010 2019 2010 2015	ern Tehrbin k deaich beadigen Aeth Manajers and Kepening	catalo vev.
Normania Delas Anto Manal Insue Anto Anto Natura Charat Antonia Insue Natura Charat	115 1 - 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	1.15 48 1.00 3 0.67 3 0.57 3 0.50 4 0.50 4 0.50 4 0.50 4 0.50 4 0.51 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.25 4 0.18 2	N Sent SWanyum Whote N Yest Whote N Yest Whote N Yest Washe A Route Artiste	Harbon van Implemente Analise Implemente Implemente Implemente Implemente Nanajement Implemente Nanajement Implemente Peres Kepat	i Manajen ni Manaje komentasi komentasi komentasi ni Manaje Peningkat najemen la Madruse eta Kapate mi Manajeme	en Sekulah II men Derbad Kebijakan A Kebujakan A men Berbad erbad kebad erbad an Muta Der Gelagan D Kebad Ingilaan Ké Kepula Mata	Serbuse is Sekoli fanajen fanajen k sekoli a Sokoli men di s Sokoli barie Si han ki men plu pata Se data Si barie Si han plu pata Si	- Koantoo en Di Mad en Berba en Berba in Datam I Madixeo di Datam Hedah di T rangka M an Venigo Kotok Tet Salam Mor Madixeo Madixeo	Di Nadrasa arah Torowa is Sotolon p a Sotolon p a Sotolon y a Sotolon y Torowayah utrosh Aity Anorowah Torowayah utrosh Aity Anorowah Toro anajemen Bartowah Torowayah Anorowah Torowah Torowah Anorowah Torowah Anorowah Torowah Anorowah Anorowah Torowah Anorowah Torowah Anorowah Anorowah Torowah Anorowah Anorowah Torowah Ano	I Jamwarya yah Al-Dan da Madias da Madias da Madias da Madias yaan Ranki Al-Iman Ru Junda Selat Selati Selat Selati Selat Selati Selat Selati Man giarkan Ma	SBOAL I Povanti In Povanti In Aliyah In Aliyah	oth STP MANNA rom Sate Alao I Midde Dave D el Katagellan Kolinh den mer a orial Un Medi oria Daneburg Middeh Taneburg Middeh Sekoli Rechard Sekoli Alabare Solodi di kan di MTP A	End PA EFERA and Aniel Re- archite Coord Dave Utant In Dave Utant Dave Utant Dave Utant Dave Utant Dave Utant Dave Isoth odd better in Rada Macheret Realised Social	teng Kec dan Gao amatu 4 (ah amatu 4) Jamat 10 Jamat 10 Kata ah Kata an Kata an Kata	enden Berek. 19 21:210-223 rust milit kest. 19 Freide kan. 19 Jan George – 19 Gande Kasta	2000 k 2002 2002 2002 2005 k 2005 2016 k 2005 2015 2015 2015 2015 2015 2015 2015 2015 2015	inn Thirthi k Isach Isach I Isach Manalen Ing Roper ing U-BBAH	cable wes.
Norman Shara Anna Maraal Maraa Anna Maraal Maraa Canana Maraa Canana M	।	1.15 88 1.00 3 0.67 3 0.57 4 0.50 0 0.40 3 0.25 4 0.25 5 0.10 2 0.15 5	N Sent Norman	Polisionen Implemento Analisis Implemento Implemento Implemento Na sajerne Implemento Na sajerne Implemento Na sajerne Implemento Pere parte Pere parte Pere parte Pere parte Pere parte Pere parte	i Manajen ni Manaje koncritas koncritas koncritas ni Manajo Peningkat ningkonon ka Madrus ran Keper ni matura kanajerne in alement	en Sekeleh II men Derbad Ketajakan N Ketajakan N men berbad nen Berbaa en Victo Der Ketangko D historia Ka Ketaja K Ketaja K Rope Ia Wa I Detbark S asi Manajer	Serbuse in Sekole fanajien fanajien fanajien k sekole s Schole tenie S slain Ki- manple spats Se draven d skoleh/ nen Bal	Houring In During In Du	Di Nadrasa anah Teanav is Solotan pisi Solotan pisi Solotan pisi Solotan pi si Solotan pisi Solotan pisi Solotan pisi Solotan Aliy Anarasah Aliy Anarasah Teana Jana Jana Jana Jana Jana Jana Jana	I Jamawaya yah Al-Dae da Madras da Madras da Madras da Madras da Matana h da Kota P nanyah Al- basis Selo Selotan da senard Was si bar Man gitariban Ma	SIGAL I I Povinti del Rinya In Aliyat and Li sa alian Na an Geber Viccourt I alian Na MAN 11 alianen ponen B I Fendi Machae	oth STP MANAN For bate Alap II Made David David Di Made David David Di Made David Di Made David Di Made Di Mad	Invention EFERTA Aurol Annuel Recomm tower Union : Lower Union : Lower Union : Lower Union : Lower Invention - Annie : Annie :	keng Kaca anatuk 4) ah ama (4) ah ama (4) Jamat In Jamat In an Taan Aliyan NJ ma Kabuji ah Kabuji	enden Berek. 9 2, 210-229 suit mill best. 10 Problem Best. wijsten Kepen 2 anst Kooke sere Talbal wer Talbal	2000 k 2007 200	ern Tabethi k dosoh andigen Acta Manien unu Roposing U-BRAH anu Cakowaka	
Norman Den Son Manuel Name Anno 1 Son Control Son Con	115 1 - 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2 2	115 88 120 3 067 4 050 4 050 4 050 4 050 4 040 3 025 4 025 4 0	N Sent SWanyum Whote N Yest Whote N Yest Whote N Yest Washe A Route Artiste	He alson au Implemento Analisis Implemento Implemento Implemento Implemento Nanajement Triglasan Ma Penapata Penapata Penapata Penapata Penapata Penapata Penapata Penapata	i Managen el Manage dementasi dementasi dementasi dementasi si Manage Pentagiati najementa Managene Managene Managene	en Sekeleh II men Derback Kebijakan X Kebijakan X Metajakan X men berback entar k Pera Kebaka Kata Kebaka Kata Kebaka Kebi Kebaka Kebi Kebaka Kebi Kebaka Kebi Kebaka Kebi Kebaka Kebi	School In Seicele fang om Anne om Anne om Anne of School Darie School Darie School	Pesantas In Di Mad In Di Mad In Di Mad In Datan I Madasa I M	Di Nachasa saah Toonay is Solotan pisi Solotan pisi Solotan pisi Solotan pi si Solotan pisi Solotan pisi Solotan pisi Solotan pisi Solotan pisi Solotan Pisi adhasah Aliy Androach Aliy Androach Too anajemen Banaga pisipisi Solotan Pisipisi Solotan Pisipisi Solotan Pisipisi Solotan Solotan Pisipisi Solotan Pisipisi Solotan Pisipisi Solotan Pisipisi Solotan Solotan Pisipisi Solotan Pisipisi Solotan Solotan Pisipisi Solotan Pisipis	I Jamawaya yah Al-Ran da Madias da Madias da Madias da Madias da Madia Al-Ran Pa Jawa Manang Salar da Salar Man Salar Man Salar Man Salar Man Salar Man Salar Man Salar Man Salar Man	STOCK I I Powerk de Konge hi Aliget hi Aliget di Aliget and hi Aliget and hi Aliget and hi Aliget Maria Statut Maria Nachas Nachas Nachas	och STP MANAGAN ST	Invelie DEFINA and Amed Renew Development Development Development Development Development Development Statistics System (Missi Neg In Facto Masteries Development	keng Kaca anatuk 4) ah ama (Jaan Jamat In Jamat In an Tsana Aliyan NJ an Kabu Jam Stimu peri (MA)	enden Berek. 9 2, 210-229 suit mill best. 10 Problem Best. wijsten Kepen 2 anst Kooke sere Talbal wer Talbal	2000 k 2007 200	inn Thirthi k Isach Isach I Isach Manalen Ing Roper ing U-BBAH	

Figure 1. Searching Protocols in Harzing's Publish or Perish Software

After examining the title, there were two of the same articles in two different search results. The results after deducting the duplicates are 107 articles. The articles selected after this are only those published in research journals. It is done to filter quality because articles published in research journals have gone through peer review. Furthermore, 21 discoveries were excluded because it was in the form of student works of final projects. Furthermore, 75 articles did not meet the requirements, h-index > 0.00. In the end, there are 11 articles included in this literature review study. The literature search is described in more detail in PRISMA Flow, shown in Figure 2 below, adapted from ²³. The Figure 2. PRISMA Flow shows the outflow of actions from the different stages of the systematic review. The figure describes the number of identified article records, the articles included or excluded, and the reasons for exclusion.



Figure 2. PRISMA Flow

²³ Moher and others.

Participants and Settings

The research participants included in the literature review consisted of school committees, school principals, vice principals, teachers (²⁴ ²⁵, school employees, students ²⁶, ²⁷, ²⁸, ²⁹ and also the parents of the students. Furthermore, those in charge of school programs ³⁰ were also mentioned in the article. Some articles also included community leaders in their studies, such as ³¹ ³² (please refer to table 1).

The locations selected in this literature review are in Indonesia, mostly taking samples of places in the Provinces of

³⁰ Lilik Ardiansyah and Achmad Dardiri, Manajemen Budaya Sekolah Berbasis Pesantren Di Madrasah Tsanawiyah Ali Maksum, Sewon, Bantul, Yogyakarta', *Jurnal Pembangunan Pendidikan: Fondasi Dan Aplikasi*, 6.1 (2019), 50–58 https://doi.org/10.21831/jppfa.v6i1.22626>.

³¹ Ahmad Muhyani Rizalie, 'Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Untuk Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Di Sekolah Dan Madrasah Menengah Atas (Studi Multi Kasus Pada SMA Negeri 1, SMK Negeri 2 Dan MA Negeri 1 Kandangan Kabupaten Hulu Sungai Selatan)', *Jurnal Paradigma*, 11.2 (2016), 295–316.

³² Suryono and Raharja.

²⁴ Nuryanto Nuryanto, 'Peningkatan Mutu Madrasah Ibtidaiyah: School-Based Management Dan Kompetensi Guru Madrasah', *Elementary: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dasar*, 4.1 (2018), 21 <https://doi.org/10.32332/elementary.v4i1.1075>.

²⁵ Arif Ganda Nugroho and Latifah, 'Proses Pembelajaran Menggunakan Strategi Inkuiri Dalam Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah (MBS) Dengan Hasil Kepuasan Guru Di Madrasah Tsanawiyah Assalam Martapura', *AL- ULUM ILMU SOSIAL DAN HUMANIORA*, 8.2 (2022), 95–104.

²⁶ Aceng Jaelani and Moh Masnun, 'The Implementation of School Based Management in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah', *Al Ibtida: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru MI*, 6.2 (2019), 256 https://doi.org/10.24235/al.ibtida.snj.v6i2.3793>.

²⁷ Entin Dwi Herlina, 'Pelaksanaan Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Dalam Upaya Peningkatan Mutu Madrasah Tsanawiyah Di Mts Negeri Bonang Kabupaten Demak', *Educational Management*, 1.1 (2012), 2.

²⁸ M. Ainin, L. Kholidah, and A. sum, 'Eksplorasi Program Pembinaan Pelaksana Pendidikan Pendekatan School Based Management Pada Madrasah Tsanawiyah Kawasan Pinggiran, Pedesaan, Dan Terpencil Di Jawa Timur', Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran Universitas Negeri Malang, 20.1 (2013), 102–12.

²⁹ Yoyon Suryono and Setya Raharja, 'Pengkajian Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Di Sekolah Dasar Dan Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Di Propinsi Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta', *Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 2 (2003), 207–26.

Central Java, the Special Region of Yogyakarta, and East Java. Schools outside Java were sampled ³³ and ³⁴. The SBM system was considered a novelty in education, so the sampled respondents were academics who played a direct role in this system. But on the other hand, it is not only the academic community but the role of outside scholars, such as student guardians and community leaders, who play an essential role in the success of the SBM system whose study was conducted on school principals ³⁵, ³⁶, ³⁷³⁸, ³⁹, ⁴⁰. Sampling was also conducted in private and public schools ⁴¹. (See table 1)

Table 1. Participants'	Characteristics & Measuring Instrument
------------------------	--

				methods
	Male	Female	Total	
Masnun, 1 2019) 1	teachers, teachers with 463 s MI Salaf students	parents, MI Ash S tudents	hofiyah n 471	Qualitative Field research (interviews, observations, documents)

³³ Nugroho and Latifah.

³⁹ Herlina.

³⁴ Nuryanto.

³⁵ Jaelani and Masnun.

³⁶ Abdul Ghofir Muslim, 'Manajemen Sekolah Berbasis Pesantren Di Madrasah Tsanawiyah Al Iman Bulus Gebang Purworejo', *Media Manajemen Pendidikan*, 3.3 (2021), 374–83.

³⁷ Rizalie.

³⁸ Ardiansyah and Dardiri.

⁴⁰ Nugroho and Latifah.

⁴¹ Suryono and Raharja.

	Darticipants & Sotting	Moscuring
Researchers	Participants & Setting	Measuring instruments and
Researchers		methods
		methods
	students	
(Muslim,	3 teachers and 2 parents of	Qualitative
2021)	students	Interview
1.5		
(Suryono &	8 public Primary Madrasa	Quantitative
Raharja,	students, 4 Private Primary	Evaluative survey
2003)	Madrasa students	with a
	123 people, including school	questionnaire
	principals, deputy principals,	
	teachers, parents of students,	
	community leaders,	
	supervisors in government, from elements of	
	government, representatives	
	of organizations or	
	institutions, and also from the	
	Ministry of Religion	
(Ainin et al.,	Principal, school committee,	Quantitative
2013)	teacher	Multistage
		proportional
		cluster area
		purposive
		sampling
		technique
(Rizalie,	Principals, teachers,	Qualitative
2016)	counselors, administrators, curriculum developers,	Phenomenology
	parents, community, students	Constant

Researchers	Participants & Setting	Measuring instruments and
		methods
		comparative
	Principal, vice principal,	Qualitative
(Ardiansyah & Dardiri,	teacher, and school PIC	Interview
2019)	program	Documentation
		Observation
(Ulfah,	The survey was conducted on	Quantitative
2019)	100 people	Multiple linear
	4 school committees, 6 teachers and school	regression
	employees, 45 students, 45	Questionnaire
	parents	
(Nuryanto,	Teachers	Management
2018)		strategy
(Pasaribu,	Comparing SBM systems from	Qualitative
2017)	various countries	
(Herlina, 2012)	Head of school, head of	Qualitative
2012)	administrative staff, teachers, school staff, school	Explorative study
	committee	
(Nugroho &	Teachers	descriptive
Latifah, 2022)		Survey
2022)		observational
		Correlational
		Causal

Researchers	Participants & Setting	Measuring instruments and methods
		comparison

Measuring Instruments

Of the 11 articles in this literature review, 5 used qualitative methods for data collection, 3 used a quantitative approach, and others used mixed methods for data collection and analysis (see Table 1). In quantitative research ⁴² measuring the role of the principal in the SBM system based on answers to contextual questionnaires, furthermore, designing a questionnaire to assess the importance of educational autonomy in managing schoolbased management. Three other papers ⁴³ measure through a questionnaire regarding the implementation of SBM in the formal education system.

Several studies using qualitative methods conducted indepth interviews, observations of people who played a direct role in implementing SBM MBS ⁴⁴ ⁴⁵ ⁴⁶, and additional literature or documentation study data ⁴⁷ ⁴⁸. Meanwhile, a survey was added for teachers and school staff ⁴⁹ ⁵⁰ to examine their participation and role in SBM activities. Furthermore, ⁵¹ ⁵² also interviewed students and community leaders in this study. Meanwhile ⁵³ used a

⁴² Muslim; Herlina; Ardiansyah and Dardiri; Jaelani and Masnun; Rizalie.

⁴³ Suryono and Raharja; Ulfah; Ainin, Kholidah, and sum.

⁴⁴ Jaelani and Masnun.

⁴⁵ Muslim.

⁴⁶ Ainin, Kholidah, and sum.

⁴⁷ Ardiansyah and Dardiri.

⁴⁸ Pasaribu.

⁴⁹ Suryono and Raharja.

⁵⁰ Nugroho and Latifah.

⁵¹ Suryono and Raharja.

⁵² Rizalie.

⁵³ Pasaribu.

sequential literature study from previous research which described the implementation of SBM in schools in several countries.

Practical Experience of School-Based Management Development in Madrasah

Based on the process review literature, SBM is closely related to leadership in practice. Discussions about the principal's leadership mostly appear in all reviewed articles. The principal can be said to be a key figure in driving the development and progress of the school. As mentioned in the selected papers, the key to successful madrasa management is always associated with the madrasa principal's expertise in leading, coaching, motivating, and planning ⁵⁴. Apart from being managerial, the role of the principal in SBM is also directed at improving the quality of students through holistic educational programs to serve all the needs of students in schools ⁵⁵.

Furthermore, the teacher figure is a topic often appearing in the articles reviewed. Teachers are considered one of the factors supporting the success of school-based management ⁵⁶. Although the teacher is not the only determining factor for success in education, the teacher is an important figure in the learning process. Teachers are said to be qualified if they have knowledge, attitudes, and teaching competency standards programmed by the government in the form of teacher certification ⁵⁷.

To achieve success in managing a school, several authors of the articles reviewed agree that schools must invite all school members (teachers, students, employees) and the community (student parents, community leaders, scientists, entrepreneurs, and so on) to participate in SBM. The increase in participation is by

⁵⁴ Ulfah; Ardiansyah and Dardiri; Pasaribu; Jaelani and Masnun; Ainin, Kholidah, and sum; Rizalie.

⁵⁵ Muslim; Pasaribu; Ainin, Kholidah, and sum; Rizalie; Ardiansyah and Dardiri.

⁵⁶ Herlina; Muslim; Nuryanto; Rizalie; Nugroho and Latifah.

⁵⁷ Muslim; Nuryanto; Nugroho and Latifah.

creating an open and democratic environment. Both school members and the community are encouraged to be directly involved in providing education, starting from decision-making, implementation, and evaluation of education ⁵⁸.

Madrasas, as educational institutions, have different characteristics and needs. Several authors in this article agree that a needs analysis is crucial ⁵⁹. It aims to determine the difference between the target and the learning needs of students. In addition, a needs analysis is also carried out to obtain synchronous and credible information so that later schools can plan and prepare supporting resources carefully ⁶⁰.

The implementation of SBM in both public schools and madrasas, in general, has the same goal: improving education quality, which leads to improved school management and operations. Furthermore, SBM also creates conditions that can develop teaching and learning processes. Moreover, the output of education in madrasas is more specific in teaching students to be later able to live life without losing their spiritual roots.

THE CONCLUSION

The results of this literature review found that the characteristics of the participants and settings varied widely. There are at least nine groups of participants in this literature review research: school committees, principals, vice principals, teachers, school admin staff, students, parents, academics, and school program managers. Mostly, the articles analyzed in this literature review are studies that were mainly conducted on the island of Java. Meanwhile, some studies have also been shown outside the island of Java. Temporarily, the measuring instruments for the school-based management articles in this literature review are

⁵⁸ Nuryanto; Rizalie; Ainin, Kholidah, and sum; Jaelani and Masnun; Herlina; Ardiansyah and Dardiri; Muslim.

⁵⁹ Nuryanto; Pasaribu; Ardiansyah and Dardiri; Muslim; Ainin, Kholidah, and sum.

⁶⁰ Pasaribu; Ardiansyah and Dardiri.

interviews guide for qualitative research, usually related to implementation. In comparison, the questionnaire is used in various pieces that use a qualitative approach, for example, to measure impact.

Based on the results of the discussion, it can be concluded that there were mainly four points that should be underlined from reviewed articles: (1) the principal's leadership is essential in SBM to achieve school goals, (2) the teacher as SBM supporting factors must have knowledge, skills, and attitudes as well as have sufficient insight and are willing to use their potential optimally, (3) encourage the participation of school members and the community to be directly involved in providing education, and (4) needs analysis should carry out at the outset to assist planning and managing resource availability.

Recommendation

This literature review is limited to research published in 2013-2022, defining other variables that may be related to the management status of private or public schools and the location of schools in urban or remote villages, which have not been discussed in this article. For this reason, research published over a range of years or from different databases (e.g., Scopus, Web of Science, Science Live, Directory of Open Access Journals, etc.) is needed to get a more comprehensive picture. It is hoped that the results of this literature review can be used as factual considerations in implementing SBM in public and private schools to implement a management strategy to improve the quality of education following the conditions of the school and the resources it has.

In addition, this research can be used as a basis or recommended for further research interested in studying schoolbased management. In addition, a broader search involving these keywords is required to make the results different and increase new information. Religion-based schools, namely Madrasas, in the current era of autonomy are in dire need of reform. In the context of growing human resources, a school management model provides excellent hope for schools to develop and improve their skills according to school conditions. Therefore, the results of implementing SBM in all schools cannot be the same. However, all schools have the same opportunity to become quality schools.

THE BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abelha, Marta, Sandra Fernandes, Diana Mesquita, Filipa Seabra, and Ana Teresa Ferreira-Oliveira, 'Graduate Employability and Competence Development in Higher Education—A Systematic Literature Review Using PRISMA', *Sustainability*, 12.15 (2020), 5900
- Ainin, M., L. Kholidah, and A. sum, 'Eksplorasi Program Pembinaan Pelaksana Pendidikan Pendekatan School Based Management Pada Madrasah Tsanawiyah Kawasan Pinggiran, Pedesaan, Dan Terpencil Di Jawa Timur', *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran Universitas Negeri Malang*, 20.1 (2013), 102–12
- Alawiyah, Faridah, 'Pendidikan Madrasah Di Indonesia', Jurnal Aspirasi: Jurnal Masalah-Masalah Sosial, 5.1 (2014), 51–58
- Ardiansyah, Lilik, and Achmad Dardiri, 'Manajemen Budaya Sekolah Berbasis Pesantren Di Madrasah Tsanawiyah Ali Maksum, Sewon, Bantul, Yogyakarta', Jurnal Pembangunan Pendidikan: Fondasi Dan Aplikasi, 6.1 (2019), 50–58 <https://doi.org/10.21831/jppfa.v6i1.22626>
- Arismunandar, Arismunandar, Nurhikmah H Nurhikmah H, and Widya Karmila Sari Achmad, 'Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah' (Badan Penerbit Universitas Negeri Makassar, 2015)
- Aziz, Ahmad Zaini, 'Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah: Alternatif Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Madrasah', *El-Tarbawi*, 8.1 (2015), 69–92
- Dacholfany, M Ihsan, 'Inisiasi Strategi Manajemen Lembaga Pendidikan Islam Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Sumber Daya Manusia Islami Di Indonesia Dalam Menghadapi Era Globalisasi', At-Tajdid: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Pemikiran

Islam, 1.01 (2017), 1–13 <https://doi.org/10.24127/att.v1i01.330>

- Devi, Aulia Diana, 'Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Dalam Meningkatkan Kualitas Di Sekolah Menengah Pertama', *Edukatif: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 3.3 (2021), 963–71
- Hadziq, Abdulloh, 'Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah (School Based Management) Dalam Mewujudkan Sekolah Efektif (Studi Kasus Di Mts Nu Sabilul Muttaqin Jepang Mejobo Kudus)', *Quality*, 4.2 (2017), 351–71
- Hafid, Abdul, 'MODEL MANAJEMEN BERBASIS SEKOLAH Oleh: Abdul Hafid *', *Lentera Pendidikan*, 14.2 (2011), 189–201
- Hakim, Muhammad Nur, 'Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Dalam Mewujudkan Sekolah Islam Unggulan', *Nidhomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 1.2 (2016), 104–14 <https://doi.org/10.31538/NDH.V1I2.7>
- Handoyo, Karseno, Mudhofir Mudhofir, and Maslamah Maslamah, 'Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Madrasah Dalam Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Di Madrasah', Jurnal Ilmiah Ekonomi Islam, 7.1 (2021), 321–32
- Herlina, Entin Dwi, 'Pelaksanaan Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Dalam Upaya Peningkatan Mutu Madrasah Tsanawiyah Di Mts Negeri Bonang Kabupaten Demak', *Educational Management*, 1.1 (2012), 2
- Jaelani, Aceng, and Moh Masnun, 'The Implementation of School Based Management in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah', *Al Ibtida: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru MI*, 6.2 (2019), 256 <https://doi.org/10.24235/al.ibtida.snj.v6i2.3793>
- Mbuik, Heryon Bernard, 'Pengaruh Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah Terhadap Penerapan Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Di SD', Indonesian Journal of Primary Education, 3.2 (2019), 28–37
- Moher, David, Alessandro Liberati, Jennifer Tetzlaff, and Douglas G. Altman, 'Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses: The PRISMA Statement', *BMJ (Online)*, 339.7716 (2009), 332–36 <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.b2535>

Muhammad, Sahril, and Mardia Rahman, 'Implementasi

Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Untuk Meningkatkan Mutu Sekolah Dasar Islam Insan Kamil Bacan Kabupaten Halmahera Selatan', *Edukasi*, 15.1 (2017)

- Muslim, Abdul Ghofir, 'Manajemen Sekolah Berbasis Pesantren Di Madrasah Tsanawiyah Al Iman Bulus Gebang Purworejo', *Media Manajemen Pendidikan*, 3.3 (2021), 374–83
- Nugroho, Arif Ganda, and Latifah, 'Proses Pembelajaran Menggunakan Strategi Inkuiri Dalam Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah (MBS) Dengan Hasil Kepuasan Guru Di Madrasah Tsanawiyah Assalam Martapura', *AL– ULUM ILMU SOSIAL DAN HUMANIORA*, 8.2 (2022), 95–104
- Nurriqi, Afida, 'Karakteristik Pendidikan Agama Islam Di Madrasah Prespektif Kebijakan Pendidikan', *BINTANG*, 3.1 (2021), 124– 41
- Nuryanto, Nuryanto, 'Peningkatan Mutu Madrasah Ibtidaiyah: School-Based Management Dan Kompetensi Guru Madrasah', *Elementary: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dasar*, 4.1 (2018), 21 <https://doi.org/10.32332/elementary.v4i1.1075>
- Pasaribu, Asbin, 'Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Dalam Pencapaian Tujuan Pendidikan Nasional Di Madrasah', *EduTech: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Dan Ilmu Sosial*, 3.1 (2017), 12-34

<http://jurnal.umsu.ac.id/index.php/edutech/article/view/984>

- Patras, Yuyun Elizabeth, Agus Iqbal, Papat Papat, and Yulia Rahman, 'Meningkatkan Kualitas Pendidikan Melalui Kebijakan Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Dan Tantangannya', *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 7.2 (2019), 800–807 <https://doi.org/10.33751/jmp.v7i2.1329>
- Priatna, Tedi, 'Demography of Madrasah Diniyah Takmiliyah and Revitalizing the Institutional Function of Islamic Education', Journal of Southwest Jiaotong University, 55.1 (2020)
- Rante, Susanna Vonny N, and Harmelia Tulak, 'Far from Expectation: A Systematic Literature Review of Inclusive Education in Indonesia', *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 2020

Rizalie, Ahmad Muhyani, `Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis

Sekolah Untuk Peningkatan Mutu Pendidikan Di Sekolah Dan Madrasah Menengah Atas (Studi Multi Kasus Pada SMA Negeri 1, SMK Negeri 2 Dan MA Negeri 1 Kandangan Kabupaten Hulu Sungai Selatan)['], *Jurnal Paradigma*, 11.2 (2016), 295–316

- Samsidar, Dra, 'Peran Komite Sekolah Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan', *Al-Muaddib: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial & Keislaman*, 3.1 (2018), 1–15 <https://doi.org/10.31604/muaddib.v1i1.364>
- Saputra, Indra, and Riska Ahmad, 'Penerapan Desentralisasi Pendidikan Pada Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Dari Pola Lama (Sebelum Desentralisasi Pendidikan) Ke Pola Baru (Era Desentralisasi)', *Keguruan : Jurnal Penelitian, Pemikiran, Dan Pengabdian*, 10.2 (2022), 66–70
- Sekolah, Pengawas, and Muda Tingkat, 'PENTINGNYA OTONOMI PENDIDIKAN DALAM UPAYA MENINGKATKAN MUTU PENDIDIKAN DI INDONESIA Pendidikan Di Daerahnya Sendiri . Hal Ini Dimaksudkan Sebagai Pemberian Sebagian Wewenang Pusat Dan Standarisasi Nasional . Kerja Tenaga Pendidikan Serta Menciptakan Suatu', 1.1 (2022), 151–61
- Seriyanti, Nela, Syarwani Ahmad, and Destiniar Destiniar, 'Pengaruh Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah Dan Peran Komite Sekolah Terhadap Keberhasilan Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah', *JMKSP (Jurnal Manajemen, Kepemimpinan, Dan Supervisi Pendidikan)*, 6.1 (2020), 15–33
- Suryono, Yoyon, and Setya Raharja, 'Pengkajian Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Di Sekolah Dasar Dan Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Di Propinsi Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta', *Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 2 (2003), 207–26
- Suyitno, Suyitno, 'Pengaruh Keterampilan Manajerial Kepala Sekolah Dan Peran Komite Terhadap Efektivitas Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah', Jurnal Basicedu, 5.3 (2021), 1564–76
- Tawa, Angelika Bule, 'Kebijakan Pendidikan Nasional Dan Implementasinya Pada Sekola Dasar', *SAPA - Jurnal Kateketik Dan Pastoral*, 4.2 (2019), 107–17 <https://doi.org/10.53544/sapa.v4i2.82>

Turmidzi, Imam, 'Pengelolaan Pendidikan Bermutu Di Madrasah',

Tarbawi: Jurnal Pemikiran Dan Pendidikan Islam, 4.2 (2021), 165–81

- Ulfah, Elok Maria, 'Pengaruh Peran Kepemimpinan Kepala Sekolah Terhadap Implementasi Manajemen Berbasis Sekolah Pada Madrasah Tsanawiyah Swasta Mamba' ul Ulum Di Kecamatan Mojoagung, Kabupaten Jombang', *Al-Ibrah*, Vol. 4 No.5 (2019), 55
- Welch, Vivian, Mark Petticrew, Jennifer Petkovic, David Moher, Elizabeth Waters, Howard White, and others, 'Extending the PRISMA Statement to Equity-Focused Systematic Reviews (PRISMA-E 2012): Explanation and Elaboration', *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*, 70 (2016), 68–89
- Xiao, Yu, and Maria Watson, 'Guidance on Conducting a Systematic Literature Review', Journal of Planning Education and Research, 39.1 (2019), 93–112 <https://doi.org/10.1177/0739456X17723971>