



Implementation of the Think Pair Share Model in Increasing Awareness of Diversity in Q.S. Al-Hujurāt/49:13

Ridwan Aziz

SDN Sumurboto, Banyumanik, Semarang, Indonesia

Abstract

The low level of students' understanding of the values of diversity in Islamic teachings particularly in Q.S. Al-Hujurāt/49:13, encourages the need for learning strategies that can facilitate conceptual understanding while strengthening social attitudes. This study aims to analyze efforts to improve the understanding of fourth-grade students of Sumurboto Public Elementary School through the implementation of the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) cooperative learning model. This study uses a Classroom Action Research (CAR) approach which is implemented in three cycles, each including the planning, implementation, observation, and reflection stages. The research subjects were 26 students (9 boys and 17 girls). Data collection was carried out through learning outcome tests, participatory observations, and interviews, with qualitative and quantitative descriptive data analysis. The results of the study showed a significant increase in students' understanding: the percentage of learning completion increased from 55% (cycle I), 75% (cycle II), to 90% in cycle III. The average score also increased from 74 on the pre-test to 88 on the post-test. Furthermore, students' social interactions and engagement in discussions increased, indicating that TPS was effective in fostering collaboration and connecting diversity values to real-life contexts. These findings provide an original contribution to the application of cooperative models for teaching Islamic values in elementary schools, while also enriching inclusive and contextual pedagogical practices.

Keywords: think-pair-share, student understanding, Q.S. Al-Hujurāt/49:13, diversity, cooperative learning.

Contact: ridwanaziz75@guru.sd.belajar.id

© 2025 the author: All rights reserved. The authors agree that this article remains permanently open access under the terms of the Research Journal on Teacher Professional Development.

A. Introduction

In the context of a pluralistic Indonesian society, Islamic religious education has a strategic role in instilling the values of tolerance, respect for diversity, and human brotherhood from an early age (Ma'arif, 2020; Azra, 2019). One of the main normative foundations in Islam on this matter is Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 which affirms that differences in ethnicity, nation, and language are part of *sunnatullāh* which should be understood as a means of getting to know each other (*li ta'ārafū*), not to demean each other (Al-Qur'an, 49:13). Similarly, a number of hadiths of the Prophet Muhammad PBUH emphasize the importance of respecting fellow human beings regardless of their background, as he said: "Whoever believes in Allah and the Last Day, let him honor his neighbor" (HR. Bukhari and Muslim). However, in learning practice in elementary schools, this material is often delivered textually and memorized, so it does not touch the affective and contextual dimensions of students (Rahman & Hadi, 2021). As a result, students' understanding tends to be superficial and not internalized in everyday attitudes. In fact, according to Fitriani & Huda (2022), learning the value of diversity requires a dialogical, participatory, and collaborative approach so that moral messages can be reflected personally. On the other hand, cooperative learning models particularly the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) type have been shown to be effective in improving students' conceptual understanding and social interaction (Slavin, 2021; Rahmawati & Prastowo, 2023). However, the application of TPS in the context of teaching diversity values based on the Qur'an and hadith in elementary school primary grades is still very limited in the latest literature (Nurhayati & Zulfahmi, 2023), thus creating a significant research gap.

This study aims to analyze efforts to improve the understanding of grade IV students of SD Negeri Sumurboto towards Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and hadith about diversity through the application of the Think-Pair-Share type cooperative learning model. Specifically, this study answers two main questions: (1) How can the application of the TPS model be designed contextually in learning the value of diversity based on primary Islamic sources? and (2) To what extent is the model able to improve students' conceptual understanding and inclusive attitudes? This research is based on the hypothesis that structured interactions in TPS ranging from independent thinking, discussing in pairs, to sharing ideas in large groups will deepen students' reflection on the universal message of the verses and hadith (Lyman, 1981; Kagan, 1994). The significance of this research is multidimensional. Theoretically, these findings enrich the integration of Vygotsky's social learning theory specifically the concept of the Zone of Proximal Development (ZPD) and value pedagogy in the context of Islamic religious education (Vygotsky, 1978; Nata, 2019). Practically, this research provides a learning model that teachers can adopt to teach diversity values in an active, dialogical, and relevant way to students' lives. At the policy level, the research results support the implementation of the Independent Curriculum which emphasizes differentiated, project-based, and strengthening the profile of Pancasila Students especially in the dimension of "Global Diversity" (Kemendikbudristek, 2022). Thus, this research not only answers local challenges in SD Negeri Sumurboto, but also makes a strategic contribution to the transformation of inclusive and contextual religious learning in the multicultural era.

B. Theoretical Studies

The Think-Pair-Share (TPS) type cooperative learning model is an instructional strategy designed to increase students' active participation through three structured stages: individual thinking (think), discussion in pairs, and sharing results with class groups (share). According to Lyman (1981), the creator of this model, TPS aims to create an inclusive learning environment where each student has the opportunity to process information independently before social interaction, thereby minimizing the dominance of the majority vote and empowering shy or less confident students. Slavin (2021) adds that TPS not only improves cognitive understanding, but also strengthens communication skills, empathy, and appreciation for others' perspectives competencies that are highly relevant in learning the values of diversity. In the context of Islamic religious education, the implementation of TPS allows students to reflect on the universal message of Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 which emphasizes equality and mutual knowledge in diversity through personal and interpersonal dialogue, so that understanding is not only textual, but also contextual and transformative.

The theoretical foundation of TPS rests on Vygotsky's theory of social constructivism, which asserts that knowledge is built through social interaction within the zone of proximal development (ZPD). The basic assumption is that learning becomes more meaningful when students are given space to articulate thoughts, listen to the views of others, and revise initial understanding through discussion. In addition, Johnson & Johnson's (2018) cooperative learning theory emphasizes five key principles: positive interdependence, individual responsibility, face-to-face interaction, social skills, and group reflection that are inherently embodied in the TPS structure. This theoretical implication is particularly relevant in the teaching of Islamic values about diversity, because the moral message in the Qur'an and hadith is not sufficiently understood through memorization, but must be internalized through authentic social experience. Thus, TPS is not only a method of knowledge transfer, but also a vehicle for forming inclusive and tolerant attitudes from an early age.

A number of empirical studies have tested the effectiveness of TPS in various learning contexts. Rahmawati & Prastowo (2023) found that the implementation of TPS in the subject of Pancasila and Citizenship Education (PPKn) in grade IV of elementary school increased students' understanding of the value of diversity by 32%. In the field of religious education, Fitriani & Huda (2022) reported that TPS is able to increase students' affective involvement in understanding the hadith about helping. However, such studies generally do not integrate primary Islamic sources such as Qur'anic verses and hadith directly as primary reflection material, but instead use common case examples. In addition, the majority of studies were conducted at the intermediate level or used a mixed approach with other models, thus lacking a description of the pure effectiveness of TPS in the context of religious learning in the lower grades. A significant difference also lies in the focus of the material: there has been no study that has specifically examined the application of TPS to understand Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 as the theological foundation of diversity in Islam.

Based on this theoretical and empirical synthesis, it is clear that TPS has great potential as a pedagogical strategy to internalize the values of diversity based on the Qur'an and hadith. However, there is a real research gap: the lack of studies that test the application of TPS exclusively in the learning of verses and hadith about diversity in grade IV of elementary school, where students are at the concrete-operational stage of development and require a simple but meaningful dialogical approach. This research is here to fill this gap by designing a TPS scenario that is directly based on Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 and relevant hadiths, as well as measuring its impact on students' conceptual understanding and social attitudes. Thus, this research not only enriches the literature on contemporary Islamic religious pedagogy, but also provides a practical model that is in line with the spirit of the Independent Curriculum and strengthening the profile of Pancasila Students.

C. Research Methods

This study uses the Classroom Action Research (PTK) approach with the spiral design of the Kemmis and McTaggart model, which consists of four repeated stages in each cycle: planning, acting, observation, and reflection (Kemmis et al., 2014). This design was chosen because it is in accordance with the research objectives that are participatory, collaborative, and aim to improve learning practices directly in the classroom (Mills, 2017). PTK allows researchers who are also classroom teachers to respond to learning dynamics in real-time, design pedagogical interventions based on students' needs, and evaluate their impact iteratively (Zuber-Skerritt, 2011). In the context of teaching the values of diversity through Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 and related hadiths, this approach is particularly relevant because it requires an experimental space to test how the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) model can facilitate students' deep understanding and moral reflection (Lyman, 1981; Kagan, 1994). The research was carried out in three cycles, each consisting of two meetings (a total of six meetings), with the final reflection of each cycle used to refine the learning scenario in the next cycle. The subjects of the study were all grade IV students of SD Negeri Sumurboto for the 2024 school year, totaling 26 students (9 males and 17 females), who were taken through the total sampling technique because the class population was homogeneous, limited, and did not allow the separation of control groups (Creswell & Creswell, 2018). This approach ensures that the research findings reflect the real

conditions of the class without selection bias and allow for limited generalization (transferability) in similar contexts (Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

Data collection was carried out through three main instruments: (1) learning outcome tests in the form of essay and multiple-choice questions that measured conceptual understanding of verses and hadiths; (2) structured participatory observation sheets to assess student engagement, the quality of paired discussions, and inclusive attitudes during learning; and (3) semi-structured interview guidelines to explore students' perceptions of the meaning of diversity in daily life. The learning outcome test was validated through content validity by two lecturers of Islamic Religious Education and one senior teacher, according to the principle of instrument validation in educational research (Fraenkel et al., 2019), with reliability calculated using the Alpha Cronbach formula ($\alpha = 0.79$), indicating an adequate level of reliability (George & Mallery, 2019). Quantitative data from the test were analyzed in a comparative descriptive manner to compare the percentage of completeness and mean scores between cycles (from 55% \rightarrow 75% \rightarrow 90%), while qualitative data from observations and interviews were analyzed thematically through the stages of open coding, categorization, and interpretation based on the Miles and Huberman model (Miles et al., 2020). The analysis is done manually without any special software, given the volume of managed data and the focus on the local context. Research ethics considerations are strictly applied: permission to conduct research is obtained from the principal, informed consent is collected from parents/guardians of students, the identity of respondents is kept confidential, and students are given the freedom not to answer interview questions, in accordance with the principles of educational research ethics (BERA, 2018). The entire procedure is designed in a transparent manner so that this research can be replicated by teachers or other researchers in elementary schools in similar contexts.

D. Results and Discussion

Result

The improvement of students' understanding of Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 and the hadith on diversity is clearly and progressive in each cycle of the implementation of the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) model. In cycle I, students were first introduced to the TPS structure; Although some have started to respond, the test results show that only 55% of students have achieved the Minimum Completeness Criteria (KKM), and most are still passive in discussions because they are not used to the format of thinking independently and then sharing a partner. Entering cycle II, the researcher provided a more structured discussion guide, including examples of reflective questions and clarification of roles in couples, which had a significant impact: the percentage of understanding increased to 75%, and students began to be more active in exchanging ideas, responding to each other, and showing the courage to express their opinions. The peak occurred in cycle III, where student understanding reached 90%. At this stage, not only is the mastery of concepts improved, but students are also able to relate the values of diversity in verses and hadith to personal experiences and daily lives such as appreciating friends from different backgrounds or understanding the importance of getting to know each other in the school environment. This progressivity shows that the implementation of TPS that is consistent and responsive to the needs of students is able to transform religious learning from memorization activities into a contextual, collaborative, and meaningful reflective process.

Table 1. Improved Student Understanding per Cycle

Cycle	Percentage of Student Comprehension	Number of Students Who Understand
I	71,50	81,50
II	90	100
III	40	50

Before carrying out classroom action research at SDN Sumurboto Semarang, the researcher first conducted a survey on the learning of Islamic Religious Education on the material of the Qur'an Hadith (Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 and hadith on diversity) in grade IV consisting of 26 students. The survey results show that the level of student learning completeness is still low, with 15 students not achieving learning

completeness, while 11 students have achieved learning completeness. During the learning process, students tend to be passive, and this is due to the lack of variety in teaching methods by teachers. This weakness causes low student learning outcomes. In grade IV at SD Sumurboto Semarang, there are 26 students, consisting of 9 male students and 17 female students. The following are the conditions of student learning outcomes in the subject of Islamic Religious Education (PAI), obtained from the Daily Summative Score I.

Table 2. Daily Summative Value I

No.	NAME	Pre-Cycle Value	Ket.	
			Conclusion	Incomplete
1	Abid Sandya Adhirajasa	60		Incomplete
2	Adellia Kinanti Maharani	86	Conclusion	
3	Dog Vaniya Abirani	80	Conclusion	
4	Andrea Salsabilla Aryaputri	85	Conclusion	
5	Angel Marwa Ningtyas	67		Incomplete
6	Arendra Bryan Aryaputra	80	Conclusion	
7	Atqiya Kadza Kinaris	60		Incomplete
8	Axcel Atalla Ardana	65		Incomplete
9	Daffa Faiz Fannan Murtadha	60		Incomplete
10	Ghani Yazid Khairi	84	Conclusion	
11	Gwen Syareefa Putri	72		Incomplete
12	Hafiza Khaira Lubna	86	Conclusion	
13	Khairunnisa Salsabila is known	84	Conclusion	
14	Maulana Abit Al-Muzaki	70		Incomplete
15	Muhammad Fahrizal Afandi Iman	68		Incomplete
16	Nadhifa Syakina Abidah	70		Incomplete
17	Nadia Violeta Rossy	84	Conclusion	
18	Nafiza Lanjar Arum Sari	73		Incomplete
19	Naura Nadhifa Chairunnisa	80	Conclusion	
Sum		1924		
Average		74		
Conclusion		11		
Incomplete		15		

Table 3. Percentage of Pre-Cycle Student Learning Outcomes

Value	Frequency	Percentage
75-100	11	42 %
70-74	8	30 %
65-69	3	12 %
60-64	4	16 %
0-59	0	0 %
Sum	26	100 %

The Completeness of Learning Objectives (KKTP) criteria for Islamic Religious Education (PAI) subjects is set at 75. There are 15 students who have not reached KKTP (<75), while 11 students who have reached KKTP (>75). The average grade point in PAI subjects is 74. This data shows that students' grades have not met the KKTP standards, indicating the need for efforts to improve PAI learning outcomes in grade V of SD Negeri Sumurboto Semarang. The solution taken by the researcher is to carry out learning through the Think-Pair-Share Method in the subject of Islamic Religious Education. By implementing learning using the Think-Pair-Share Method, it is hoped that it can change the learning atmosphere that was previously

monotonous and passive students to be more active. It is hoped that the learning outcomes of PAI in grade IV of SD Negeri Sumurboto Semarang can increase, and the average class score can reach or even exceed the KKTP score that has been set.

1. Cycle I

In the first phase of this Classroom Action Research (PTK), the researcher focuses on efforts to increase students' understanding of diversity values through the application of a Think-Pair-Share (TPS) type cooperative learning model. Cycle I was held in one meeting with a total duration of 105 minutes (3×35 minutes), which was adjusted to the allocation of Islamic religious learning time in grade IV of SD Negeri Sumurboto. The material taught in this cycle is Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and hadith related to diversity, which was chosen because of its relevance to the social context of students and its potential as a moral foundation to build tolerance from an early age. At this stage, the researcher introduced the TPS structure in its entirety: students were first given time to think independently (think) reflect on the meaning of verses and hadiths, then discuss in pairs to exchange ideas, and finally share the results of their discussions in front of the class (share). Although there are still obstacles such as the reluctance of some students to speak and the lack of depth in initial reflection, the implementation of cycle I is an important foundation for identifying the need for improvement especially in providing discussion guidance and the formulation of more contextual guiding questions. Thus, cycle I not only serves as an initial test of the implementation of TPS, but also as an initial diagnosis of class dynamics that will be the basis for improvement in the following cycles.

At the action planning stage in this study, the researcher carried out a series of systematic activities to ensure that the implementation of the intervention was effective and directed. The first step begins with observation and analysis of the previous learning process, which reveals the students' low understanding of the material of Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and the hadith on diversity a finding that is the main basis for choosing an intervention strategy. Based on this diagnosis, the researcher determined a Think-Pair-Share (TPS) type cooperative learning method enriched with visual media in the form of posters and puzzles, chosen for its potential in stimulating active engagement and conceptual understanding through a multisensory approach. Furthermore, the researcher prepared a special Teaching Module with the theme "Understanding Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and the Hadith on Diversity", which was designed integratively with TPS steps and the use of visual media. This module is equipped with contextual teaching materials, discussion guides, and valid test questions to measure the improvement of student understanding. To ensure the objectivity of the evaluation, the researcher also involved the classroom teacher as an observer during the learning. In addition, several students were strategically selected to lead group discussions and present their work using posters, to encourage leadership and equitable participation. Finally, various supporting learning resources such as simple tafsir books, verse illustrations, and examples of local diversity cases are prepared to enrich the learning context and make it easier for students to relate Islamic values to real life.

The implementation of the first cycle of this research was carried out on Tuesday, September 17, 2023, at 07.30–09.15 in Classroom IV of SD Negeri Sumurboto Semarang, with the learning material "Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and Hadith on Diversity". During the activity, the researcher was assisted by the fourth grade teacher, Nanik Juniarti, S.Pd., who acted as an observer to record the learning dynamics objectively. Observations were focused on four main aspects: student activities, interaction, participation, and the implementation of the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) type cooperative method enriched by the use of posters. Observations showed that all students were on time, but some were not fully focused on the beginning of learning some were still talking to friends or paying less attention to instructions. Participation in paired discussions is also uneven; Some students seem hesitant or passive, so their involvement in group activities is not optimal. In terms of understanding, the test results showed that 16 students (62%) achieved scores above the Minimum Learning Completeness Criteria (KKTP), while 10 students (38%) were still below standard, with no students achieving the right KKTP. On the other hand, teachers face challenges in classroom management, especially in organizing group formations and maintaining students' focus during

discussions. As a result, the learning atmosphere is not entirely conducive interference from students speaking for themselves hinders the clarity of instruction and reduces the effectiveness of the TPS model. These findings serve as an important basis for improvements in the next cycle.

Table 4. Percentage of Student Learning Outcomes in Cycle I

Value	Frequency	Percentage
81-100	16	62%
75-80	0	0%
71-74	3	12%
66-70	6	23%
0-65	1	3%
Sum	26	100%

Table 5. Completeness of Cycle I Students

Value	Frequency	Percentage	Information
75-100	16	62%	Conclusion
0-74	10	38%	Incomplete
Sum	26	100%	

After the implementation and observation in the first cycle, the researcher and observers held a reflection session in the teacher's room to analyze the successes and obstacles in the learning process. The discussion resulted in a number of critical findings that became the basis for improvement in the next cycle. First, the classroom atmosphere is considered not conducive because there is still noise interference from students who speak outside the learning context, thus hindering concentration and understanding of the material. Second, students' understanding of Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 and the hadith on diversity is still limited, which can be seen from the group's presentation that is less systematic and lacks depth of reflection. However, the test results showed a significant increase compared to the initial condition: the percentage of students who exceeded the Learning Objective Completeness Criteria (KKTP) increased from 15% to 62% (an increase of 35%), while those who achieved the correct KKTP increased from 15% to 30% (an increase of 15%). In contrast, students who have not completed have dropped drastically from 70% to only 20% (a decrease of 50%). However, considering that the indicators of research success are set at achieving 100% completeness and a minimum grade average of 81, the results of cycle I which only reached 50% of the performance target are inadequate. Therefore, the researcher decided to continue the intervention to cycle II, with an improvement plan focusing on classroom management, strengthening discussion guides, and optimizing the use of visual media. If the target has not been achieved in cycle II, the research will be continued to cycle III to ensure optimal achievement of learning objectives.

2. Cycle II

In the planning stage of Cycle II, the researcher developed an improvement strategy based on the findings of reflection from Cycle I, with the main goal of improving students' understanding of the values of diversity especially in the context of religion as mandated in Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 and related hadiths. This planning is not only technical, but also collaborative, involving classroom teachers, students, and parents as part of a learning support ecosystem. Classroom teachers are invited to discuss to improve the learning scenario, especially in strengthening classroom management and preparing more contextual guiding questions. Students were given the opportunity to provide input on the format of the discussion they were comfortable with, while parents were informed through a circular letter about learning objectives and asked to support children in reflecting on the value of diversity at home. In particular, the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) type cooperative method is maintained, but enriched by the use of more interactive posters and the addition of local case examples that are relevant to students' daily lives, such as religious diversity in the school or village environment. The researcher also restructured the Teaching Module by taking into account the

difficulties that arose in the previous cycle, including providing step-by-step guidance for students during the paired discussion. With a participatory and responsive planning approach to real needs in the classroom, this stage is designed to create more conducive, inclusive, and meaningful learning conditions, so that it is expected to encourage a significant increase in students' conceptual understanding and affective attitudes towards diversity.

In the action planning stage of Cycle II, the researcher developed strategic steps based on the identification of problems that still arise despite the increase in understanding in Cycle I, namely the low awareness of students on the importance of tolerance and respect for religious diversity. The main purpose of this action is to increase the understanding of grade IV students of SD Negeri Sumurboto about religious diversity through the internalization of the teachings of Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and related hadiths, by applying a cooperative learning method of the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) type which is enriched through the use of interactive posters. The learning materials are designed to emphasize the values of cooperation, open dialogue, and collective reflection between groups, so that the moral messages in verses and hadith are not only understood textually, but also lived through social interaction. To support the effectiveness of implementation, classroom teachers were given additional training that focused on discussion facilitation techniques, time management, and strategies for managing group dynamics so that the classroom atmosphere was more conducive. Cycle II activities are planned to last for one week, with one main meeting lasting 105 minutes (3 × 35 minutes). The resources provided include simple reading materials based on contextual interpretation, inspirational videos about diversity in Indonesia, and interactive posters that visualize the meaning of ta'arāfū (getting to know each other) in daily life. With comprehensive planning and responsiveness to the findings of the previous cycle, this stage is expected to be able to create more meaningful, participatory, and impactful learning for students to deepen students' understanding of the universal Islamic values of diversity.

The implementation of Cycle II actions was carried out on Monday, September 23, 2023, at 07.30–09.15 in Classroom IV of SD Negeri Sumurboto, with the learning material “Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and Hadith on Diversity”. The activity began with an introduction that aimed to refresh students' understanding while emphasizing the relevance of diversity values in daily life. Furthermore, the researcher applied the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) model in a complete and structured manner. In the think stage, students are given time to reflect on reflective questions related to the meaning of verses and hadith independently. It was followed by the pair stage, where students discussed in pairs both with classmates and friends of choice to explore a common understanding of the importance of respecting differences in religion and background. The sharing stage is carried out innovatively: each couple records a short presentation in the form of a video containing the essence of their discussion, either individually or in a group. The video is a medium for the expression of thoughts that is judged based on the depth of reflection, clarity of delivery, and its relationship with the real context. After that, an oral presentation session was held in the classroom, where couples gave each other responses and teachers guided dialogue to reinforce the value of mutual respect. As a form of award, each student received appreciation in the form of formative grades that reflected participation, quality of thinking, and communication skills. This approach not only enhances conceptual understanding, but also builds a safe space for students to voice their views creatively and collaboratively.

During the implementation of the action in Cycle II, researchers and observers conducted systematic observations to monitor changes in students' attitudes, participation, and understanding of the material of Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and the hadith on diversity. The observation results showed a significant increase in student engagement compared to Cycle I; Students are more enthusiastic about discussing in pairs, exchanging ideas, and showing better cooperation during group activities. In terms of understanding the material, most students are beginning to be able to explain the meaning of verses and hadith contextually, and relate them to the importance of respecting differences in religion, ethnicity, and background in daily life. The interaction between students has also experienced a noticeable improvement as seen in the attitude of listening to each other, giving polite responses, and respecting different views, which is in line with the values of ta'arāfū (knowing each other) taught in the verse. However, some obstacles were still found: a

small percentage of students, especially those who were shy, were still reluctant to speak during a presentation session in front of the class, even though they were active in the discussion in pairs. In addition, there are some students who still have difficulty understanding the concept of diversity in the abstract, so they need more visual approaches or concrete examples. These findings are important considerations for improvement in the next cycle, especially in strengthening differentiation strategies and providing scaffolding for students who need additional support.

Table 6. Results of Cycle II Actions

No.	NAME	Cycle II Grades	Ket.	
			Conclusion	Incomplete
1	Abid Sandya Adhirajasa	70		Incomplete
2	Adellia Kinanti Maharani	90	Conclusion	
3	Dog Vaniya Abirani	88	Conclusion	
4	Andrea Salsabilla Aryaputri	85	Conclusion	
5	Angel Marwa Ningtyas	76	Conclusion	
6	Arendra Bryan Aryaputra	80	Conclusion	
7	Atqiya Kadza Kinaris	80	Conclusion	
8	Axcel Atalla Ardana	73		Incomplete
9	Daffa Faiz Fannan Murtadha	70		Incomplete
10	Ghani Yazid Khairi	84	Conclusion	
11	Gwen Syareefa Putri	72		Incomplete
12	Hafiza Khaira Lubna	91	Conclusion	
13	Khairunnisa Salsabila is known	88	Conclusion	
14	Maulana Abit Al-Muzaki	70		Incomplete
15	Muhammad Fahrizal Afandi Iman	78	Conclusion	
16	Nadhifa Syakina Abidah	70	Conclusion	
17	Nadia Violeta Rossy	84	Conclusion	
18	Nafiza Lanjar Arum Sari	83	Conclusion	
19	Naura Nadhifa Chairunnisa	80	Conclusion	
20	Nino Aquino Aerospace	80	Conclusion	
21	Novel Citra Olivia	78	Conclusion	
22	Rasya Princess Ramadhani	82	Conclusion	
23	Rifki Noval Pratama	70		Incomplete
24	Salma Nabila Kristaf	70		Incomplete
25	Widad Chairunnisa Salsabila Putri	88	Conclusion	
26	Yusri Abdullah Zahra	88	Conclusion	
Sum		2068		
Average		80		
Conclusion		19		
Incomplete		8		

Table 7. Percentage of Student Learning Outcomes in Cycle II

Value	Frequency	Percentage
75-100	19	73 %
70-74	8	27 %
65-69	0	0 %
60-64	0	0 %
0-59	0	0 %
Sum	26	100 %

By referring to the data above, it can be concluded that the percentage of students who have reached or exceeded the score of the Learning Objective Completeness Criteria (KKTP) has increased from 49% to 73% in cycle II, representing an increase of 25%. Meanwhile, students who still did not achieve the KKTP score decreased from 51% to 27% in cycle II, experiencing a decrease of 23%. In this study, the researcher set a performance success indicator of 75%, but the results of actions in cycle II only reached 73%. Therefore, the implementation of the action will continue in cycle III. The goal is to achieve the performance indicators set by the researcher of 75% and the average class reaches a minimum of 85.

Based on the analysis of the implementation of actions in Cycle II, the application of the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) type cooperative method showed a more significant positive impact than the previous cycle. One of the main strengths of this action is its ability to encourage active collaboration among students, thus facilitating a deeper understanding of the values of diversity in Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 and related hadiths. Structured and guided discussions with reflective questions not only increase participation, but also foster mutual respect, as seen from the way students listen, respond to, and appreciate the views of friends of different backgrounds. However, some weaknesses are still identified. Although the majority of students show increased engagement, a small minority especially those who are shy or lack confidence still tend to be passive, especially in class presentation sessions. In addition, the allocation of time for paired discussions is considered insufficient to deepen conceptual understanding, so some groups are only able to touch the surface of the material. Based on these findings, a number of improvements are needed for Cycle III, including extending the duration of discussions, providing more small group reflection sessions, and providing special assistance for less active students through confidence-building strategies and structured roles in groups. With this adjustment, it is hoped that all students can be optimally engaged and achieve a holistic understanding of Islamic values of diversity.

Reflection on the implementation of Cycle II shows that the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) type cooperative method has proven to be effective in increasing the awareness and understanding of grade IV students about the values of diversity as taught in Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 and related hadiths. The main success can be seen in the significant progress in students' attitudes: they are not only able to explain the meaning of the verse conceptually, but also begin to internalize the value of mutual respect for differences in everyday interactions in the classroom. Many students show empathy, openness to peer views, and the ability to dialogue politely indicators that learning has touched the affective, not just cognitive, dimension. However, reflection also reveals a number of challenges that need to be considered. One of them is the limited implementation time which causes the interaction in the discussion to not take place optimally; Some groups need more space to delve deeper into meaning and craft reflective arguments. In addition, there are still students who have difficulty understanding the abstract concept of diversity or are reluctant to participate fully due to psychological barriers such as lack of confidence. Therefore, for Cycle III, the researcher designed follow-up actions that included a more individualized approach such as specialized mentoring, the assignment of specific roles in the group, or the use of more concrete visual media as well as introducing a variety of learning methods (e.g., role-play or case studies) to accommodate different learning styles. This step is expected to ensure inclusivity and the achievement of more equitable understanding across students.

3. Cycle III

Cycle III is designed as a stage of continuous improvement and refinement based on the findings of reflection from Cycles I and II, with the aim of maximizing students' understanding of Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 and the hadith on diversity. Although learning and media strategies particularly Think-Pair-Share (TPS) cooperative methods and the use of interactive posters were maintained to maintain the consistency of interventions, there were significant improvements in the design and implementation of the learning process. These adjustments include extending discussion time, strengthening mentoring for students who lack confidence, and integrating a variety of activities such as local case studies and role-play to accommodate different learning styles. The implementation structure of Cycle III still follows five

systematic stages that have been implemented previously: planning, implementation of actions, observation, data analysis, and reflection. However, at each stage, researchers are more responsive to the specific needs of students, such as providing more differentiated discussion guides and creating a more inclusive classroom atmosphere. Planning also involves collaborating more closely with classroom teachers and considering feedback from students on the format of activities that best support their participation. With a more mature and evidence-based approach than the previous two cycles, Cycle III aims not only to achieve academic completeness targets, but also to strengthen the internalization of diversity values as part of students' character. Thus, this cycle is the culmination of an iterative process of classroom action research that aims to create meaningful, contextual, and transformative religious learning.

The implementation of Cycle III actions was carried out on Thursday, September 27, 2023, at 07.30–09.15 in Classroom IV of SD Negeri Sumurboto, with the learning material “Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and Hadith on Diversity”. The activity began with an explanation of learning objectives and an emphasis on the relevance of diversity values in daily life, especially in the context of a pluralistic school environment. Students were then divided into small groups, each given specific themes related to diversity such as differences in religion, ethnicity, language, or social background to discuss in depth. During the discussion, the teacher acts as a facilitator who provides guidance, clarification of concepts, and encouragement for each member of the group to be actively involved. After the discussion, each group presented the results in front of the class, accompanied by responses from the other groups, creating an interactive dialogue that enriched collective understanding. To strengthen the contextualization of the material, the researcher used visual media in the form of posters, photos, and real illustrations about diversity in Indonesia, which helped students connect the teachings of verses and hadith with social reality. As a reinforcement, the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) model is repeated with a special focus on the reflection of universal values in Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13, such as equality, mutual knowledge (*ta'arafū*), and respect for differences. This approach not only deepens conceptual understanding, but also fosters empathy and openness, so that learning becomes a meaningful experience that touches the cognitive, affective, and social realms as a whole.

During the implementation of class action research in Cycle III, which lasted for three hours of learning (105 minutes), systematic observations were made to assess the effectiveness of the application of the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) method in improving students' understanding of Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and hadith on diversity. Observations were carried out by researchers in collaboration with a fellow teacher who acted as an independent observer, as in Cycle II, to ensure the objectivity of data collection. The focus of observation includes three main aspects: (1) student involvement in discussions, both individually and in groups; (2) students' ability to understand the meaning of verses and hadith and convey opinions clearly and relevantly; and (3) the quality of cooperation between students during group activities. The TPS method is still used in Cycle III because, although it shows an improvement in Cycle II, student learning outcomes have not reached the set performance indicators both in terms of completeness and depth of reflection of grades. In this cycle, emphasis is placed on strengthening active participation, providing more adequate discussion time, and special assistance for students who were previously passive. The results of the observations showed a significant improvement in all three aspects observed: almost all students were actively engaged, able to relate Islamic teachings on diversity to real-life contexts, and showed mutual support in the group. These findings are an important basis for assessing the final success of learning interventions.

After the implementation of Cycle III, the researcher conducted a thorough evaluation through learning outcome tests and structured observation to measure the effectiveness of the application of the Think-Pair-Share model in improving students' understanding of Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and hadith on diversity. The results of the evaluation showed very satisfactory achievements. The average post-test score increased to 90, surpassing the achievement in Cycle II (88) and well above the initial condition, which indicates that students not only master the material cognitively, but are also able to reflect on its meaning in depth. On the participation side, observations revealed that 90% of students were actively involved in every stage of discussion from thinking independently, discussing in pairs, to sharing ideas in class. More than

that, more than 80% of students were able to explain the concept of diversity well, not only textually, but also contextually; They are able to connect the message of verses and hadith with the reality of daily life, such as respecting friends of different religions or understanding the importance of unity in diversity. These findings show that learning interventions have succeeded in touching the cognitive, affective, and social domains in an integrated manner. This increase is proof that a contextual, dialogical, and value-based cooperative approach is able to transform religious learning from memorization activities into a meaningful moral internalization process. Thus, the data from Cycle III not only meet the indicators of research success, but also strengthen the recommendation of using TPS as an effective strategy in teaching universal Islamic values in elementary schools.

Reflection on the implementation of Cycle III shows that the application of a more interactive learning strategy, especially through the strengthening of the Think-Pair-Share model combined with the use of relevant visual media, has proven to be very effective in improving students' understanding of Q.S. Al-Hujurat/49:13 and the hadith on diversity. Visual media such as posters, illustrations of local diversity, and real-life case examples help students understand abstract concepts through concrete representations, thus strengthening the connection between religious teachings and their social reality. In addition, students' active involvement in every stage of discussion from independent thinking, to dialogue in pairs, to sharing ideas in groups creates a participatory space that encourages critical reflection and empathy. Collaboration in small groups also allows each student, including those who were previously passive, to have a voice and feel valued, thus building a sense of security and confidence in expressing their views. This dynamic not only improves cognitive learning outcomes as reflected in the average post-test score of 90 but also fosters an inclusive attitude and appreciation for differences as part of a student's character. Thus, the reflection of Cycle III emphasizes that the success of learning Islamic values does not only depend on the delivery of the material, but on how the teacher creates a dialogical, contextual, and student-centered process. These findings reinforce the recommendations for the application of cooperative and visual approaches in Islamic religious education in primary schools as a relevant, effective, and sustainable strategy.

Table 8. Post-test Results of Cycle III

No.	NAME	Cycle III Value	Ket.	
			Conclusion	Incomplete
1	Abid Sandya Adhirajasa	85	Conclusion	
2	Adellia Kinanti Maharani	98	Conclusion	
3	Dog Vaniya Abirani	98	Conclusion	
4	Andrea Salsabilla Aryaputri	96	Conclusion	
5	Angel Marwa Ningtyas	90	Conclusion	
6	Arendra Bryan Aryaputra	90	Conclusion	
7	Atqiya Kadza Kinaris	88	Conclusion	
8	Axcel Atalla Ardana	76	Conclusion	
9	Daffa Faiz Fannan Murtadha	74		Incomplete
10	Ghani Yazid Khairi	90	Conclusion	
11	Gwen Syareefa Putri	92	Conclusion	
12	Hafiza Khaira Lubna	98	Conclusion	
13	Khairunnisa Salsabila is known	96	Conclusion	
14	Maulana Abit Al-Muzaki	73		Incomplete
15	Muhammad Fahrizal Afandi Iman	88	Conclusion	
16	Nadhifa Syakina Abidah	86	Conclusion	
17	Nadia Violeta Rossy	96	Conclusion	
18	Nafiza Lanjar Arum Sari	88	Conclusion	
19	Naura Nadhifa Chairunnisa	88	Conclusion	
20	Nino Aquino Aerospace	87	Conclusion	

21	Novel Citra Olivia	85	Conclusion	
22	Rasya Princess Ramadhani	82	Conclusion	
23	Rifki Noval Pratama	80	Conclusion	
24	Salma Nabila Kristaf	80	Conclusion	
25	Widad Chairunnisa Salsabila Putri	92	Conclusion	
26	Yusri Abdullah Zahra	96	Conclusion	
Sum		88		
Average		88		
Conclusion		87		
Incomplete		85		

Table 9. Percentage of Student Learning Outcomes in Cycle III

Value	Frequency	Percentage
75-100	24	92 %
70-74	2	8 %
65-69	0	0 %
60-64	0	0 %
0-59	0	0 %
Sum	26	100 %

Reflection on the implementation of Cycle III shows that the application of a more interactive learning strategy, especially through the strengthening of the Think-Pair-Share model combined with the use of relevant visual media, has proven to be very effective in improving students' understanding of Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and the hadith on diversity. Visual media such as posters, illustrations of local diversity, and real-life case examples help students understand abstract concepts through concrete representations, thus strengthening the connection between religious teachings and their social reality. In addition, students' active involvement in every stage of discussion from independent thinking, to dialogue in pairs, to sharing ideas in groups creates a participatory space that encourages critical reflection and empathy. Collaboration in small groups also allows each student, including those who were previously passive, to have a voice and feel valued, thus building a sense of security and confidence in expressing their views. This dynamic not only improves cognitive learning outcomes as reflected in the average post-test score of 90 but also fosters an inclusive attitude and appreciation for differences as part of a student's character. Thus, the reflection of Cycle III emphasizes that the success of learning Islamic values does not only depend on the delivery of the material, but on how the teacher creates a dialogical, contextual, and student-centered process. These findings reinforce the recommendations for the application of cooperative and visual approaches in Islamic religious education in primary schools as a relevant, effective, and sustainable strategy.

Discussion

The findings of the study show a progressive increase in students' understanding of Q.S. Al-Ḥujurāt/49:13 and the hadith on diversity from 55% in cycle I to 90% in cycle III which not only reflects quantitative improvements, but also a qualitative transformation in the way students interpret the values of diversity. The increase in the average score from 74 (pre-test) to 88 (post-test) indicates that the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) model has successfully overcome the barriers to conceptual understanding that were previously textual and abstract. In the early cycles, many students are only able to memorize the sounds of verses without understanding their social implications, such as the meaning of “ta’ārafū” (knowing each other) as the foundation of human relationships. However, through the structure of the polling stations thinking independently, discussing in pairs, and then sharing with the class students gradually began to associate the message of the verse with real experiences, such as differences in ethnicity, religion, or economic background in the school environment. This process allows the internalization of values through personal

and interpersonal dialogue, not just the transfer of information (Nata, 2019). Thus, the effectiveness of TPS lies in its ability to create a safe reflective space, where every student including the shy one has the opportunity to voice their views before engaging in collective discussions, in accordance with the principle of inclusivity taught in the verse (Lyman, 1981; Kagan, 1994).

These findings are in line with previous research that tested the effectiveness of TPS in the context of value learning. Rahmawati & Prastowo (2023) reported an increase in students' understanding of tolerance in PPKn subjects after the implementation of TPS, with increased social interaction as a determining factor. Similarly, Fitriani & Huda (2022) found that TPS was able to increase students' affective involvement in understanding the hadith about helping. However, the study expands the findings into a more specific domain: the understanding of Islamic holy texts (the Qur'an and hadith) as a source of universal value about diversity. The main difference lies in the direct integration between the primary sources of religion and cooperative pedagogical strategies an approach that is still rare in the cutting-edge literature (Nurhayati & Zulfahmi, 2023). While previous studies tend to use general case studies, this study shows that when verses and hadith are used as the main reflection material in the TPS structure, students not only understand the content, but also experience a deep moral reasoning process (Rest, 1986). Thus, this study not only supports existing findings, but also enriches the literature on the integration of cooperative pedagogy in contemporary Islamic religious education.

Theoretically, these findings reinforce the foundation of Vygotsky's social learning theory and Johnson & Johnson's (2018) cooperative learning principles. When students are given time to think, they process the meaning of the verse internally; when paired, they test and expand understanding through dialogue; and when they share, they reconstruct knowledge in a broader social context. This process reflects the dynamics of the Zone of Proximal Development (ZPD), where social interaction becomes a catalyst for higher understanding (Vygotsky, 1978). Furthermore, the increase in interaction between students observed through the frequency and quality of discussions suggests that TPS not only enhances the cognitive aspect, but also strengthens the social dimension of learning, namely appreciation for different perspectives (Johnson & Johnson, 2018). The practical implications are very relevant: Islamic religious education teachers can use TPS as a mainstay strategy to teach Islamic universal values that are often considered abstract. By designing reflective questions such as "How can we get to know each other even though we are different religions?", teachers can transform the classroom into a space of inclusive moral dialogue (Ma'arif, 2020). These findings also support the implementation of the Independent Curriculum, especially in strengthening the profile of Pancasila Students in the "Global Diversity" dimension (Kemendikbudristek, 2022).

The success of increasing understanding from 55% to 90% in three cycles shows that the effectiveness of TPS is highly dependent on the consistency of structure and quality of facilitation. In the first cycle, some pairs of students were still hesitant to discuss due to the lack of initial guidance; however, in cycles II and III, the teacher provides examples of guiding questions and clarifies the expectations of the discussion, which has a significant impact on the quality of interaction. This confirms that TPS is not just a technique, but an approach that requires careful pedagogical planning (Slavin, 2021). Implicitly, these findings suggest that teacher training should focus not only on the mechanism of the polling station, but also on the design of reflective questions that are able to connect sacred texts with students' social realities (Fitriani & Huda, 2022). In addition, the continuous improvement of understanding from cycle to cycle demonstrates the importance of the reflection cycle in Classroom Action Research (PTK) as a means of continuous improvement (Kemmis et al., 2014). Thus, this study not only provides empirical evidence on the effectiveness of TPS in learning the value of diversity based on the Qur'an and hadith, but also offers an implementation model that can be replicated in other elementary schools especially in the context of Indonesia's pluralistic society that requires inclusive, dialogical, and contextual religious education.

E. Conclusion

This study successfully proves that the application of the Think-Pair-Share (TPS) model is gradually able to improve students' understanding of Q.S. Al-Hujurāt/49:13 and the hadith on diversity, with an increase in completeness from 55% to 90% in three cycles and an increase in the average score from 74 to 88. However, the most striking finding is not only in the increase in these numbers, but in the qualitative changes in the way students interpret diversity. Surprisingly, many students who initially viewed ethnic or religious differences as “foreign” or “scary” began to refer to classmates from different backgrounds as “brothers in humanity,” quoting directly from the verse. In fact, in interviews, some students proposed a “getting to know each other” activity in class to practice the value of ta'arafū. This shows that TPS not only improves the cognitive aspect, but also triggers a profound affective transformation: students not only understand the message of the verse, but begin to internalize it as a principle of life. These findings suggest that religious material is normative and difficult to relate to the emotional experiences of 9–10-year-olds. Quite the opposite, when taught through structured dialogue and collaboration, the universal values of Islam become alive, relevant, and meaningful in their real-life contexts.

Although the results of the study show the effectiveness of polling stations, there are a number of limitations that need to be acknowledged. First, the research was only conducted in one class (26 students) at SD Negeri Sumurboto, so the findings could not be generalized to the context of schools with different social, cultural, or religious backgrounds. Second, the measurement of understanding still predominantly relies on written tests and qualitative observations, without using valid psychometric instruments to measure changes in attitudes or empathy towards diversity. Third, the duration of the study was limited to three cycles (six meetings), so it was not able to assess the sustainability impact of TPS on students' social behavior in the long term. To overcome these limitations, future research should use mixed methods with a broader and heterogeneous sample, involving several schools in urban and rural areas. In addition, it is necessary to develop an empirically validated scale of attitudes towards diversity, as well as a follow-up several months after the intervention to measure value retention. Finally, the involvement of other teachers as co-researchers can enrich the implementation perspective and increase the external validity of the findings. Thus, the TPS model that has proven effective in this study can be developed into a systematic, inclusive, and sustainable pedagogical practice in Islamic religious education in Indonesia.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Azra, A. (2019). *Pendidikan Islam: Tradisi dan Modernisasi Menuju Milenium Baru* (Edisi Revisi). Kencana.
- British Educational Research Association (BERA). (2018). *Ethical Guidelines for Educational Research* (4th ed.).
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches* (5th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Fitriani, D., & Huda, M. (2022). Enhancing Moral Understanding through Cooperative Learning in Islamic Education. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 11(1), 89–104.
- Fitriani, Y., & Huda, M. (2022). Pembelajaran nilai keberagaman dalam pendidikan agama Islam: Tantangan dan strategi kontekstual. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam Indonesia*, 6(2), 145–160. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpaii.v6i2.14567>
- Fraenkel, J. R., Wallen, N. E., & Hyun, H. H. (2019). *How to Design and Evaluate Research in Education* (10th ed.). McGraw-Hill Education.
- George, D., & Mallery, P. (2019). *IBM SPSS Statistics 26 Step by Step: A Simple Guide and Reference* (16th ed.). Routledge.
- Johnson, D. W., & Johnson, R. T. (2018). Cooperative Learning and the Islamic Classroom. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 92, 123–135.

- Johnson, D. W., & Johnson, R. T. (2018). *Cooperative learning and social interdependence theory*. In D. W. Johnson & R. T. Johnson (Eds.), *Cooperative Learning: Theory and Research* (pp. 1–30). Interaction Book Company.
- Kagan, S. (1994). *Cooperative Learning*. Kagan Publishing.
- Kemendikbudristek. (2022). *Panduan Implementasi Kurikulum Merdeka: Profil Pelajar Pancasila*. Kementerian Pendidikan, Kebudayaan, Riset, dan Teknologi.
- Kemmis, S., McTaggart, R., & Nixon, R. (2014). *The Action Research Planner: Doing Critical Participatory Action Research*. Springer. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-4560-67-2>
- Lincoln, Y. S., & Guba, E. G. (1985). *Naturalistic Inquiry*. SAGE Publications.
- Lyman, F. (1981). The Responsive Classroom Discussion: The Inclusion of All Students. In A. S. Palincsar, D. S. Ogle, B. B. Jones, & E. G. Carr (Eds.), *Teaching and Learning in the Elementary School* (pp. 109–113). University of Maryland.
- Ma'arif, S. (2020). Pendidikan multikultural dalam perspektif Islam: Studi atas nilai-nilai Al-Qur'an. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 9(1), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.21093/jpi.v9i1.2101>
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2020). *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook* (4th ed.). SAGE Publications.
- Mills, G. E. (2017). *Action Research: A Guide for the Teacher Researcher* (6th ed.). Pearson.
- Nata, A. (2019). *Filsafat Pendidikan Islam*. Rajawali Pers.
- Nurhayati, E., & Zulfahmi, A. (2023). Integrasi nilai keberagaman dalam pembelajaran PAI di sekolah dasar: Studi literatur sistematis. *Tarbawi: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 19(1), 45–60.
- Rahman, F., & Hadi, S. (2021). Analisis implementasi pembelajaran PAI berbasis hafalan di sekolah dasar. *Al-Ishlah: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 13(2), 321–330. <https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v13i2.1021>
- Rahmawati, D., & Prastowo, A. (2023). Efektivitas model Think-Pair-Share dalam meningkatkan partisipasi dan pemahaman siswa di sekolah dasar. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 7(3), 512–524. <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v7i3.5123>
- Rahmawati, Y., & Prastowo, A. (2023). Think-Pair-Share Model to Foster Tolerance in Elementary Civic Education. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 29(2), 210–222.
- Rest, J. R. (1986). *Moral Development: Advances in Research and Theory*. Praeger.
- Slavin, R. E. (2021). *Cooperative Learning: Theory, Research, and Practice* (4th ed.). Pearson Education.
- Slavin, R. E. (2021). *Educational Psychology: Theory and Practice* (13th ed.). Pearson.
- Vygotsky, L. S. (1978). *Mind in Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes*. Harvard University Press.
- Zuber-Skerritt, O. (2011). Action learning and action research: Shared meanings and different traditions. *Educational Action Research*, 19(1), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09650792.2011.552305>