Sawwa: Jurnal Studi Gender – Vol 16, No 2 (2021): 127-152

DOI: 10.21580/sa.v16i2.8006

Copyright © 2021 Sawwa: Jurnal Studi Gender



Impact of COVID-19 Pandemic on Gender Mainstreaming Implementation in 2020 in Batu City, East Java

Mely Noviryani,1* Keppi Sukesi,1 Sri Minarti1

¹Gender Research Center, Universitas Brawijaya, Malang – Indonesia

*Corresponding Author: email: m.noviryani@ub.ac.id Jl. Veteran No.1-4 Malang 65145, Indonesia Abstract: The COVID-19 pandemic during 2020 has impacted health aspects, social life, economics, and politics. Large-scale social restriction policies and health protocols have been applied in almost all regions in East Java. This study aims to identify the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on gender mainstreaming implementation in Batu City and how the local government responds to it. Focus Group discussion (FDG) with the local government was run to obtain data. By using seven elements commonly used to evaluate gender mainstreaming implementation, this study shows that the COVID-19 pandemic has remarkably impacted gender mainstreaming implementation. No specific policies have yet been made within the gender mainstreaming framework. PUG institutions are also not involved in the COVID-19 task force. There have been efforts to respond to the impact in some sectors but not all in gender mainstreaming. Human resources have not been explicitly prepared in dealing with women's problems during the COVID-19 pandemic. The budget is reallocated so that even routine activities cannot be fully carried out. Community participation is also helpful in tackling the pandemic, although it has not specifically responded to the impacts. This study implies the importance of integrating a disaster perspective in monitoring and evaluating gender mainstreaming.

Keywords: gender mainstreaming; pandemic; COVID-19; Batu City

Abstrak: Pandemi COVID-19 selama 2020 telah mempengaruhi aspek kesehatan, kehidupan sosial, ekonomi, dan politik. Kebijakan pembatasan sosial skala besar dan protokol kesehatan télah diterapkan di hampir semua wilayah di Jawa Timur. Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk mengidentifikasi dampak pandemi COVID-19 terhadap pelaksanaan Pengarusutamaan Gender (PUG) di Kota Batu dan bagaimana Pemerintah Daerah menyikapinya. Diskusi kelompok terpumpun/Focus Group Discussion (FDG) dengan Pemerintah Daerah dilakukan untuk mendapatkan data. Penelitian ini menggunakan tujuh elemen yang biasa digunakan untuk mengevaluasi implementasi PUG, studi ini menunjukkan bahwa pandemi COVID-19 sangat berdampak pada implementasi PUG. Belum ada kebijakan khusus yang dibuat dalam kerangka PUG. Lembaga PUG juga tidak dilibatkan dalam satgas COVID-19. Ada upaya untuk menanggapi dampak pandemi di beberapa sektor tetapi tidak semua dalam kerangka PUG. Sumber daya manusia belum disiapkan secara eksplisit dalam menangani permasalahan perempuan di masa pandemi COVID-19. Anggaran direalokasi sehingga kegiatan rutin pun tidak bisa dilakuan keseluruhan. Partisimasyarakat sangat membantu

nanggulangi pandemi, meski belum secara spesifik merespon dampak pandemic terhadap PUG. Penelitian ini menyiratkan pentingnya mengintegrasikan perspektif bencana dalam pemantauan dan evaluasi PUG.

Kata Kunci: pengarusutamaan gender; PUG; pandemi;

COVID-19; Kota Batu

A. Introduction

East Java Province became one of the provinces that received the worst impact of the COVID-19 pandemic during 2020. It is the highest rate of infected patients and deaths, including the medical staff, compared to other provinces, even DKI Jakarta. The pandemic's impact is on the health aspect and on social life, economics, and politics. Large-scale social restriction policies and health protocols have been applied in almost all regions in East Java, including the Malang region (Malang City, Malang Districts, and Batu City). The new protocol and the new normal have changed all life aspects. Nowadays, wearing masks, physical distancing, online school, work from home become 'normal' or everyday activities.

Apart from the increasing number of people infected and dying due to this virus, many other socio-economic issues arise due to the state's policies in dealing with this virus. The lockdown policy or a large scale of social restrictions impacts the socio-economic conditions of society in general. Income has dropped dramatically, and access to public services is limited. This condition turns out to have a specific impact on women.

According to Kirana Mahdiah Sulaeman and Fenny Rizka Salsabila, this epidemic has at least three impacts on women beyond the threat of the virus itself. First, the work-from-home and large-scale social restrictions policy from the government force schools to close, and children must study at home with their parents. However, what is meant by parents here is mother. Mothers are always considered the most responsible for the children at home, so children's learning process becomes the mother's responsibility even in this pandemic. Even though many mothers also work and have to work at home. As a result, the burden on women at home is getting bigger. Second, the same policies also threaten women to face domestic violence because women have to spend more time at home with perpetrators of violence without supervision from others.

¹ Kirana Mahdiah Sulaeman and Fenny Rizka Salsabila, "Dampak COVID-19 terhadap Kaum Perempuan: Perspektif Feminisme," *Jurnal Sentris* 1, no. 2 (2020): 159–72, https://doi.org/10.26593/sentris.v1i2.4283.159-172.

Third, the economic threat. In many countries, women in normal conditions still experience discrimination regarding employment, from recruitment to wages to layoffs. In jobs heavily affected by COVID-19, such as teachers and health workers, women receive lower salaries than men and are more likely to be fired in waves of layoffs than men.²

The pandemic is exacerbating inequality. A policy brief written by Kate Power explains that our economies are measured by ignoring the everyday reproductive life usually done by women, which benefits society.³ These works are valued more when done by non-family members and are supposed to be compensated. According to Helen Lewis, government policies to close schools and impose physical and social restrictions move childcare workers previously paid such as school, daycare, and others to become unpaid and done by women.⁴ According to Lewis, it prevents women from doing paid work, which is valued by most societies. However, this pandemic condition makes it possible for fathers to help more in household work. It may not be universal, and this situation will be even more difficult for single parents. Also, according to Lewis, this pandemic will send women back to the 1950s and force women's independence to become silent victims.⁵

Women are vulnerable to violence during this pandemic. LBH APIK (*Lembaga Bantuan Hukum Asosiasi Perempuan Indonesia untuk Keadilan*) reported that from March 2020 to September 2020, 508 complaints of violence cases against women had been received of which 168 were domestic violence as the highest cases. Next followed, 151 cases of online-based violence and 52 cases of dating violence.⁶ During the implementation of Large-Scale Social Restrictions/*Pembatasan Sosial Berskala Besar (PSBB)* from March 16 to June 20, 2020, LBH APIK noted 110 domestic violence cases had been reported.

² Sulaeman and Salsabila, 165-67.

³ Kate Power, "The COVID-19 Pandemic Has Increased the Care Burden of Women and Families," *Sustainability: Science, Practice and Policy* 16, no. 1 (2020): 67–73, https://doi.org/10.1080/15487733.2020.1776561.

⁴ Helen Lewis, "The Coronavirus is a Disaster for Feminism: Pandemics Affect Men and Women Differently," The Atlantic, March 19, 2020, https://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2020/03/feminism-womens-rights-coronavirus-covid19/608302/.

⁵ Lewis

⁶ CNN Indonesia, "LBH APIK: 508 Kasus Kekerasan selama WFH, KDRT Tertinggi"," cnnindonesia.com, September 6, 2020, https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20200905225251-20-543207/lbh-apik-508-kasus-kekerasan-selama-wfh-kdrt-tertinggi.

Within three months, the number of domestic violence cases has reached half of the number of domestic violence cases during 2019.⁷ According to research conducted by Theresia Vania Raditya et al., one of the causes of domestic violence is the obligation to self-quarantine, which makes victims of domestic violence trapped in the house with the perpetrator. Quarantine also triggers stress because family income has decreased, which ultimately begins the emergence of family strife leads to violence.⁸

At the beginning of this outbreak, children who are not in the vulnerable group in the development of the pandemic become a group that should seriously consider the weak impacts of the pandemic. Through an online survey conducted on 10-27 April 2020 on 11,989 parents and 4,698 teachers in Indonesia, Save the Children identified seven risks of potential impact for COVID-19 on children. The seven risks are: First, losing the parents' livelihoods results in difficulty fulfilling the children's daily needs. Second, the economic impact causes children to lose essential health services. The survey found that 77 percent of households cannot get proper food intake, resulting in 60 million children aged 0-17 years being forced to eat less than they should. In addition, essential health services such as Posyandu could have been used to ensure children's health also did not operate. As a result, immunization coverage in children is predicted to decline by 30 percent due to the pandemic. Third, children cannot access quality education services. As many as 77% of teachers admit that not all students can participate in distance learning, and 85% of parents and children acknowledge that they experience obstacles in the learning process. Fourthly, there is limited support for children with disabilities. Fifth, the risk of children losing their parents. A total of 60% of COVID-19 cases occur in the productive age group between 30-45 years in Indonesia; generally, those age are married and have 1-3 children. As a result, the child loses an

⁷ Ayesha Nadya Muna, Diva Tasya Belinda Rauf, and Ika Krismantari, "Angka KDRT di Indonesia Meningkat Sejak Pandemi COVID-19: Penyebab dan Cara Mengatasinya," The Conversation, August 6, 2020, https://theconversation.com/angka-kdrt-di-indonesia-meningkat-sejak-pandemi-covid-19-penyebab-dan-cara-mengatasinya-144001.

⁸ Theresia Vania Radhitya, Nunung Nurwati, and Maulana Irfan, "Dampak Pandemi COVID-19 terhadap Kekerasan dalam Rumah Tangga," *Jurnal Kolaborasi Resolusi Konflik* 2, no. 2 (2020): 111–19, https://doi.org/10.24198/jkrk.v2i2.29119.

⁹ CNN Indonesia, "7 Dampak Pandemi yang Beresiko Dihadapi Anak-anak," cnnindonesia. com, July 23, 2020, https://www.cnnindonesia.com/gaya-hidup/20200722142651-284-527653/7-dampak-pandemi-yang-berisiko-dihadapi-anak-anak.

infected parent, is isolated, and undergoes intensive care in the hospital. Sixth, decreased motivation to learn and susceptibility to violence. Parents are overwhelmed with children at home to experience psychological pressure, and children become targets of violence from parents. Seventh, children are included in the majority group victims of natural disasters in Indonesia. Children living in areas prone to natural disasters have a greater risk because they also have to deal with the COVID-19 pandemic.¹⁰

In particular, as the most prominent tourist destination in East Java, Batu City experienced a massive impact during the COVID-19 pandemic, especially at the beginning of the pandemic. Since the Original Local Government Revenue/Pendapatan Asli Daerah (PAD) comes from the hospitality and entertainment sectors, the large-scale social restriction policies caused the industry to deteriorate. As a result, PAD Batu City was reduced by 40% or 80.8 billion Rupiah from the target of 207 billion Rupiah. The Investment Office of One-Door Integrated Services and Manpower/Dinas Penanaman Modal Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu dan Tenaga Kerja (DPMPTSPTK) Batu City recorded as many as 2,555 domestic workers, and 52 other workers were forced to experience layoffs. A total of 1,901 domestic workers are residents of Batu City, another 654 from various regions in Indonesia. The majority of these workers work in the hospitality sector and manage tourist destinations. 12

The tourism sector is one of the many sectors affected by the COVID-19 pandemic and most easily identified. Specifically, both the tourism sector and other sectors affected by the COVID-19 pandemic will also impact the condition of women and children, considering that women and children are always in a vulnerable need whenever there is a crisis because of disaster, natural or manmade disaster. Therefore, in terms of gender mainstreaming (*PUG*) in development planning and implementation, it is essential to see how the COVID-19 pandemic has a specific impact on the region. Furthermore, PUG is reinforced by the fact that under normal conditions (without or before the pandemic) only, gender mainstreaming implementation that has been founded for decades is

¹⁰ CNN Indonesia.

¹¹ Irsya Richa, "Dampak Covid-19, PAD Kota Batu Hilang Rp 80,8 Miliar," jatimtimes.com, April 7, 2020, https://jatimtimes.com/baca/212326/20200407/185400/dampak-covid-19-pad-kota-batu-hilang-rp-80-8-miliar.

¹² Vicki Febrianto, "Ribuan Pekerja di Kota Batu Dirumahkan," antaranews.com, April 20, 2020, https://www.antaranews.com/berita/1432916/ribuan-pekerja-di-kota-batu-dirumahkan.

still not maximized and integrated comprehensively in the planning, implementing, and evaluating development in the region. Besides, it is also necessary to identify how local governments respond to this pandemic's impact and challenge. Policies on transmission prevention and pandemic handling are under the local governments.

The present study seeks the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic pertinent to gender mainstreaming in planning and development implementation in Batu City. Other than that, the study analyzes government steps in responding to the pandemic in the region.

Methodology

Batu City became the research setting due to its characteristics as the designated recipient of Anugerah Parahita Ekapraya (APE) in the *Madya* (Moderate) category in 2019. This study uses PUG evaluation indicators to identify how the COVID-19 pandemic affects implementation. PUG implementation needs to evaluate to ascertain whether the planning and execution of development in the region have referred to the original purpose of conducting gender mainstreaming in the development process. The ideal conditions of PUG implementation, some aspects are evaluated as follows to achieve:¹³

Political Support Aspects

The evaluation covers the assessment of political support from the Ministry's leadership or institutions and the head of the local government on PUG implementation. The components studied include a) the absence or absence of decrees of the heads of ministries or institutions and heads of local governments concerned; and b) the existence of internal rules or decisions that allow the implementation of PUG can be carried out and potentially to be institutionalized (sustained).

Policy Aspects

The evaluation of the impact of political support on policies/programs/ activities in related sectors, which is seen from: a) Whether the policies/ programs/activities are gender-responsive in Propernas 200-2004, Rapeta

¹³ BAPPENAS, "Evaluasi Pengarusutamaan Gender di 9 Sektor Pembangunan Tahun 2006" (Jakarta: Kementerian Negara Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional/BAPPENAS, 2006).

2001-2004, RPJMN 2004-2009, and RKP 2005 and 2006 have been outlined in the five-year document (*Renstra/Propeda/Poldas/RPJMD*) and the Annual Plan document (Rapeta/Repetada/RKP/RKPD) from each ministry/institution/regency/city) in the form of activity details and funds); b) Whether gender-responsive policies/programs/activities in these sectors/regions are increasing and implemented.

Institutional Aspects

The evaluation refers to assessing the potential of PUG sustainability in the ministry/institution/province/regency/city. The assessment cover: a) the level of authority of the structured work unit that handles PUG (unit location and echelon level); b) the existence of functional work units (focal points, working groups, PUG forums, expert councils, etc.); and c) the nature of the existing PUG unit, whether integrated into the planning structure of the ministry/institution/province/regency/city or still ad hoc.

Information Systems Aspects

The evaluation assesses the level of support and availability of funds and facilities for the implementation of PUG. The aspects covered are the availability of data sorted by gender, the performance of advocacy/socialization, and the implementation of internal and external communication, information, and education/*Komunikasi, Informasi, dan Edukasi (KIE)* on Gender Analysis Pathway (*GAP*) and PUG.

Aspects of Human Resources

The evaluation studies the capacity of existing human resources capable of implementing PUG.

Started in 2004, the ministry/institutions and local government, the government, through the Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection, gives appreciation to the ministry/institutions and local governments that can meet the criteria of PUG evaluation standards by providing an award called *Anugerah Parahita Ekapraya (APE)* Award to encourage the implementation of Gender Mainstreaming (PUG). It is a form of recognition for the commitment and role of the ministry/ institutions and local governments leaders to realize gender equality and justice through the Gender Mainstreaming Strategy.

Anugerah Parahita Ekapraya (APE) is an award for initiatives and achievements proven by the welfare conditions, gender welfare, women's empowerment, and child protection in the region.

There are four categories of awardee of *Anugerah Parahita Ekapraya* (APE): 1) Pratama (Beginner), 2) Madya (Developer), 3) Utama (Sustainable). 4) Mentor.

The assessment component in obtaining the Anugerah Parahita Ekapraya (APE) Award is assessed from seven key elements, consisting of: 1) Commitment (Local government regulation on PUG, Governor's regulation on PUG), 2) Policy (Regional medium-term development plan, regional government), 3) Institutional (PUG working group, Focal POINT), 4) Human Resources and Budget (Gender Responsive Planning and Budgeting, Trained Human Resources and Gender Responsive Provincial Budget Amount), 5) Gender Analysis Pathway (GAP) and Gender Budgeting Statement (GBS) Tools, 6) Gender-disaggregated Data, 7) Community Participation (Organizations, NGOs, and businesses)

These seven indicators are used in this study's operationalization, namely how the impact of COVID-19 and the response of the Batu City government to the effect.

This study used primary data sources collected through FGD and in-depth interviews online with the regional government in Batu City and other PUG stakeholders, namely DP3AP2KB (Office of Women Empowerment and Child Protection of Population control and Family Planning), Communication and Information Office, Social Service, Tourism Office, Health Office, Education Office, Agriculture Office, and *Lembaga Crisis Center Dyan Mutiara*.

The study also used secondary data collected through policy documents and media information to strengthen and confirm the primary sources' data. Following descriptive qualitative analysis, the data was analyzed and presented in the description concerning the impact of COVID-19. The description is focused on the PUG evaluation indicators, namely the commitment of regional leaders, policies, PUG institutions, human resources, budgets, data and information systems, methods and instruments/tools, and community support. The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic is an indicator that affects the PUG component. Data presentation is done by combining data from the two sources

above and conducting inter-subjective interpretations for certain unique and specific data findings.

Gender Mainstreaming (PUG) in the Development Program

Robert Stoller categorized human image based on the socio-cultural position pertinent to the physical-biological traits known as gender.¹⁴ The concept of gender explains the differences between men and women based on the cultural place formed and immersed in at an early age. In contrast to the concept of sexuality that distinguishes men and women based on their gender or biological characteristics, which are God's formation, gender is a difference in nature, role, function, and status between men and women based on socio-cultural relations influenced by the structure of society.¹⁵ Ann Oakley defines gender as a social construct or attribute imposed on humans built by human culture. Thus, gender is a socially constructed difference in behavior between men and women. These differences tend to engross people's perspectives that gender is permanent as a biological feature in each sex. Although later this gender is not universal and varies from one to another, gender construction becomes the basis of work division in all societies. As a result, the construction can produce injustice and gender inequality.

Restriction of rights, access, participation, control, and acceptance of benefits over resources and knowledge because the difference in social roles between men and women is a form of injustice and gender inequality. Gender justice, according to Faqih, is the condition and fair treatment of women and men. ¹⁶ Gender justice means no role-sharing, no double burden, no subordination, no marginalization, and no violence against women and men. ¹⁷ In comparison, gender equality is the condition and position of women and men to gain opportunities and rights as human beings to play a role and participate in political, economic, socio-cultural, educational, defense, and national security activities and similarities in enjoying the development. ¹⁸

Sawwa: Jurnal Studi Gender – Vol 16, No 2 (2021)

 $^{^{14}\,{\}rm Riant}\,$ Nugroho, $\it Gender\,$ dan $\it Strategi\,$ Pengarusutamaannya di Indonesia (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2011), 2.

¹⁵ Nugroho, 3.

¹⁶ Nugroho.

¹⁷ Nugroho, 12.

¹⁸ Nugroho.

Gender equality also includes eliminating discrimination and structural injustice, both against men and women.

Gender Equality and Justice/*Kesetaraan dan Keadilan Gender* (KKG) is the absence of discrimination between women and men. Thus, they have access, opportunity to participate, control development, and obtain equal and fair benefits from growth. Access is defined as the capacity to use resources to participate actively and productively socially, economically, thoroughly, and politically in society, including access to resources, services, labor and employment, information, and benefits. Participation is defined as who does what, how men and women participate equally in the decision-making process for the democratic use of resources in society. Finally, control is defined as who owns what and how men and women have the same power to use resources in the community.

Based on the need to achieve gender equality and justice in development, it is necessary to institutionalize the interests of women in various policy areas and sectors. Gender mainstreaming then becomes a strategy to overcome the issue of gender equality and justice that is relevant for all countries and governance at the lowest level. State institutional mechanisms are used to ensure the gender mainstreaming agenda is implemented, and issues of gender equality continue to be the focus of public policy.

According to international development streams from the Economic and Social Council in 1997, gender mainstreaming can be defined as:¹⁹

"the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, policies or programmes, in all areas and at all levels. It is a strategy of making women's as well as men's concerns and experiences an integral dimension of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programs in all political, economic and societal spheres so that women and men benefit equally and inequality is not perpetuated. The ultimate goal is to achieve gender equality' with the aim of transforming structures of inequality."

Globally, gender mainstreaming has become an international public policy through the United Nations, encouraging governments of countries to agree on being pioneers through the Beijing Platform for Action (1995). After that, gender mainstreaming was adopted and implemented by almost all multi-

 $^{^{19}\,\}mbox{Shirin}$ M. Rai, Mainstreaming Gender, Democratizing the State? (Manchester University Press, 2003), 16.

lateral and bilateral agencies, governments, and NGOs. It has an optimistic purpose to not only give equal opportunity for women but also promise a fundamental change in human relations, beneficial for women and ultimately for men.²⁰

Nationally, Indonesia has issued the Presidential Decree No. 9/2000 on Gender Mainstreaming in National Development This decree requires all ministries/agencies and local governments to implement gender mainstreaming (PUG).²¹ This responds to one of the key criticisms of gender mainstreaming initially seen as focusing more on institutionalization at the national level, not reaching the sub-state level where developmental change would be more manageable.²² With this decree, gender mainstreaming is pushed to the lowest level of government and PUG is seen as a strategy built to integrate gender into one integral dimension of planning, drafting, implementing, monitoring, and evaluating national development policies and programs to the lowest level of governance.

PUG attempts to remove barriers that lead to the unattainability of gender equality and justice (marginalization, stereotype, subordination, violence, and multiple roles). The strategy can be implemented by incorporating gender analysis into the work program, integrating women's and men's experiences, aspirations, needs, and interests into the development process. In general, PUG aims to ensure that women and men are treated fairly and equally in gaining access, control, participation, and equal benefits for development. The goal of PUG is to ensure that women and men gain access to, participate in, control, and obtain the same benefits in development.²³

Impact of COVID-19 Pandemic on PUG Implementation in Batu City

The data was collected online (FGD) due to the pandemic that did not allow for data collection through offline mechanisms. FGD was attended by

Sawwa: Jurnal Studi Gender – Vol 16, No 2 (2021)

²⁰ Brouwers Ria, "Revisiting Gender Mainstreaming in International Development. Goodbye to an Illusionary Strategy," *ISS Working Paper Series/General Series 556* (2013): 10.

²¹ "Petunjuk Pelaksanaan Perencanaan dan Penganggaran yang Responsif Gender untuk Kementerian dan Lembaga," Kementerian Pemberdayaan Perempian dan Perlindungan Anak, 2012.

²² Ramya Subrahmanian, "Making Sense of Gender in Shifting Institutional Contexts: Some Reflections on Gender Mainstreaming," in *Feminisms in Development: Contradictions, Contestations and Challenges*, 2007, 113–121.

²³ "Instruksi Presiden No. 9 Tahun 2000 tentang Pengarusutamaan Gender," 2020.

DP3AP2KB (Dinas Pemberdayaan Perempuan Perlindungan Anak, Pengendalian Penduduk dan Keluarga Berencana), Bapelitbangda, Department of Health, Department of Agriculture, Department of Tourism, Department Communication and Information of Batu City, and the community element represented by Women Crisis Center Dian Mutiara as a PUG consultant for the Batu City government. Additionally, the resource person in the FGD is Bapelitbangda and DP3AP2KB Batu City.

The FGD obtained data on the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on Batu City development in general and the implementation of PUG in particular. Also, it was revealed the information on the citizens of Batu City in general, and women and women's groups in particular. The data was presented by elaborating APE indicators tailored to the needs of this present research in the context of COVID-19 as follows:

Commitment and Policy

During the pandemic, the Government of Batu City issued several regulations to respond to the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. One of them is the decision to impose restrictions on regional mobility in the Decree of the Mayor of Batu (*Keputusan Walikota*) No. 188.45/364 of 2020 and the Decree of the Mayor of Batu (*Keputusan Walikota*) No. 188.45/207 of 2020 concerning on the stage of emergency transition status to recovery in the prevention and control of COVID-19. Another regulation is Batu Mayor Regulation (*Peraturan Walikota*) Batu No. 178 of 2020 concerning discipline and law enforcement to apply health protocols. The new one is also Mayor Regulation No. 79 of 2020 on guidelines for adaptation of new productive and safe habits of COVID-19.

According to these regulations, there are no specific regulations intended to deal with the impact of COVID-19 experienced by women. The Mayor's regulation was issued to protect women and children, so the virus does not infect them. The Mayor's general regulation on COVID-19 is used as a reference to improve services for the protection and empowerment of women during the pandemic. Such as the policy of providing social assistance to the community through the Allocation of Village Funds *(Alokasi Dana Desa)* and Village Funds *(Dana Desa)* and activities in empowerment use it to help improve the economy of productive women. ²⁴

²⁴ Emy Yulianingrum, Kasi PUG PuHa DP3AP2KB Kota Batu, interviewee on FGD.

Meanwhile, according to a Department of Agriculture representative, there are no specific regulations on gender mainstreaming in this regional government. They only use the Major policy to support the recovery of the economy after the pandemic, such as encouraging the utilization of front and backyard food security as stated in the Sustainable Food House Area/*Kawasan Rumah Pangan Lestari* (KRPL) program by the regional government. ²⁵ The activity is considered an attempt to strengthen women's role and strengthen the family economy by empowering self-reliance while improving family nutrition during the pandemic. Besides, some activities have been routinely carried out such as fondness to eat fish, which is an activity in cooperation with the Province of East Java, as an effort to handle stunting that is relatively high in Batu City in addition to the program of eating vegetables that have just been launched in 2020 to respond to the pandemic. ²⁶ The program likes to eat vegetables; especially organic is expected to improve the nutrition of families, especially children and the elderly, an issue attached to women's issue.

Specifically related to stunting, 2,279 infants under five years old (toddlers) experience stunting or fail to grow due to chronic malnutrition caused by inadequate nutritional intake. The stunting age range in Batu City for toddlers starts from 6 months and above to 60 months.²⁷ As a result of budget refocusing and dealing with COVID-19, the Department of Health conducted an additional food delivery program in milk for 90 days to 70 toddlers who fall into the category below the red line.²⁸

The Department of Health representatives in FGD said such regulations are needed to deal with the impact of COVID-19. In addition, the Department of Health realizes that some cases, such as domestic violence, have a prolonged effect on the issue of women's reproductive health. Therefore, the government policy on the impact of COVID-19 is necessary. ²⁹

 $^{^{25}}$ Niken Mahargyantini Nuciferani, Head of Sub-Division for Program and Reporting from the Agriculture Office Batu City, participant on FGD.

²⁶ Nuciferani.

²⁷ Nugraha Perdana, "2.279 Balita di Kota Batu Alami Stunting," Radar Malang, July 28, 2020, https://radarmalang.jawapos.com/malang-raya/28/07/2020/2-279-balita-di-kota-batu-alami-stunting/.

²⁸ Perdana.

 $^{^{29}\,\}mbox{Wahyu}$ Aning Tias, Staff of the Subdivision Program and Reporting of the Health Office Batu City, participant on FGD

Institutional

No new institutional has been established in handling COVID-19 that impacts PUG, both within each regional government and across provincial government. The unit shown for the handling of COVID-19 is related to the enforcement of health protocol disciplines, in the form of a task force based on Presidential Decree No.6 of 2020 on Improving Discipline and Law Enforcement of Health Protocols in the Prevention and Control of COVID-19. The task force led directly by the Mayor involves the police, Indonesian National Army, and Public Order Enforcers. Batu also planned to form Task Force COVID-19 batch II in early 2021, which has a specific task of overseeing health protocols in tourist attractions. The Indonesian National Army, police, Department of Communications, Department of Health, and volunteers are involved.³⁰ They are responsible for ensuring citizens' compliance to health protocols; thus, no information on the regional government involvement in the task force, except the Department of Health in task force COVID-19 class II.

However, according to the regional government representative involved in FGD, efforts to address and counter the COVID-19 pandemic in each provincial government are carried out by all units internally. It is recognized by *DP3AP2KB* that no cross-sector coordination has been conducted. ³¹ But internally, the coordination is always done. For example, in the Department of Health, all units such as the prevention and management of infectious diseases and non-communicable diseases, health care units, health resource units, and community empowerment units are all involved in responding to COVID-19.³² However, nothing specific has been established to respond to women's and health issues, especially the COVID-19 outbreak in the Department of Health, despite the impact. For example, it is related to pregnant women's health during pandemics, maternity procedures, and vulnerable women such as the elderly.

At *DP3AP2KB*, *PUSPAGA* and *P2TP2A* (Integrated Service Center for Women and Children Empowerment/*Pusat Pelayanan Terpadu Pemberdayaan*

³⁰ Irsya Richa, "Awal Tahun 2021 Dinas Pariwisata Kota Batu Bakal Bentuk Tim Satgas Covid-19 Angkatan II," Jatimnews, December 19, 2020, https://jatimtimes.com/baca/231571/20201219/085600/awal-tahun-2021-dinas-pariwisata-kota-batu-bakal-bentuk-tim-satgas-covid-19-angkatan-ii.

³¹ Yulianingrum statement.

³² Tias statement.

Perempuan dan Anak) conduct outreach to homes in need until that goal is done. Then the village government's field provides counseling assistance and distributes masks and personal protective equipment to the community. *Dharma Wanita* also assists in food, which comes from civil servants, both to the community and non-civil servants affected by the COVID-19 pandemic. Similarly, Family Planning services are run by considering health protocols and limited to 10 people per day and cooperation with health facilities. ³³

Human Resources and Budgeting

Human resources that handle gender mainstreaming or Gender Focal Point do not explain how much human resources need to address *KKG* issues during the pandemic. However, the Women Crisis Center representative, Dian Mutiara, explained that before the pandemic, Batu City had been chosen by LBH APIK Jakarta as a paralegal training place to handle violence against women. The training provided is basic training and advanced training. Now Batu already has "Paralegal Kota Batu" led by Salma Saputri SH MH. Since 2000 with the PUG program, and then in 2009-2010 and 2014 got MAMPU program. Dian Mutiara Women Crisis Center also provides training to mothers to have seven paralegals in seven groups. The group consists of 15 people, and out of 15, 3-5 are very active, which means each village has its paralegals. The paralegal group distributed a lunch box every Friday to areas where women were affected during the pandemic.³⁴

Although WCC Dian Mutiara is not involved in PUG planning and budgeting, it is engaged in the P2TP2A Secretariat. The engagement model in P2TP2A Kota Batu is a new model that other cities or districts may not have. In the P2TP2A cabinet secretariat, Batu City has professional people in their respective fields such as lawyers, theologians, etc. Batu City has sufficient human resources to help mentoring and protection, especially the law, for women in need. Although it does not yet have human resources men who become paralegals, the existence of this paralegal group in Batu City has been a significant development.

Related to the budget, as a impact of the pandemic, *Bapelitbangda* conveyed that the government is refocusing and reallocating the budget based

³³ Yulianingrum statement.

³⁴ Sri Wahyuningsih, Director of WCC Dian Mutiara, participants on FGD.

on presidential instruction No.4 of 2020, on refocusing activities on budget reallocation, as well as procurement of goods and services in the framework of handling COVID-19 and the regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs No. 20 of 2020 concerning the acceleration of handling of COVID-19 in the local government environment and the rationalization of the budget of expenditures and expenditures of employees, goods/services, and capital goods. Furthermore, the form of budget adjustment is also done through the letter of the Minister of Finance No. S-24/MK.07/2020 concerning the termination of the procurement process of physical special allocation funds in 2020, so that all physical activities that use allocation budget cannot be implemented during this pandemic. Last, a joint decree of the Minister of Trade and Minister of Finance rules the acceleration of the completion of the Regional Budget in 2020 in the framework of handling COVID-19 and securing the purchasing power of the national economic community. ³⁵

Budget refocusing and pandemic management are allocated for health, economy and social safety, and the field of security. As a result, the entire procurement process of goods/services for all types, fields, sub-fields, physical general allocation funds, except health and education, is stopped. In addition, expenditure for non-COVID-19 management was carried out with budget reduction and elimination, and some activities were postponed or canceled.

There is an adjustment in revenue projections due to reduced regional revenues, from the original 1 trillion to 850 billion. Adjustment of provincial spending is worth 1 trillion to 914 billion. The focus of the previous activities shifted to handling the COVID-19 disaster and restoring the economy, health system, and regional disasters. Then, activities should be able to estimate implemented in the budget year. Although activities in refocusing the budget are abolished, reduced, and budgeted again, the activities' realization is also decreased and waited for the ratification of the 2021 budget. ³⁶

The result of budget refocusing aimed at confectionery pandemic impact. According to *DP3P2AKB*, there is an application for productive women groups to purchase sewing machines to help women's effective businesses. The budget

 $^{^{\}rm 35}$ Putiyani, head of the sub-division of Socio-culture II Bapelitbangda Batu City, interviewee on FGD.

³⁶ Putiyani statement.

refocusing policy acknowledged the agency did not change the services provided to women and children; some were strengthened for services because some services needed improvements, such as counseling services.

The Batu City government provided non-cash assistance for Batu City residents, East Java, even since the pandemic, Rp. 700,000 to Rp. 1,000,000 per household.³⁷ The cost of living needs is determined based on the Central Bureau of Statistics/Badan Pusat Statistik (BPS) standards and the result of a meeting of the task force on handling COVID-19 Batu City. Consideration of this value is based on the amount of social safety net value provided by the central government and considering the region's financial capabilities. In April 2020, the total budget for handling COVID-19 in Batu reached Rp102 billion, which is divided into Rp. 40.14 billion for health care, Rp. Sixty billion for social safety nets, and Rp. 1.92 billion for regional disaster management agency and task force operations.³⁸ This non-cash assistance is preferred for informal workers and residents affected by COVID-19. Those in this category are farm laborers. homeless workers, daily workers, street vendors, MSMEs, motorcycle taxi drivers, drivers of mass transportation, school canteen managers, tourists, and underprivileged communities outside the Integrated Data on Social Welfare (DTKS).³⁹ Unfortunately, no specific data was provided to describe how many women benefited from this direct cash assistance.

Data, Systems and Information Materials

The need for research data can be obtained from the Information Service as a data provider. Unfortunately, based on information obtained through FGD, no gender-based data can be shown by the Information Service regarding the impact of COVID-19 in all sectors. However, the regional government has been able to identify the effects of COVID-19 on women under their respective affairs.

Using two institutions under *DP3AP2KB*, namely the Family Learning Center (PUSPAGA) and *P2TP2A*, the service should be improved due to increasing cases, especially counseling. Although there was no increase in domestic violence cases, family counseling was demanded. The majority

³⁷ Vicki Febrianto, "Jadi Rp1 Juta, Bantuan Nontunai Warga Kota Batu Terdampak Corona Naik," antaranews.com, April 11, 2020, https://www.antaranews.com/berita/1416295/jadi-rp1-juta-bantuan-nontunai-warga-kota-batu-terdampak-corona-naik.

³⁸ Febrianto.

³⁹ Febrianto.

problem that happened was parents' pressure because the child does not go to school and has to accompany the child to study at home, leading to violence against children. Parents realized the condition, so see PUSPAGA for help. Hitherto, PUSPAGA Batu City received counseling for 44 people during the pandemic until September 2020. This number increased compared to the previous year of 21 counseling. The average problem faced is the declining state of the economy and online learning.⁴⁰

Based on the Department of Health data, there is no special treatment given to males or females. However, further studies are needed to know special treatment for female patients because it is connected with pregnant women and childbirth. 41

The tourism sector in Batu City is a leading sector, and the city's financial sources get the most significant impact of the pandemic. In June 2020, the original revenue of Batu decreased by 28.36% or worth 58.7 billion Rupiah from the target 207 billion Rupiah. The most significant factor is the decrease in the tax and fees in tourism, entertainment, restaurants, and hotels that were closed from March to June 2020.⁴² In addition, Batu City Government also conducted a market levy exemption, hygiene levy to exempt local water supply utility levy rates. Although in October 2020, the tourism sector was reopened due to the acquisition of hotel and restaurant taxes that touched more than 90% and entertainment taxes that reached more than 80%, the impact caused during the large-scale social restrictions is considered significant.⁴³

Almost all Batu residents also experienced a considerable decreasing income. A survey conducted by the Batu Regional Disaster Management Agency showed that 91% of respondents admitted that their economic condition deteriorated. The survey was conducted on 379 respondents, consisting of 228 men and 151 women residents of Batu City, from July 20 2020 to August 19

⁴⁰ Shuvia Rahma, "Pandemi, Puspaga Batu Panen Sambatan Kasus KDRT Hingga Belajar Online," Radar Malang, October 12, 2020, https://radarmalang.jawapos.com/malang-raya/kota-batu/12/10/2020/pandemi-puspaga-batu-panen-sambatan-kasus-kdrt-hingga-belajar-online/.

⁴¹ Tias statement.

⁴² Redaktur Surabaya Post, "Terdampak Pandemi Covid-19, PAD Kota Batu Menurun"," surabayapost.id, June 30, 2020, https://surabayapost.id/terdampak-pandemi-covid-19-pad-kota-batu-menurun/.

⁴³ Amel, "Sektor Pariwisata Mulai Beri Dampak Positif terhadap PAD Kota Batu," nusadaily.com, November 15, 2020, https://nusadaily.com/regional/sektor-pariwisata-mulai-beri-dampak-positif-terhadap-pad-kota-batu.html.

2020. Only 8% of residents claimed to be unaffected by the pandemic, and 1% chose not to answer. Of the affected data, 34% were female heads of families, and 59% of respondents had family members of three to five. The head of the family from the survey results was private workers, farmers, traders, state civil apparatus, Indonesian National Army, and the national police. The survey showed the average family income of all 2.5 million households per month declined from 500 to 1.5 million per month, and 30% of respondents' income dropped to 1.5 million Rupiah.⁴⁴

According to the Department of Tourism, those who work in the tourism sector are primarily women. The drop in income from reduced working hours and employee housing policies hit those working in the industry. Business owners also experienced a significant decrease in turnover. Of the artists, also many turned out to be women. It is known when there is the distribution of assistance to tourism businesses and artists, either directly given from the Department of Tourism or the Ministry of Tourism. The number of recipients of the female gender is quite large. The assistance provided is nine principles ingredients and *Balasa* (instant side-dishes assistance), which amounts to more than 2000 packages, distributed through the manager or management of hotels and restaurants, or to entrepreneurs massage parlors, spas, tourist-conscious communities, homestay groups, most of whom are women because women who work in this sector strongly feel the impact of the pandemic on their jobs and income. ⁴⁵

Methods and Tools

Hitherto, there has been no gender mainstreaming training and Gender Responsive Planning and Budgeting/*Perencanaan dan Penganggaran Responsif Gender (PPRG)* aimed at responding to the COVID-19 pandemic or aimed at new normal. Instead, the Regional Disaster Management Agency conducts further COVID-19 handling case training in prevention to the task force of covid-19 villages and villages in Batu City. This license is implemented based on

⁴⁴ Irsya Richa, "91 Persen Warga Kota Batu Alami Penurunan Pendapatan, Efek Pandemi Covid-19," jatimtimes.com, September 14, 2020, https://jatimtimes.com/baca/223608/20200914/104200/91-persen-warga-kota-batu-alami-penurunan-pendapatan-efek-pandemi-covid-19.

⁴⁵ Catharine, Batu City Tourism Office, FGD participant.

Mayor Regulation No. 78 and 79 in 2020, aiming to activate the task force from the minor level in RT/RW (organization in neighborhood level).⁴⁶

Community and Business Participation

One form of community participation in PUG implementation during the COVID-19 period can be seen in non-governmental organizations, as conveyed by DP3AP2KB and Dian Mutiara Women Crisis Center. The increasingly active PUSPAGA and P2TP2A due to the need for women and children protection services and family counseling involve actively addressing the cases faced by women and families during the COVID-19 pandemic. ⁴⁷

General assistance is also provided by the private sector and the business field, although it also experienced a decrease in turnover during the implementation of large-scale social restrictions. *Jatim Park Group,* for example, collaborated with the Tourism Office in the early days of the pandemic to assist fellow tourism businesses that most of whom are women. ⁴⁸

PUG Evaluation in Response to COVID-19 Pandemic Disaster

PUG has indeed been mandated as a perspective that should be used to plan, implement, monitor, and evaluate development. In practice, this is not a simple thing to do. In conditions without crisis caused by conflict and disaster, PUG implementation still requires the driving elements ranging from leaders' commitment (from the center to the region) to community participation. The development process is just and gender-equal. This study's data collection process is also supported by previously obtained data that explicitly shows that gender perspective is not yet a comprehensive perspective for local governments in planning development in the region. Commitments and policies may be lowered from above, from the central government. However, each region's gender-specific issues require specific guidelines to technical rules that require a more comprehensive understanding of gender issues. The planning and budgeting of development are inclusively able to solve these issues.

 $^{^{46}}$ Sunarvip Ra Indrata, "Aktifkan Satgas Terkecil Tingkat RT/RW," ubahlaku.id, December 9, 2020, https://ubahlaku.id/read/125754/aktifkan-satgas-terkecil-tingkat-rt-rw.

⁴⁷ Yulianingrum statement.

⁴⁸ Catherine statement.

In a crisis, both due to conflict and disaster, the implementation of PUG will require a higher sensitivity to see how the crisis impacts women and children and what women can do to deal with the condition. Similarly, what happens in the situation of the COVID-19 pandemic as a newly emerging disease, the Corona Sars-2 virus that produces the COVID-19 pandemic, is causing all policymakers at various levels to respond to this global disaster. It shows that the perspective of disaster has not been included in responding to this health disaster, especially in the district level.

Justice and gender equality primarily look at how particular groups (in this case, usually women) become vulnerable groups in society in general and specific social settings, particularly in crisis, including in disasters. Therefore, disaster perspective should also be used in PUG specifically to be more responsive in responding to crises in disasters, including disease outbreak disasters like recently happening.

One of the frameworks that can be used to understand and reduce disaster risk is the "Disaster Pressure and Release Model" or "Crunch Model." This model suggests that vulnerability, rooted in social, economic, and political processes, should be used to reduce the risk of disaster. According to this model, disasters occur only when threats, risks, or dangers affect vulnerable people.⁴⁹ Without triggers, natural phenomena themselves are not disasters. Therefore, vulnerability as an entrenched pressure of the social, economic, and political processes must be addressed or released to reduce disaster risk. Economic, social, and political processes can include discrimination, exploitation, or any based marginalization, whether age, religion, ethnicity, or gender.

This model postulates that if the vulnerability can be reduced, then disaster risk will also be diminished, and disasters can be mitigated. This model is only one of the disaster mitigation models, but it may be appropriate to study women's conditions specifically when dealing with disasters. This study shows that women are a vulnerable group and always vulnerable in society in this country in general. There is the danger of disease outbreaks caused by new viruses that result in pandemics worldwide. Central and local governments, in

Sawwa: Jurnal Studi Gender – Vol 16, No 2 (2021)

 $^{^{\}rm 49}$ Vu Minh Hai and Ines Smyth, *The Disaster Crunch Model: Guideline for A Gendered Approach* (London: Oxfam GB, 2012), 5.

particular, must have comprehensive mechanisms to deal with disasters, particularly to mitigate disasters that have specific impacts on vulnerable groups such as women and children in various aspects. Therefore, PUG is an instrument used to achieve gender equality and justice; it is necessary to include disaster perspectives in the indicators, to respond to crisis conditions such as the current COVID-19 pandemic outbreak. In this case, the local government, in particular, needs to respond to the COVID-19 pandemic as a disaster that poses a risk to its generally vulnerable communities and women and children in particular. Thus the implementation of PUG will be more comprehensive and responsive to crisis conditions.

In line with the needs of this disaster perspective, another important need is the gender-disaggregated data that shows how the COVID-19 pandemic affects men and women in different ways. Under normal conditions without a pandemic, gender disaggregated data is still a problem. Several studies in other regions in Indonesia show that the problem with gender-disaggregated data is partly because decision-makers lack understanding of gender-disaggregated data and have different perceptions of what is meant by gender-disaggregated data. They also have low awareness of using gender-disaggregated data in development planning and implementation processes and low willingness to collect disaggregated data and institutionalize it.⁵⁰ Gender disaggregated data are often not available because the PUG program is considered the same as the program for women, which is practical and not strategic.⁵¹ Whereas according to Hunt, segregation of data based on sex or disaggregated data is essential to carry out a gender analysis to assess the differences in the impact of development activities on men and women.⁵²

The need for gender-disaggregated data in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic is an urgent need globally. A report published jointly by UN Women, the International Labor Organization, the World Bank and several other

⁵⁰ Rr. Rina Antasari and Abdul Hadi, "Implementasi Kebijakan Perencanaan dan Penganggaran yang Responsif Gender di Pemerintah Palembang," *Jurnal Al-Maiyyah* 10, no. 1 (2017): 132–61.

⁵¹ W K Rahayu, "Analisis Pengarusutamaan Gender dalam Kebijakan Publik (Studi Kasus di BP3AKB Provinsi Jawa Tengah," *JAKPP (Jurnal Analisis Kebijakan & Pelayanan Publik 2*, no. 1 (2016): 93–108, https://doi.org/10.31947/jakpp.v2i1.1524.

 $^{^{52}}$ Juliet Hunt, "Introduction to Gender Analysis Concepts and Steps," $\it Development\,Bulletin\,64\,(2004):\,100-106.$

international institutions in 2021 explain that the COVID-19 pandemic may be gender-blind but not gender-neutral.⁵³ It means that significant gender disparities in various sectors, especially health, education, and socio-economics as a consequence of the pandemic have indeed occurred and are very large. However, the absence of data causes limited ability to measure, predict, and even respond to this disparity. So, it is difficult to make adequate policies and programs to address the issue of gender inequality which is exacerbated by this pandemic. This report recommends that all stakeholders, including policymakers to take action in 5 key areas: sorting all COVID-19 data at least by sex or ideally based on other key sociodemographic characteristics, collecting standardized and comparable gender data in areas where women are disproportionately affected COVID-19, increasing the use of non-traditional gender data collection techniques to fill critical gender data gaps, for example, using social media data, rapidly expanding COVID-19 related data availability access and use, and providing a coordinated data infrastructure to produce gender data during and after the COVID-19 pandemic.54 This genderdisaggregated data must be available in all sectors because it will be vital both to respond to COVID-19 as a health issue and its impact on other sectors.

Conclusion

The data from FGD and the searching for news information related to the impact of COVID-19 to Batu City in general, and for women's condition in particular, by using APE indicators that have been elaborated can be concluded the effects of the COVID-19 pandemic for the implementation of PUG in Batu City in 2020/2021 as follows: 1) During the COVID-19 pandemic, there are no specific policies in handling COVID-19 related to women's empowerment and child protection. Regional policies in dealing with COVID-19 in general or nationally are used as a reference to create programs that address women's issues or those related to women; 2) No particular institutions have been established to control the implementation of PUG during COVID-19. The pandemic management team or task force COVID-19 is oriented to prevent and

 $^{^{53}}$ Lotus McDougal et al., "Strengthening Gender Measures and Data in the COVID-19 Era: An Urgent Need for Change," UN Women, 2021, 5, https://www.unwomen.org/en/digital-library/publications/2021/03/strengthening-gender-measures-and-data-in-the-covid-19-era.

⁵⁴ McDougal et al., 9-18.

enforce health protocols, and elements of security and public order dominate those involved; 3) Human resources are not explicitly dispossessed to control PUG during COVID-19. However, Batu City has already had some paralegals assisted by the NGO, WCC Dian Mutiara that providing legal assistance for women; 4) The reallocation budget for handling COVID-19 reaches 50% so that only part of routine activities can be carried out; 5) There is no gender-based integrated data system yet, and data affected by COVID-19, in general, is also inaccurate; 6) No special training has been conducted to increase gender focal point capacity in the face of the COVID-19 pandemic; 7) Participation of NGOs and organizations and the business field to help Batu City deal with the impact of COVID-19. Although it has not been specified to support the implementation of PUG, some sectors have benefited the women of Batu City.

This study also finds that it is important to include a disaster perspective in PUG considering that Indonesia is a country with a large enough vulnerability to both man-made and natural disasters, and this COVID-19 pandemic makes this perspective increasingly urgent to be integrated into PUG. In addition, this study also emphasizes the importance of gender-disaggregated data affected by the COVID-19 pandemic and recommends PUG stakeholders to not only pay more attention to the importance of having and utilizing this data to respond to gender issues that arise and increase during the COVID-19 pandemic, but also use more innovative ways in collecting this gender-disaggregated data.[s]

References

- Amel. "Sektor Pariwisata Mulai Beri Dampak Positif terhadap PAD Kota Batu." nusadaily.com, November 15, 2020. https://nusadaily.com/regional/sektor-pariwisata-mulai-beri-dampak-positif-terhadap-pad-kota-batu.html.
- Antasari, Rr. Rina, and Abdul Hadi. "Implementasi Kebijakan Perencanaan dan Penganggaran yang Responsif Gender di Pemerintah Palembang." *Jurnal Al-Maiyyah* 10, no. 1 (2017): 132–61.
- BAPPENAS. "Evaluasi Pengarusutamaan Gender di 9 Sektor Pembangunan Tahun 2006." Jakarta: Kementerian Negara Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional/BAPPENAS, 2006.
- CNN Indonesia. "7 Dampak Pandemi yang Beresiko Dihadapi Anak-anak." cnnindonesia.com, July 23, 2020. https://www.cnnindonesia.com/gaya-hidup/20200722142651-284-527653/7-dampak-pandemi-yang-berisiko-dihadapi-anak-anak.

- ——. "LBH APIK: 508 Kasus Kekerasan Selama WFH, KDRT Tertinggi"." cnnindonesia.com, September 6, 2020. https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20200905225251-20-543207/lbh-apik-508-kasus-kekerasan-selama-wfh-kdrt-tertinggi.
- Febrianto, Vicki. "Jadi Rp1 Juta, Bantuan Nontunai Warga Kota Batu Terdampak Corona Naik." antaranews.com, April 11, 2020. https://www.antaranews.com/berita/1416295/jadi-rp1-juta-bantuan-nontunai-warga-kota-batu-terdampak-corona-naik.
- ———. "Ribuan Pekerja di Kota Batu Dirumahkan." antaranews.com, April 20, 2020. https://www.antaranews.com/berita/1432916/ribuan-pekerja-di-kota-batu-dirumahkan.
- Hai, Vu Minh, and Ines Smyth. *The Disaster Crunch Model: Guideline for A Gendered Approach*. London: Oxfam GB, 2012.
- Hunt, Juliet. "Introduction to Gender Analysis Concepts and Steps." *Development Bulletin* 64 (2004): 100–106.
- Indrata, Sunarvip Ra. "Aktifkan Satgas Terkecil Tingkat RT/RW." ubahlaku.id, December 9, 2020. https://ubahlaku.id/read/125754/aktifkan-satgas-terkeciltingkat-rt-rw.
- "Instruksi Presiden No. 9 Tahun 2000 tentang Pengarusutamaan Gender," 2020.
- Lewis, Helen. "The Coronavirus is a Disaster for Feminism: Pandemics Affect Men and Women Differently." The Atlantic, March 19, 2020. https://www.theatlantic.com/international/archive/2020/03/feminism-womens-rights-coronavirus-covid19/608302/.
- M. Rai, Shirin. *Mainstreaming Gender, Democratizing the State?* Manchester University Press, 2003.
- McDougal, Lotus, Anita Raj, Jennifer Yore, Sarah Boyd, Neeraja Penumetcha, Emily Courey Pryor, Diva Dhar, et al. "Strengthening Gender Measures and Data in the COVID-19 Era: An Urgent Need for Change." UN Women, 2021. https://www.unwomen.org/en/digital-library/publications/2021/03/strengthening-gender-measures-and-data-in-the-covid-19-era.
- Muna, Ayesha Nadya, Diva Tasya Belinda Rauf, and Ika Krismantari. "Angka KDRT di Indonesia Meningkat Sejak Pandemi COVID-19: Penyebab dan Cara Mengatasinya." The Conversation, August 6, 2020. https://theconversation.com/angka-kdrt-di-indonesia-meningkat-sejak-pandemi-covid-19-penyebab-dan-cara-mengatasinya-144001.
- Nugroho, Riant. *Gender dan Strategi Pengarusutamaannya di Indonesia*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2011.
- Perdana, Nugraha. "2.279 Balita di Kota Batu Alami Stunting." Radar Malang, July 28, 2020. https://radarmalang.jawapos.com/malang-raya/28/07/2020/2-279-balita-di-kota-batu-alami-stunting/.

- "Petunjuk Pelaksanaan Perencanaan dan Penganggaran yang Responsif Gender untuk Kementerian dan Lembaga." *Kementerian Pemberdayaan Perempian dan Perlindungan Anak*, 2012.
- Power, Kate. "The COVID-19 Pandemic Has Increased the Care Burden of Women and Families." *Sustainability: Science, Practice and Policy* 16, no. 1 (2020): 67–73. https://doi.org/10.1080/15487733.2020.1776561.
- Radhitya, Theresia Vania, Nunung Nurwati, and Maulana Irfan. "Dampak Pandemi COVID-19 terhadap Kekerasan dalam Rumah Tangga." *Jurnal Kolaborasi Resolusi Konflik* 2, no. 2 (2020): 111–19. https://doi.org/10.24198/jkrk. v2i2.29119.
- Rahayu, W K. "Analisis Pengarusutamaan Gender dalam Kebijakan Publik (Studi Kasus di BP3AKB Provinsi Jawa Tengah." *JAKPP (Jurnal Analisis Kebijakan & Pelayanan Publik* 2, no. 1 (2016): 93–108. https://doi.org/10.31947/jakpp. v2i1.1524.
- Rahma, Shuvia. "Pandemi, Puspaga Batu Panen Sambatan Kasus KDRT hingga Belajar Online." Radar Malang, October 12, 2020. https://radarmalang.jawapos.com/malang-raya/kota-batu/12/10/2020/pandemi-puspaga-batu-panen-sambatan-kasus-kdrt-hingga-belajar-online/.
- Redaktur Surabaya Post. "Terdampak Pandemi Covid-19, PAD Kota Batu Menurun"." surabayapost.id, June 30, 2020. https://surabayapost.id/terdampak-pandemi-covid-19-pad-kota-batu-menurun/.
- Ria, Brouwers. "Revisiting Gender Mainstreaming in International Development. Goodbye to an Illusionary Strategy." *ISS Working Paper Series/General Series* 556 556 (2013): 1–36.
- Richa, Irsya. "91 Persen Warga Kota Batu Alami Penurunan Pendapatan, Efek Pandemi Covid-19." jatimtimes.com, September 14, 2020. https://jatimtimes.com/baca/223608/20200914/104200/91-persen-warga-kota-batu-alami-penurunan-pendapatan-efek-pandemi-covid-19.
- ———. "Awal Tahun 2021 Dinas Pariwisata Kota Batu Bakal Bentuk Tim Satgas Covid-19 Angkatan II." Jatimnews, December 19, 2020. https://jatimtimes.com/baca/231571/20201219/085600/awal-tahun-2021-dinas-pariwisata-kota-batu-bakal-bentuk-tim-satgas-covid-19-angkatan-ii.
- ——. "Dampak Covid-19, PAD Kota Batu Hilang Rp 80,8 Miliar." jatimtimes.com, April 7, 2020. https://jatimtimes.com/baca/212326/20200407/185400/dampak-covid-19-pad-kota-batu-hilang-rp-80-8-miliar.
- Subrahmanian, Ramya. "Making Sense of Gender in Shifting Institutional Contexts: Some Reflections on Gender Mainstreaming." In *Feminisms in Development: Contradictions, Contestations and Challenges*, 113–121, 2007.
- Sulaeman, Kirana Mahdiah, and Fenny Rizka Salsabila. "Dampak COVID-19 terhadap Kaum Perempuan: Perspektif Feminisme." *Jurnal Sentris* 1, no. 2 (2020): 159–72. https://doi.org/10.26593/sentris.v1i2.4283.159-172.