Power Relations in the Stadium Stands: Strengthening Gender Equality in Indonesian Football Club Supporters

Bayu Mitra A. Kusuma,¹ Theresia Octastefani²

¹National Dong Hwa University, Taiwan, Province of China, ²National Dong Hwa University & Universitas Gadjah Mada

Corresponding Author: Bayu Mitra A. Kusuma, email: 81090B006@gms.ndhu.edu.tw, No. 1号, Section 2, Daxue Rd, Shoufeng Township, Hualien County, Taiwan 974

Abstract: Indonesian football competition is often seen as a masculine sport only suitable for men supporters. But now, women's supporter groups are increasingly popping up. Therefore, this study aims to analyze how hierarchical and power relations between women and men members in Brigata Curva Sud (BCS), a supporter base of PSS Sleman football club, which in 2017 was praised as the best ultra supporter in Asia. This study uses the power relation theory from Michel Foucault to analyze this phenomenon. The research method used is qualitative with a descriptive approach. The research results showed that BCS had put gender equality as the foundation of its organization: First, BCS has a manifesto of "no leader just together," which implies that BCS does not recognize a hierarchical organizational structure. Each member has the same rights and obligations in formulating the organization's future and making any agreed decisions. Second, there is no unequal power relation between women and men members in BCS. The only supreme power in the BCS that produces knowledge is a deliberative forum open to all members regardless of social background or gender.

Keywords: hierarchy; power relation; gender equality; women's football supporter

Abstrak: Kompetisi sepak bola Indonesia sering dipandang sebagai olahraga maskulin yang hanya cocok untuk suporter laki-laki. Namun kini kelompok suporter perempuan semakin banyak bermunculan. Oleh karena itu, penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis bagaimana hierarki dan relasi kuasa antara anggota perempuan dan laki-laki di Brigata Curva Sud (BCS), basis pendukung PSS Sleman yang pada tahun 2017 dinobatkan sebagai ultras terbaik di Asia. Untuk menganalisis fenomena tersebut, penelitian ini menggunakan teori relasi kuasa dari Michel Foucault. Metode penelitian yang digunakan adalah kuisioner dengan pendekatan deskriptif. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa BCS telah meletakkan dasar gender sebagai dasar organisasi: Pertama, BCS memiliki manifesto "no leader just together" yang menyiratkan bahwa BCS tidak mengenal struktur organisasi yang hierarkis. Setiap anggota memiliki hak dan kewajiban yang sama dalam merumuskan masa depan organisasi dan melaksanakan setiap keputusan yang disepakati. Kedua, tidak ada relasi kuasa yang timpang antara anggota perempuan dan laki-laki di BCS. Satu-satunya kekuasaan tertinggi di internal BCS yang menghasilkan pengetahuan adalah forum deliberatif yang terbuka untuk semua anggota tanpa memandang latar belakang sosial atau gender. Temuan ini tidak mengarah pada...
Introduction

Indonesia is a country with a long tradition in the football world. It is noted that Indonesia - still under the colonial rule of the Dutch - was the first Asian nation to compete in the World Cup in 1938. But behind this brilliant history, the achievements of Indonesian football continue to decline from year to year. But surprisingly, until now, football is still the most popular sport in Indonesia. According to Ariyanto, although Indonesian football is still lacking in achievements, its popularity can surpass Indonesian badminton, which has consistently produced many prestigious trophies at the international level. Therefore, this popularity makes Indonesian football a good money-making sport and the entertainment industry.

Football clubs in Indonesia are closely affiliated with local entities' pride. As stated by Su'udi, every club from the lowest level must have fanatical fans because of regional ties. Therefore, talking about Indonesian football is not only related to matches; the dynamics of the fans or supporters also color the journey of Indonesian football competitions. Chaplin defines supporters in two senses. First, it refers to providing something to understand the needs of others. Second, giving motivation or encouragement to others in making certain decisions. In the context of football supporters, it can be interpreted as the support given by an organized group to certain players or clubs to win matches.

From time to time, year to year, football supporters groups in Indonesia continue to emerge. This indicates that every human being has an intersectional identity. This identity can include gender, race, nation, religion, ethnicity, or

---


3 Achmad Su'udi, Football Inspirations for Success. (Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama, 2006), 94.

social status. For this reason, humans always want to identify with something, one of which is the football supporter base. Football has become a new form of identity attached to fans or supporters. Sociologically, the formation of a supporter base can be understood with Max Weber’s thinking which emphasizes the active role of individuals in social processes that can change the work of social structures.

In Indonesia, football is still often identified with masculinity. Football incorporates displays of strength, power, endurance and usually involves physical violence between the participants. Thereby reinforcing notions of male physical aptitude. Moreover, violence and clashes between supporters in Indonesia still often cause death. So when women are involved in football, it is always considered unusual.

Moreover, various violence and sexual harassment incidents have occurred in Indonesia's football supporters' history. Even more recently, in 2022, sexual harassment in the stadium is still happening, such as sexist shouts at the International Youth Championship at the Jakarta International Stadium last April and touching the bodies of female journalists by unscrupulous supporters in the Semi-final of the Presidential Cup at the Maguwoharjo Stadium, Sleman. These incidents make people still think football stadiums are not friendly public spaces for women. This is what makes Indonesian people think football is only suitable for men.

But lately, there has been a tendency for women to become interested in football with the emergence of women’s supporter base in the stadium stands,

---


such as Aremanita, who supports Arema FC; Bonita, who supports Persebaya Surabaya, The Jak Angel, who supports Persija Jakarta, Ladies Curva Sud who support PSS Sleman, and many more. The presence of this women’s supporters group, on the one hand, enlivens the stadium, which gives the impression that football is now a modern sport that calls genders can enjoy. But on the other hand, there is a fact that the existence of this women’s support group is still subordinate to the supporter organization which men dominate. This seems to be a common condition in world football as suggested by Lenneis and Pfister that women have to comply with specific rules of conduct in the stadium, where masculine behavior for both men and women supporters is regarded as an ideal fan behavior. This indicates that there is still a hierarchical relationship between male supporter groups and female supporters, where male supporters still dominate power relations.

This research will examine the existence of Ladies Curva Sud (LCS), the women supporters group of Brigata Curva Sud (BCS), a loyal supporter of PSS Sleman. The author’s reasons for choosing this group are: First, BCS is a pioneer of the Indonesian supporters’ revolution. They are changing the impression of Indonesian supporters who are synonymous with violence into an entertaining action. Second, BCS is a group of supporters formed when the club they supported was relegated to a lower tier and slumped. Faithfully they were able to accompany PSS Sleman back to the highest level of the Indonesian football league. Third, Copa90, one of the media that monitors football fans’ development worldwide, awarded BCS as the 2017 best ultras in Asia. BCS beat other nominees, namely: Bangal Brigade (East Bengal, India), Boys of Straits (Johor Darul Ta’zim, Malaysia), Frente Tricolor (Suwon Samsung Bluewings, South Korea), and Urawa Boys (Urawa Red Diamonds, Japan). Based on the explanation above, the research question in this study is: how are the hierarchical and power relations between women and men members in the BCS supporter organization?

---


To discuss the hierarchical and power relations in the BCS, this research uses the power relation theory of Michel Foucault as an analytical tool. According to Foucault, power is a dimension of relations; where there is a relation, there is power. In this theory, the form of power in modern society is not sovereign power but disciplinary power. Disciplinary power is not based on authority for control but works to normalize behavior in social relations. This normalization process is internalized through habituation of attitudes and behavior. Power cannot be separated from knowledge. Power produces knowledge, and knowledge is shaped by power. Foucault calls knowledge an episteme, an authoritative form of knowledge established as a meaning for specific situations. In this case, it is important to reveal how football knowledge has implications for the power relations between women’s and men’s support groups within the BCS.

This research is necessary because, from a sociological perspective, this study discusses the problems of grassroots society that lead to social conflict and even death. Meanwhile, from a gender perspective, this study raises the issue that women or all genders have the same right to enjoy football in the stadium stands as a sport or entertainment. In other words, this is part of campaigning for a female-friendly public space. In general, research about the existence of women supporters in Indonesia can be seen in the article entitled "The Miracle of Women Supporters: Fanaticism in Indonesian Football" The results of this study suggest that women supporters are always present at every game conducted by the Indonesian football league clubs. They are enjoying the work of the team they like is realized by the form by collecting their favorite jersey and knick-knacks of their favorite team at the same time helping the team's finances, and they memorize the greatness of the club's songs supported.

While the research that refers explicitly to certain women's supporter groups is as follows: First, research about the women leadership in the Bart-Girl supporter's group. This study reveals that the leader in the Bart-Girl (women's football supporters of Barito Putera) has four roles, namely as an integrator, direction-setter, mediator to mediate problems among members, and as a group, representative to be a spokesperson, and negotiator. The leadership style of the Bart-Girl chairman is charismatic and democratic. Second, research about the Babel United FC women's football supporter community. This study suggests several motivations motivate women to join this community: the influence of those closest to them, regional spirit, entertainment facilities in their spare time, and idolizing certain players.

Last but not least, the previous research that specifically discussed the LCS was an article about the self-concept of PSS Sleman women's football supporters. Based on the study's results, the self-concept formed was related to their behavior, attitudes, and identity. Four principles shape their identity: not related to politics, being independent, limited to the stadium stands fence, and togetherness.

Several studies on women's supporter groups in Indonesia cannot be mentioned one by one here. Mapping from the authors shows that most of these articles discuss the process of organizational establishment, activities as proof of existence, reasons for liking football, leadership within female supporters, identity, and self-image. This research will do something different; besides continuing to discuss the existence of women's supporter groups, this research will also analyze the hierarchy and power relations between women and men members in a supporter organization which, to various media reports and public opinion, are still often dominated by men.


Research Method

This study uses qualitative research with a descriptive approach to examine the hierarchical and power relations between women and men football supporters in the BCS. The authors used descriptive qualitative research to describe the results in a systematic, factual, and accurate sentence regarding the facts and the relationship between phenomena. To obtain data in this study, the data collection techniques used are divided into two: First, interviews. Interviews were conducted with five informants who are volunteers or members of LCS. It should be understood that BCS (and LCS) do not accommodate a formal structure in their organizations, so all members are positioned equally as volunteers. This is a particular characteristic of ultras supporters. In this case, the authors need to explain that the interview was conducted online due to the uncertain situation of the Covid-19 pandemic in Indonesia. This is to maintain the resource persons' health, safety, and comfort. The consequences of an interview study need to be addressed concerning possible harm to the subject and the expected benefits of participating in the study.18

Second, literature study. The authors are very aware of the limitations of this research and that the interview process cannot be carried out optimally. Therefore, the authors will enrich the data by studying related documents such as scientific journal articles, books, newspapers, magazines, and other sources. One of the most critical data sources in this literature study is bcsxpss.com which is the official website of BCS (and LCS). The author describes various information from the site as the initial basis for the analysis. The collected data is then analyzed using an interactive model from Miles and Huberman, which consists of data reduction, data presentation, and concluding.19

The Manifesto for Equality and Togetherness

For football fans in Indonesia, being part of a supporter organization is not just euphoria but has become a pride and identity. According to Molina, identity in a support group is patterned by three things: the individual, the city, and the

club.20 Previously, every individual who supported PSS Sleman joined a structured supporter's association called Slemania. But apparently, some individuals who are members of the ultras group in Slemania have different ways of showing their fanaticism. The centrality (which, according to ultras members, leads to inequality) in the Slemania organization is considered to have failed to accommodate the growing diversity.

To express their group, the ultras group decided to step aside and chose the other side of the tribune – the south tribune, to be precise. The small group of ultras in the south stand displayed an exciting identity so that they grew more prominent. As a result, in 2011, they officially formed Brigata Curva Sud or BCS. BCS is a name taken from the Italian language. This means that the south tribune brigade, where the supporters of the BCS members, always crowd the south tribune of the Maguwoharjo Stadium when PSS Sleman is playing. This group was inspired by the 2009 film L'ultimo Ultras, which revolves around the life of Italian ultras.21 This film is one of the entrances to ultras culture, which BCS finally adopted through the "glocalization" process. BCS draws inspiration from ultra fan groups in their colors, songs, and merchandise. But they broke away from Italy's brutal zealots in one noteworthy way: the growing presence of women in the Maguwoharjo stadium stands.22

An interview with a resource person stated that along with the increasing number of female members in BCS, they then named themselves Ladies Curva Sud or LCS. The existence of LCS is interesting to be analyzed further. This is because the presence of female supporters in most supporter groups in Indonesia is only like a compliment or subordinate to the male supporter group. They are often only used as bait in the stands to get more camera attention in live broadcasts and promotional apparel jersey models to profit. In many cases, they are victims of sexual harassment in the stadium stands. To


explore the existence of LCS in the BCS support group, the authors did first unbox bcsxpss.com, which is the official website of BCS.

Giulianotti and Robertson mention that the internet plays an essential role in the globalization of football and in forming a collective identity of supporters.\(^{23}\) Therefore, it is very appropriate if an Indonesian modern supporter group like BCS has a neat and comprehensive website. Dominated by black, which characterizes the ultras color, and combined with a bit of green as the color of PSS Sleman, the web page presents a lot of information about BCS, which is organized into seven rubrics, including home, news, and photos, chants, manifesto, and chapter communities. From the seven rubrics, the author’s most attention is due to the use of a term rarely found in the football world, namely manifesto. The manifesto consists of eight points, one of which is "no leader just together". Based on the explanation from interview sources, this manifesto means there is no hierarchical organizational structure, no definitive leader or chairperson, and no difference between men and women members; there is only togetherness. Although it has grown into a large organization, BCS refuses to become an organization with a hierarchical structure. This has the aim that all members have the same rights and obligations in maintaining the organization's existence.

The authors must admit that the manifesto "no leader just together," on the one hand, is very interesting to investigate further. However, on the other hand, it was difficult for the authors to determine who the central figure should be interviewed. This is because most of the members of BCS or LCS are reluctant to comment on their organizational structure. For information, the conditions described above are not the first time this has occurred. The investigative experience of Tempo Magazine also shows the same difficulty.\(^{24}\) They always emphasize that they are volunteers; they don't want to be called administrators or management. Therefore, no one name has the right to represent the group as

---


a whole, and all members have the same rights and obligations in every decision-making.

Based on the statement of some informants, then a question arises: if there is no hierarchical organizational structure, how can strategic decisions as a direction for members be produced? From an interview source, the answer was through a deliberative forum. In this case, every policy or decision concerning the group's interests is obtained through a forum open to members. In the forum, everyone present has the right to express ideas or opinions by prioritizing good ethics. For the forum to be effective, the participants who attend are usually representatives from each chapter community under the auspices of BCS. Delegates or representatives who come are also determined through deliberation forums at the respective chapter community level. Each chapter takes turns hosting and coordinating the forum. These ideas or opinions will then be discussed, filtered, sharpened to reach a mutual agreement, and circulated to all members.

The things discussed in deliberative forums generally include the choreography and chants displayed in the next match, financial position, and the problems plaguing the PSS Sleman football club. BCS members considered that decision-making through this scheme more effective and egalitarian than a single decision or a chairperson. The absence of a definitive hierarchical structure was also used as a fortress so that practical political elements could not infiltrate the BCS. The BCS strictly forbids practical politics from entering the south stadium tribune because it is considered divisive. However, BCS does not prohibit its members from practicing practical politics as a professional job as long as they do not use the BCS name or identity as a political campaign capital.

Most BCS and LCS members are educated youth like university students. Therefore, they are very professional and have many references for coordinating large masses of people. The compliance of BCS members with applicable regulations, even though they do not have a definitive leader or leader, is exciting and rarely found in large-scale groups in Indonesian football. A system without an outstanding leader with high solidarity is a characteristic of traditional groups typical of Javanese people who live in a *gemeinschaft* manner. This principle of equality makes them even more cohesive and purposeful. The absence of an individual cult at the top of the group like other
football supporter groups in Indonesia – for example, Yuli Sumpil in the Aremania supporter group and Andie Peci in the Bonek supporter group – makes men and women have equal positions in this group. This fact is in line with the statement by Kennedy that awareness of understanding individual equality affects the cohesiveness of BCS and LCS.25 From the explanation above, it can be concluded that there is no hierarchical relationship between BCS and LCS because all members have the same rights and obligations in the name of togetherness.

**Deliberative Forum as a Supreme Power**

Various studies have shown that gender domestication barriers are still an issue that needs to be developed in sports and the world of supporters. Then what about the existence of LCS, which is an integral part of BCS? Since established in 2012, LCS continues to maintain its presence above the stadium stands for PSS Sleman and fights the issue of discrimination through actual actions, not just demands with words. The interview result explained that LCS sang loudly for 90 minutes in every match of PSS, escorting PSS Sleman to rival stadiums over land and sea. They are often crammed into the stadium, with the scorching heat and heavy rain on the stadium stands they also feel. They are often hit by throwing and injured when there is a riot.26

This is very easy to cause trauma for women who are often seen as weak. But they gave proof by standing proud. For them, this struggle is clear evidence that the LCS, which consists of women, is not a supporter group that is weak, spoiled, and wants to get more facilities. This independence is firmly entrenched because BCS is a group of supporters committed to realizing gender equality and fighting sexual violence in stadiums. That commitment has now been proven again. In response to the incident of sexual harassment of female journalists in the President’s Cup, as mentioned in the background, BCS as a supporter and PSS as a club have agreed to blacklist the perpetrators from entering the stadium permanently.

---

Back in the early history of the formation of the LCS, indeed, in the beginning, the LCS members were usually the girlfriends of the BCS members who accompanied them to the stadium, but now their fanaticism has grown. So, although several studies have shown a positive relationship between gender relations inequality and dating violence,\textsuperscript{27} it does not apply in the stadium stands for BCS. When LCS takes part in the action in the stands, their security automatically becomes the shared responsibility of all BCS members.

According to one member of LCS, with the formation of the women’s ultras group, she and other female members felt more enthusiastic when they supported PSS Sleman. If they want to hug and cuddle while celebrating a goal, then it’s more comfortable and more bonding with each other.\textsuperscript{28} Moreover, the situation in this LCS group is delightful for LCS members who are Muslimah, where touching the opposite sex, such as hugging, is taboo. However, the existence of the LCS had encountered obstacles when they wanted to watch PSS Sleman play. The negative judgments from people about the fans who often fight had become an obstacle to getting permission to watch the match live in the stadium.

But now, BCS actions which have always been entertainment, have changed the public’s perception of supporters. BCS’s manifesto strongly emphasizes creativity, loves peace, respects differences, and recognizes that every individual is equal. So when asked how is the power relation between female and male members in the BCS, every LCS member said there is no unequal power relationship. Because until now, in BCS, there are no factions or cult figures. No one feels that they have a higher position, no one feels the most powerful, no one feels they have higher knowledge about the organization, all blend into one. They felt that as long as the LCS was established, there was never any intervention or domineering attitude from male members. They genuinely think equal both off and on the pitch.

According to Michel Foucault’s theory, power is a dimension of the relationship; where there is a relation, there is power, then the highest power in


BCS is a deliberative forum. No one individual has more authority in controlling the organization. Thus, male and female members have the same rights and obligations, so there is no domination. Everything related to the future of the organization, the future of the PSS Sleman club, is discussed in a deliberative forum that is open to every member without exception. Therefore, there is no reason to show unequal power relations between genders because each gender has the same rights and obligations.

Suppose Foucault's theory says that power produces knowledge, and knowledge is shaped by power. In that case, the deliberative forum, as the highest power in the BCS, will share knowledge equally with all members regardless of social status or gender. For example, each member has the same rights and obligations in proposing the form of choreography for the match that PSS Sleman will play. After the decision is made, each member has the right to know and is obliged to carry out the decision. All aspects of the organization are opened as wide as possible so that all members have the same knowledge regarding the organization. The mass media line newspaper and online news are often invited to disseminate the forum results. This is a characteristic of BCS and cannot be done by other football supporter groups in Indonesia, which usually have the highest conductor. BCS and LCS have proven that in the world of football supporters, equal gender relations can be realized.

Equal gender relations also impact the opening of the stadium stands for all gender backgrounds. In many cases, female supporters are often the targets of sexual harassment, and this can be prevented in the BCS and LCS communities that congregate at the stadium stands. The safety and dignity of each member are a shared responsibility to be maintained. In their mindset, there was an agreement that they were present at the stadium stand only to support PSS Sleman with creativity and choreography, not for any other purpose. Once again, it should be emphasized that in BCS and LCS, when referring to Foucault’s theory, it states that the highest power is the deliberative forum, meaning that if a member commits an ethical violation, they will be faced with the deliberative forum. Commitments like these make LCS and BCS worthy of being used as a reference in building gender equality for supporters in Indonesian football.
Conclusion

Based on the discussion above, it can be concluded that BCS has put gender equality as the foundation of its organization: First, in the existence of BCS, there is no hierarchical organizational structure. This also applies to the presence of LCS and its relationship with male supporters in BCS. Manifesto "no leader just together" can shape the character of each member who upholds individual equality so that each member has the same rights and obligations in determining the organization's future and carrying out every decision that has been agreed in the deliberative forum. The elimination of the cult figure and the principle of mutual feeling makes them even more cohesive and purposeful. Second, there is no unequal power relation between male and female members in BCS. The only supreme power in the BCS and LCS is a deliberative forum open to all members. Deliberative forum, the highest authority will share knowledge related to the direction and policies of the organization with all members relatively, regardless of social status or gender. Thus, BCS and LCS have shown a different face in the world of Indonesian football supporters, fanatics, and coding ethics.

Acknowledgment

The authors would like to thank Associate Professor Dr. Li-Fang Liang, who guided the completion of this manuscript during the Sociology of Gender course (Fall Semester 2021) at the Ph.D. Program in Asia Pacific Regional Studies, College of Humanities and Social Sciences, National Dong Hwa University, Hualien, Taiwan.

References


