

THE ANALYSIS OF HADITH HERMENEUTICS BASED ON MUSTAFA AL-SIBA’'S PERSPECTIVE

Hidayatus Sholihah

Universitas Islam Sultan Agung Semarang
hida@unissula.ac.id

Ahmad Zaenurrasyid

Universitas Islam Sultan Agung Semarang
zaenurrosyid@unissula.ac.id

Sarjuni

Universitas Islam Sultan Agung Semarang
sarjuni@unissula.ac.id

DOI: 10.21580/wa.v10i1.14424

Abstract

Mustafa Al-Siba’i is a warrior figure for the authenticity of Hadith. After Muhammad, a messenger of God, passed away, some orientalist emerged who doubt the authenticity of the Hadith. Then Mustafa is one of the figures at the forefront of countering the Orientalists who are trying to make Muslims doubt the authenticity of Hadiths. This article aims to analyze how Hadith Hermeneutics from the perspective of Mustafa Al-Siba’i. Therefore, who is the figure of Al-Siba’i, what is his educational background, and his works will be discussed, before analyzing his thoughts related to the authenticity of the Hadith to find out the style of his thinking. The method applied was library research or reviewing various existing literature, mainly sourced from various journals and books to explore Mustafa Al-Siba’i’s thoughts. The results of the study of various works of literature explain that Al-Siba’i is an extraordinary scholar and preacher who actively writes and produces various logical, systematic, and monumental works. He has written various works to counter the efforts of orientalist or liberal figures to weaken the Muslim community's belief in Hadith. Al-Siba’i’s works can influence Muslims to the authenticity of Hadith as Islamic law or the second reference for Muslims after the Qur’an.

Keywords: Authenticity of Hadiths, Hermeneutics of Hadiths, Al-Siba’i’s Thoughts

Abstrak

Mustafa Al-Siba’i adalah salah satu sosok ulama yang memperhatikan keaslian suatu hadis. Setelah Muhammad SAW wafat, beberapa orientalis telah muncul yang meragukan keaslian hadis. Kemudian Mustafa adalah salah satu tokoh yang berada di garis depan melawan para orientalis yang berusaha membuat umat Islam meragukan akan keaslian hadis. Artikel ini bertujuan untuk menganalisis bagaimana hermeneutika hadis menurut perspektif Mustafa Al-Siba’i. Oleh karena itu, akan dibahas juga

siapakah sosok Al-Siba'i, apa latar belakang pendidikan dan karya-karyanya sebelum menganalisis pemikirannya terkait keaslian hadis untuk mengetahui gaya pemikirannya. Metode yang digunakan dalam artikel ini adalah jenis penelitian kepustakaan (*library research*) atau mengkaji berbagai literatur yang ada, terutama bersumber dari berbagai jurnal dan buku yang mengeksplorasi tentang pemikiran Mustafa Al-Siba'i. Hasil kajian menjelaskan bahwa Al-Siba'i adalah seorang ulama, pendakwah, sosok ulama yang aktif menulis dengan berbagai karya logis, sistematis dan monumental. Dia telah menulis berbagai karya untuk melawan upaya orientalis atau tokoh liberal untuk melemahkan kepercayaan Muslim terhadap keaslian suatu hadis. Karya-karya Al-Siba'i dapat berkontribusi dalam mempengaruhi umat Islam terhadap keaslian hadis yang diakui sebagai hukum Islam atau referensi kedua bagi umat Islam setelah Al-Qur'an.

Keywords: Ulumul hadis, hermeneutik hadis, Al-Siba'i's

A. Introduction

Hadith is the second source of law for Muslims. Therefore, the hadith has a very important position and role in Islam¹. Concerning the Qur'an, Hadith has 3 main functions as follows: 1). *as bayan ta'kid or taqrir* to the provisions of the laws in the Qur'an. 2) as a parrot of interpretation of the mujmal laws contained in the Qur'an and 3) as a bayan tasyri for everything that has no law in the Qur'an. The existence of the hadith of the prophet is very important in Islam. Therefore, some research related to hadith have been carried out by Muslims (muhadditsin) and non-Muslims, who are better known as Western Orientalists, namely Western non-Muslims who study Islam. They have doubts about the validity of the hadith as a basis for arguing and the second Islamic legal proposition after the Qur'an².

The orientalis have studied and focused their research on hadith. Whereas previously they were only interested in conducting research and studies on Islamic material in general and not specifically on hadith, such as literature and Islamic history material. Goldziher is an orientalist who is very dangerous for Islam because he always criticizes the authenticity of hadith according to his lust and narrow perspective on Islam. The culmination of the attack on hadith as the second Islamic law was when Goldziher succeeded in writing the book *Muhammadenische Studien* (Islamic Studies) which contained various criticisms of hadith in the 19th century AD. According to Mustafa Al-Siba'i, why Goldziher was considered the most dangerous orientalist because he focuses on studying and researching hadith, to weaken the position of hadith as the second source of Islam by always criticizing its authenticity and weakening its position, especially hadiths related to Islamic law³.

This article discusses some of the thoughts of Mustafa Al-Siba'i as a warrior figure for the authenticity of Hadith, especially in countering various arguments from orientalis who doubted the authenticity of hadith after the death of *Rasulullah* and also in countering

¹ Nurkholis Hauqola, "HERMENEUTIKA HADIS: Upaya Memecah Kebekuan Teks," *Jurnal THEOLOGIA* 24, no. 1 (2016): 261–84, <https://doi.org/10.21580/teo.2013.24.1.324>.

² Khairul H. Fikri, "Fungsi Hadis Terhadap Al-Quran," *Fungsi Hadis Terhadap Al-Quran* 12, no. 2 (2015): 178–88.

³ Muhammad Arwani Rofi'i, "Mustafa Al-Siba'Iy Dan Kritiknya Terhadap Pandangan Orientalis Tentang Hadis Dan Sunnah Nabi," *KABILAH: Journal of Social Community* 4, no. 1 (2019): 90–107, <https://doi.org/10.35127/kbl.v4i1.3679>.

the arguments of a liberal figure, Ahmad Amin. In this article, the author uses the library research method by using text analytical studies⁴.

This library research is different from some research. The first research from Sultan Syarif Riau State Islamic University, entitled *Biography and Work of Mustafa Al-Siba'i and Fatema Mernissi*, discusses the life history of Mustafa Al-Siba'i, his participation in the resistance of the French and Syrian invaders, Mustafa's involvement Al-Siba'i in the Muslim Brotherhood, his productive years and his works until his death. Uniquely, during his illness, Mustafa Al-Siba'i who was full of difficulties was scientifically the most productive period in his life span. Mustafa Al-Siba'i has extensive experience in the world of writing. A-Siba'i is a scholar and expert in jurisprudence mujtahid. He mastered Islamic jurisprudence from reliable sources, studied the problems of the times that continued to develop and made an analogy with the laws that have a foothold in the *Quran, Sunnah, and ijma' salaf* scholars⁵.

Research by Muhammad Arwani Rofi'i, entitled *Mustafa Al-Siba'i and His Critique of Orientalist Views on Hadith and Sunnah of the Prophet*, Kabilah: Journal of Social Community discusses the research on the Prophet's hadith and the difference in views of the majority of scholars regarding the Prophet's hadith, some of them are of the view that the sunnah or hadith is mostly invalid, then doubt the authenticity of the hadith as the Prophet's words. According to them, hadith is only the result of the interaction of various schools that have emerged recently in the Islamic community⁶. This article contains the rebuttal of Al-Siba'i against some of the arguments stated by the Orientalists.

Nurul Hakim's research, entitled *Philosophical Perspectives of Islamic Law and Orientalist Thought towards Sunnah*, discusses the Qur'an and Sunah as sources of law in Islam that have a relationship with each other. The Qur'an and Sunah have a very close correlation. But in this regard, orientalist doubt the authenticity of the sunnah as the main source of law in Islam. Orientalists argue that the bookkeeping of the hadith, which was carried out long after the Prophet Muhammad saw his death, is very questionable for the authenticity of the hadith. The orientalist think that the sunnah is only an Arab tradition so it is impossible to make it a source of Islamic law⁷.

B. Research Method

The method applied was the library research method⁸, which collects data by examining various sources both from books and from various national and international journals originating from journal bases including Google Scholar, and Springer. Taylor and Francis Journal. These data are then analyzed using analytical induction

⁴ Denzin & Lincoln, *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research* (Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications Inc., 2011), 23-76.

⁵ Nurcholis Madjid, *Mustafa Al Siba'i Sunnah Dan Peranannya Dalam Penetapan Hukum Islam : Sebuah Pembelaan Kaum Sunni (Terjemahan)* (Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1991), 76-89.

⁶ Rofi'i, "Mustafa Al-Siba'Iy Dan Kritiknya Terhadap Pandangan Orientalis Tentang Hadis Dan Sunnah Nabi, 9-25."

⁷ Nurul Hakim, "Perspektif Filsafat Hukum Islam Dan Pemikiran Orientalis Terhadap Sunnah," *Jurnal EduTech* 5, no. 1 (2019): 45-56, <http://journal.umsu.ac.id/index.php/edutech/article/view/2761/2692>.

⁸ Harvey Russell Bernard, *Research Methods in Anthropology : Qualitative and Qualitative Approaches*, 2nd Editio (Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications Inc., n.d.), 284-322.

C. Results and Discussion

Biography and Works of Mustafa Al-Siba'i

Born in the city of Homs, Syria, Al-Siba'i with his full name Musthafa Bin Husni Abu Hasan Al-Siba'i, in 1915 AD / 1333 H is a descendant of a family of scientists. His father and grandfather were in charge of the sermon at the magnificent mosque in Homs. His father often invited Al-Siba'i to attend science assemblies with the great scholars of Homs. During his life, Al-Siba'i spent part of his time studying and preaching⁹.

Al-Siba'i also actively participated in fighting the French invaders in Syria until he was arrested and imprisoned for the first time by the French government in 1931 for spreading anti-French political leaflets in Homs. Furthermore, because of his courage in giving speeches against French politics and colonialism, he was imprisoned for the second time¹⁰. In 1933 Mustafa Al-Siba'i studied at al-Azhar Egypt and was active with the Egyptian Muslim Brotherhood to carry out demonstrations against British colonialism in 1941 so in prison again this time by the Egyptian government for 3 months, but on the instructions of the British and transferred to Palestine and imprisoned there for 4 months. Only then was he released on bail¹¹.

His struggle in Syria is to fight and fight against moral decay in society and to foster people to follow the straight and true path of Islam through the Manhaj of the Muslim Brotherhood, which is considered competent in galvanizing and fostering Muslim society both as individuals and as members of the family and society, and the government. Islam with Islamic law. Al-Siba'i tries to include the content of the Islamic Education curriculum with tarbiyah Islamiyah material¹².

On Saturday 20 Jamadil Awal 1384 or October 3, 1964, Mustafa Al-Siba'i died. Of course, this is a deep sorrow for Muslims who feel lost. Even though Al-Siba'i has died, his spirit and thoughts continue to be engraved and engraved among Muslims. Among them is the pearl of wisdom from Mustafa As-Siba'i, "*This life needs to be rich with great works and short dreams.*"

Mustafa As-Siba'i . Educational Background and Socio-Political Network

In 1955 the Faculty of Sharia at the Syrian University was opened where Al-Siba'i became dean for the first time. During his time as dean, he was the head of the team for compiling the encyclopedia of Islamic jurisprudence with the compilers or writers who were scholars from around the world. This encyclopedia has a new and contextual format following the times. Solving the problems of the people by the times and based on the Qur'an, hadith, fiqh of the Salaf scholars, and the ijthihad of contemporary scholars¹³.

In 1949, Mustafa Al-Siba'i was elected by Damascus as their representative in the constituent assembly. he is a sympathetic member of the people's parliament and is very prominent because he often expresses the hopes and sufferings of the people, becomes the mouthpiece of the people's voice, and places the interests of the people above personal

⁹ Masrukhin Muhin, "Hadist Menurut Mustafa Al-Siba'i Dan Ahmad Amin (Suatu Kajian Komparatif)," *Al-Fath* 6, no. 1 (2012): 56–70.

¹⁰ Fikri, "Fungsi Hadis Terhadap Al-Quran, 1-9."

¹¹ Rofi'i, "Mustafa Al-Siba'i Dan Kritiknya Terhadap Pandangan Orientalis Tentang Hadis Dan Sunnah Nabi, 11-28"

¹² Umma Farida, "Diskursus Sunnah Sebagai Sumber Hukum Islam : Perspektif Ushuliyin Dan Muhadditsin," *Jurnal Pemikiran Hukum Dan Hukum Islam* 6, no. 1 (2015): 237–55.

¹³ Muhin, "Hadist Menurut Mustafa Al-Siba'i Dan Ahmad Amin (Suatu Kajian Komparatif), 27-31."

interests. Defender of truth and fight falsehood bravely without compromise. He was subsequently elected as vice chairman of the board and was a prominent member of the legislative committee. He is a figure who is more concerned with the fate of the people, fights for the people, and lives to solve various problems of the people so he refuses to enter the government parliament. In parliament, he is a member of the 9-member parliamentary legislature commission that writes draft laws¹⁴.

In 1950 Mustafa Al-Siba'i succeeded in becoming a professor at the Faculty of Law at the Syrian University, and in the same year, he succeeded in strengthening the character of Islam and distancing the secular character of the primary laws of the 1950s legislation. He was a defender of the Koran in the courtroom. parliament and did not hesitate to lead demonstrations for laws that are compatible with Islam. Then together with representatives from all corners of the Islamic world, he attended the General Islamic Congress in Pakistan in 1951¹⁵.

In 1956, the Islamic Conference in Damascus was held. Also this year, Mustafa Al-Siba'i visited universities in the West and reviewed the Islamic studies curriculum there as a delegation from Syrian universities. The countries he visited were Italy, England, Ireland, Belgium, Netherlands, Denmark, Norway, Sweden, Poland, Germany, Switzerland, and France. He met with the orientalis, discussed their erroneous opinions about Islam either scientifically or historically, and corrected them. In 1957, Mustafa Al-Siba'i received an invitation from Moscow University to travel to Russia. Most of the universities in Russia in the area he visited, lecturers of Eastern studies, history, and social studies, he met and discussed, their opinions and claims about Islam and the Muslims were wrong, he denied and dismissed.

Hadith Hermeneutics

Hermeneutics is a method used to understand and interpret texts. It takes a set of approaches and methods such as philosophy of theology, semantics, philosophy, anthropology, hermeneutics, and discourse analysis¹⁶. Born and developed in the Western Christian world, hermeneutics has expanded in the Eastern Islamic world. Different meanings emphasize different meanings. This is due to the different concentrations of the reviewers. There are three points of hermeneutics in the interpretation of hadith¹⁷

1. Interpretation from within the text (Meaning Within the Text).

This interpretation is called theoretical hermeneutics. In this case, the interpretation is carried out through two approaches as offered by Fredrich Schleiermacher (1768-1834). Namely with the approach of objective historical reconstruction and subjective historical reconstruction.

2. Interpretation of things around the text (Meaning Behind the Text).

This interpretation focuses or focuses on the actions or behavior of the interpreter or commentator in interpreting a text, so it does not focus on the correct and objective meaning of the text anymore. There are two different schools of hermeneutics, namely intentional hermeneutics and Gadamerian hermeneutics.

¹⁴ Rofi'i, "Mustafa Al-Siba'i Dan Kritiknya Terhadap Pandangan Orientalis Tentang Hadis Dan Sunnah Nabi, 22-26."

¹⁵ Moh. Turmudi, "AL SUNNAH; Telaah Segi Kedudukan Dan Fungsinya Sebagai Sumber Hukum," *Jurnal Pemikiran Keislaman* 27, no. 1 (2017): 1-12, <https://doi.org/10.33367/tribakti.v27i1.255>.

¹⁶ Hauqola, "HERMENEUTIKA HADIS: Upaya Memecah Kebekuan Teks, 50-73."

¹⁷ Fahrudin Faiz and Ali Usman, "HERMENEUTIKA AL QUR'AN: Teori, Kritik Dan Implementasinya" (Dialektika, 2019), 119-127.

Intentionalism holds the view that in a text it already has meaning from the compilers of the text, then it remains to be interpreted by the interpreter. Meanwhile, according to Gadamerian, the text does not yet have a meaning, so that meaning must be searched for, constructed, and reconstructed by the interpreter which is of course by the context in interpreting the verse. Thus, the meaning of the text is not static but develops according to who the reader is, and the time in interpreting it. The attainment of truth is not through the method but through the dialectic between the interpreter and the text which is commonly referred to as the hermeneutic circle.

Abū Zayd stated that in the interpretation of hermeneutics in a sacred text, there is meaning and significance. The meaning is always fixed and historical so the internal-linguistic and socio-cultural context at the time of the emergence of the text must be well understood¹⁸. Meanwhile, significance is the result of different readings/changes from the reader/interpreter with the period of formation of the text so that the form is dynamic. Then the meaning is expanded to search for its significance.

In this case, the text of the hadith always develops according to the social culture of the interpreter. Therefore, its nature is not only consumptive but there is always a productivity of further meaning. In the meaning behind the text, the science of hadith recognizes the tradition of knot *sanad* hadith. Sanad serves to 'prove' the historical process of the occurrence of hadith. The quality of hadith *sanad* is measured by the level of intellectuality, habits, hobbies, and other individually¹⁹.

Thus, according to the social culture of the interpreter of hadith texts, it always develops so that there is further productivity. The tradition of hadith criticism is known in interpretation. The historical process of the occurrence of hadith is evidenced by the *sanad*. To measure the quality of hadith *sanad*, the quality or not is based on the favorite habits of the interpreter's individual intellect, namely the religious integrity of behavior, daily understanding of *akidah* and politics, religious perception, behavior in daily life, strength and intelligence in the process of transmitting hadith²⁰.

3. Interpretation of "Agai nst" the Text (Meaning in Front of the Text)

The understanding of hadith is determined by the social interests that infiltrate the interpreter's power or the power of the interpreter. Thus, the hermeneutic text of hadith becomes antagonistic because in the interpretation he "suspects from the beginning that it was compiled so that from the beginning it is possible to examine how the messages in the organized hadith text are understood and used while looking for the essence of the Islamic teachings. Thus, the hadith is not considered only as a text arrangement. only, but the content of its literal meaning is trying to be explored from the cultural context²¹.

Hermeneutics tries to explore meaning by considering the horizons (horizons) that surround a hadith text, namely the linguistic horizon of the text (linguistic and social), the initiator (the capacity of the Prophet), and the reader (*mukhārij al-ḥadīth and mufassir*).

¹⁸ Mukhtar Mukhtar, Basri Mahmud, and Hamzah Hamzah, "KONTROVERSI KESARJANAAN AL-QUR'AN KONTEMPORER (TELAAH KRITIS HERMENEUTIKA AL-QUR'AN NASR HAMID ABU ZAID)," *Zawiyah: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 8, no. 2 (2022): 141–58.

¹⁹ Djazuli, *Ilmu Fiqh: Penggalan, Perkembangan, dan Penerapan Hukum Islam* (Jakarta: Kencana, 2012), 19-56.

²⁰ Hairillah, "Kedudukan As-Sunnah Dan Tantangannya Dalam Hal Aktualisasi Hukum Islam," *Mazāhib* Vol. XIV, (2015): 193.

²¹ Siti Fahimah, "Hermeneutika Hadis: Tinjauan Pemikiran Yusuf Al-Qordhowi Dalam Memahami Hadis," *Refleksi* 16, no. 1 (2018): 83–104, <https://doi.org/10.15408/ref.v16i1.10177>.

Understanding or interpretation then becomes the activity of reconstructing and reproducing the meaning of hadith contextually. The contextualization of this hadith does feel complicated because of the long-time gap between the time of the Prophet and the collectors of hadith, as well as the differences in patterns and schools of thought. Therefore, contextualization of hadith needs to be directed at criticizing historical sources with the target of seeking certainty regarding the truth of the recorded information, especially the study of the situation when the hadith was "presented", both in the context of the causes of the arrival of the hadith (*asbāb al-nurūd*), the appearance of the hadith text and its context. the sanad (*takebrij al-adī*), the codification of hadith (*tadwin al-adī*), to the interpretation of hadith²².

In other words, the historical approach needs to be prioritized in the interpretation of meaning in front of the text because the emergence of hadith cannot be separated from historical settings²³.

Borrowing the theory of double movements / Fazlur Rahman's dual movement, which distinguishes the hermeneutics of religious texts into two movements, namely from "the present situation to the time the Qur'an/hadith were revealed, and back to the present when the religious texts were applied". The "first movement" of the two movements above, is divided into two steps; First, we must understand that hadith is the answer to a historical problem or situation. Readings on special situations when Islam was present in the city of Mecca, Arabia must be done before specific texts in the perspective of macro situations within the boundaries of religion, customs, culture, society, and even life are thoroughly studied. Second, the specific answers are generalized and stated as statements that have a general moral-social purpose that can be extracted from specific texts in terms of socio-historical and rational-logical background²⁴.

Meanwhile, for the second movement, it must be carried out from this general view to a specific or specific view which at present must be formulated and also realized. That is, teachings that are still general must be united in a concrete socio-historical context in the present. Therefore, a careful study of the current situation and analysis of its various component elements is needed, so that the current situation and conditions can be assessed and changed appropriately to the extent necessary, and new priorities can be determined so that hadith values can be implemented effectively²⁵.

Allegations of Falsification of Hadith by Orientalists

The goal of Orientalism to study Arabic and Islam is the goal of Orientalists who want to learn about the hadith or sunnah of the apostle and criticize Mustafa as Sibai²⁶. This view always develops into the learning of all religious realms in the East, both in habituation, culture and geographical location, and various teachings. Factors that cause orientalists to study the East include trade factors, political factors, science, colonialism, and even religious factors²⁷.

²² Fikri, "Fungsi Hadis Terhadap Al-Quran, 1-7."

²³ Ma'mun Mu'min, "Hadist Dan Sunah Dalam Perspektif Fazlur Rahman," *Jurnal Studi Hadis* 1, no. 2 (2016): 311–30.

²⁴ Mu'min.

²⁵ Amin Fateh Amer, "A Critical Study of the Anti-Ḥadīth Ideology from a Qur'ānic Perspective" (University of Birmingham, 2010), 243-266.

²⁶ Rofi'i, "Mustafa Al-Siba'iy Dan Kritiknya Terhadap Pandangan Orientalis Tentang Hadis Dan Sunnah Nabi."

²⁷ Hakim, "Perspektif Filsafat Hukum Islam Dan Pemikiran Orientalis Terhadap Sunnah, 14-21."

There are several impetuses for the attack on the cross on the Islamic state, among them the first is the religious impulse which is driven by the fanaticism of the church authorities. The second is the political impetus of colonialism carried out by leaders in the European region who provide news about Islamic countries being able to live in prosperity. These countries are mainly in countries such as Palestine, Syria, Jordan, and Lebanon. Therefore, their leaders delegate to learn about the population or the beliefs of their people, so that they are better able to prepare for the process of attacking the Muslim population through the field of culture, as well as thinking, related to Islam²⁸.

The orientalist views see Islam from the bad side, both in religious conditions and institutionally, even the ulama figures in Islamic circles give negative images of the context of life in Islamic society. This becomes an easy target for orientalists to show that Islam is imaged as a society whose characters like to carry out killings unilaterally. Likewise in terms of how to illustrate the Islamic world they give a bad picture, giving a negative image of the habits of the Islamic community²⁹. Likewise, Islamic communities are punished by giving negative values in their respective countries as well as on the side of understanding religious texts that are understood fanatically and domination of lust.

For orientalists, their goal is to give a distorted view of religious texts that are deliberately researched, to provide a form of description of legal sources that are judged to be by their interests, for example, the problem of the historical hadith of the Prophet from the moral books that provide research on sharia. or problems in the book and so on. Therefore, the desired target for the orientalists is at least three parts. The first is its scientific purpose which provides scope for various main things, for example, to give doubts about the validity or effort³⁰.

The treatise of the prophet Muhammad as the main and first source of God's law provides denial of the Koran as a heavenly book. Therefore, Islam is as if there is no religion revealed by Allah, but on the other hand, the validity of the hadith from the Prophet is questioned and doubted.

A form of doubt about Islamic jurisprudence is raised, both in terms of skills in the Arabic language skills and its influence on a form of scientific development. The main goal of a real political order is to cover important things, including giving Muslims a movement for their religion and scriptures and even sharia or fiqh³¹. Therefore, doubting the existence of others on the heritage consists of its own historical culture which is imaged as the influence of Roman culture.

Other forms of weakening the faith of other Muslims are by distrusting the axis of Islam, as well as weakening the ties of brotherhood among Muslims ³². As for Goldziher's opinion on the sunnah, he considers that most of the hadiths are not authentic so the originality of the hadith is questioned by the prophet Muhammad. He stated that the hadith is more a result of a process of interaction of various understandings and beliefs which

²⁸ Baltabayeva Alyona et al., "Spiritual Understanding of Human Rights in Muslim Culture (The Problem of 'Ruh' – 'Spirit')," *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 217 (February 5, 2016): 712–18, <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.SBSPRO.2016.02.131>.

²⁹ Abd Qohin and Siti Kasiyati, "Criticism of Orientalist Critical Views Toward Hadith Studies," *Journal of Hadith Studies* 3, no. 1 (2020): 1–13.

³⁰ Qohin and Kasiyati.

³¹ Muhin, "Hadist Menurut Mustafa Al-Siba'i Dan Ahmad Amin (Suatu Kajian Komparatif), 50-62."

³² Hairillah, "Kedudukan As-Sunnah Dan Tantangannya Dalam Hal Aktualisasi Hukum Islam, 90-116."

then thrives in the midst of Islamic society³³. In his historical process, he also confirmed that the majority of hadiths were only the development of religion, social and political conditions, or the development of Islamic society in the early and second centuries³⁴. Thus, Goldziher pointed out that doubts that the Umayyads were a group that always prioritized worldly issues solely to conquer their colonized cities.

To respond to this slanted accusation from the orientalist, one of the answers is that the lies committed by the orientalist against the Umayyad government are that Ibn Sa'ad narrates in his *Tabaqah* book about the worship of 'Abd al-Malik which has a level of piety. Before becoming the caliph, he was given the nickname *hamamah* al mosque, this is because he was considered to have great worship to the point that Ibn Umar asked the question "What do you think if we are asked by the companions of the Prophet to whom we ask, then ask this young man, namely Abdul Malik". Therefore, when he was crowned the leader of the caliphate, he gave a reading of the Koran with a very small light. On the other hand, the caliph Walid Bin Abdul Malik at that time did not build many famous mosques, so that now and the other caliphs also have a *mahabbah* for this worship, except for Yazid, Muawiyah, who was declared to have deviated a lot from the order of Islamic sharia law³⁵.

The ulama figures in the city of Medina, in Goldziher's view, were those who initiated the movement to falsify hadith to support the Umayyads. To counter this view, then in fact the scholars in Medina did they all agree or not? or even Muslims in the city of Medina?, then what about the ulama figures who are in other cities such as Egypt, Basra, Kufa, Damascus, and Mecca, are there no scholars? In this context, Mecca is famous for Ata', Tawus, Mujahid and Amru bin Dinar, Ibn Juraij, and Ibn Uyainah.

In Kufa, there are 'Alqamah, al-Aswad, 'Amru ibn Sharahbil, Masruq ibn al-Ajda', and so on, in Sham there are Abu Idris al-Khaulany, Qubaisah, Sulaiman ibn Habib, and so on. In Egypt there is Yazid ibn Abi Habib, Bukair ibn Abdillah al-Laith ibn Sa'ad, and so on. These scholars also lived during the Umayyad caliphate and they were also involved in the process of importing hadith along with the scholars of Medina then where they carried it out.

If then the answer is that they do not participate in the process of importing the hadith, then why did they choose to remain silent towards the scholars of Medina who entered the hadith, and where then can we get these historical books. In fact, we only get the fact that the hadith of the residents of the Hijaz city is *ashabul hadith* and has a strong degree³⁶.

On the other hand, Goldziher also gave oblique accusations against scholars who deliberately made hadiths to mislead or keep people away from religion and practicing evil. The orientalist can be seen as individuals who do not get the guidance of Allah, so when

³³ A M Yakubu, "The Caliph's Sister, Nana Asma'u, 1793–1865: Teacher, Poet, and Islamic Leader by Jean Boyd London and Totowa, NJ, Frank Cass, 1989. Pp. Xx+ 164.£ 19.50.£ 12.20," *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 1990, <https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/journal-of-modern-african-studies/article/caliphs-sister-nana-asmau-17931865-teacher-poet-and-islamic-leader-by-boyd-jeanlondon-and-totowa-nj-frank-cass-1989-pp-xx-164-1950-1220-paperback/9E478D0B7630421D91DE8E29125>.

³⁴ Jamal A Badawi, "Leadership : An Islamic Perspective Leadership : An Islamic Perspective," no. January 1999 (2015), 35-59.

³⁵ Maimun, "Ontologi Sunnah Dan Hadis: Implikasinya Terhadap Perkembangan Pemikiran Hukum Islam," *Asas* 7, no. 1 (2015): 11–24.

³⁶ Muhin, "Hadist Menurut Mustafa Al-Siba'i Dan Ahmad Amin (Suatu Kajian Komparatif),17-28."

they lie, the result of lying is that they assume that there are more people, and the feeling for a person with a deceitful mentality will assume that everyone is also doing bad things³⁷.

At the next level, when accusations are skewed against falsified hadiths to maintain religious authority or turn away from words or images about scholars who make fake hadiths to give praise to the *ahlul bait*. Some of the companions of the Prophet, such as Abu Bakr Umar or Uthman, Aisyah gave praise to the companions of the Prophet in the Koran. For the other Companions Allah praises the Companions in the holy book, in contrast to the Shia who add to the dynamics of making false hadiths. On the other hand, there are also *ahlul-bait* problems that have an emotive impact on the Umayyads and their groups, even though they have long explained the falsity of the hadith, the Medina scholars who falsified the hadith, they still explain the falsehood of the hadith³⁸.

Goldziher gave a slanted accusation that the process of examining hadith was not only carried out by religious leaders at that time but also by government officials during the Umayyad era. This kind of accusation is just slander because socially speaking no history explains the Umayyad government who carried out the process of falsifying hadith to support their opinions. Previous scholars already have a tradition that shows that they do not have the habit of writing hadith, except with the sanad, so in the sunnah books you can find a lot of authentic hadiths that have a chain and there is no hadith from thousands of hadiths that explain the sanad of the existence of Abdul Malik. or Yazid or Al Walid or one of their workers, namely Al hajj and Khalid bin Abdillah Al Qussary³⁹.

Goldziher has a slanted view of the existence of disputes in politics and even ideology that is impossible when it is not based on hadiths that have good *sanad* strength. This is proof that the Umayyad Caliphate had encouraged the invitation to falsify the hadith. In this context, the answer is that they certainly do not consider the existence of disputes or differences that exist, because the process of falsifying hadith is the result of the schools of thought? They feel that the dispute is due to the process of forgery, even though the ulama figures provide the reason for the hadith dispute because the actions taken have two ways, which means that they are both allowed to be carried out only in different ways⁴⁰.

In certain contexts, one *riwayat* can be seen in the diversity of different conditions by the Companions, so that the implementation such as the Prophet's *Witr* prayer is carried out with odd numbers, namely 11 rak'ahs or 9 or 7 rak'ahs so that the dispute over the syabab's sum of prayers is due to seeing the Messenger of Allah, namely disputes. the other at the time of the Prophet who performed the pilgrimage, whether *Qiron*, *Mufrad*, or *Tamattu'*.

Therefore, the difference between the Companions on the hadith conveyed by the Prophet is a matter of hearing whether it has been replaced or not. And the orientalist gave oblique accusations to Muawiyah who took part in the process of falsifying the hadith. This is based on what was conveyed by Muawiyah to al-Mughirah Ibn Shu'bah. He was of the view that Muawiyah's words contained hadiths from the Umayyads who opposed Ali.

Goldziher also believes that the Umayyads also worked on the figure of Imam Zuhri who falsified the hadith. Based on these accusations, it can be answered that their

³⁷ Badawi, "Leadership : An Islamic Perspective Leadership : An Islamic Perspective, 11-32."

³⁸ Badawi.

³⁹ Maimun, "Ontologi Sunnah Dan Hadis: Implikasinya Terhadap Perkembangan Pemikiran Hukum Islam, 54-89."

⁴⁰ Rofi'i, "Mustafa Al-Siba'Iy Dan Kritiknya Terhadap Pandangan Orientalis Tentang Hadis Dan Sunnah Nabi, 62-90."

purpose of attacking was intending to destroy one of the *sunnah* which was also practiced by Abu Hurairah from among the Companions. They are more supportive of the *tabi'in*, so that if the sunnah can be removed, then the sunnah will be destroyed. And factually, it can be seen that many of Goldziher's accusations were made against Imam az-Zuhri, even though it can be seen in his history that no one accused az-Zuhri of slanted accusations because he is known as a person who is trustworthy and honest narrating hadith 41.

In Goldziher's view, the relationship between Az-Zuhry and the Umayyad caliphate was the reason for the Umayyads who had employed Az-Zuhri to include hadith in the interests of their passions. This accusation is not sufficiently grounded because we do not know enough about the relationship between an honest and trustworthy person and the caliphs of the Umayyad dynasty as a sign that they have become his work.

On the other hand, in the past, the scholars also had good relations with the previous caliphs or kings without giving influence to the kings against the ulama and also what happens to Imam Zuhri if he has a relationship with the kings or caliphs whose reasons are not strong enough to accuse him of working relationships with religious mandates or even his wisdom.

Orientalists also charged that Abdul al-Malik helped build the Dome of the Shakhrah which turned the inhabitants of Sham and Iraq during the pilgrimage from the Ka'bah to Cuba. There is a false hadith made by Al Zuhri that is not to multiply the trip except for the 3 mosques, namely the Haram Mosque, the Prophet's Mosque, and the Al Aqsa Mosque. This kind of accusation is considered odd for several reasons, including historians who do not argue that it was Al Walid Ibn Abdul Malik who helped build the Dome of Asy's Shakhrah. This is as conveyed by Ibn as Sakir, at Tabary, Ibn Al Athir, Ibn Khaldun, Kathir, and others.

Even if it was Abdul Malik who built it, of course, historians would also provide information on that history. The text which is used as the basis by Goldziher is a fatal mistake because the process of building during the pilgrimage is an act of kufr alone. Even though Abdul Malik is famously dubbed as the hamamah al-masjid, which is a person who worships a lot 42.

The orientalists who commit this lie have two things first, they think that knowledge of hadith is only seen from the outside and most of the falsified hadith can be found in hadiths that appear to be good on the *sanad* side. What knowledge is their ability to claim that many false hadiths are good *sanad*? Then how do the scholars disagree on the issue of the hadith on Sunday, for example? whether it is *qothi* (confident) or *dzonny* (prejudice), but no hadith is stated as authentic hadith. The hadith that is used as evidence can be criticized by scholars and then they give the law as a false hadith. Goldziher also accused Abu Hurairah of lying in the hadith as based on Ibn Umar's critique of the important Kalb Al Zar'i hadith and this ultimately failed because Ibn Umar himself did not want to use the version of the hadith narrated by Abu Hurairah 43.

Likewise, it also shows that Ibn Umar did not accuse Abu Hurairah of lying, but agreed that Abu Hurairah applied the complete version because of the ownership of the garden, so Abu Hurairah was judged to be stronger in his memorization. Orientalists also accuse the scholars of not having sufficient verbal narrations when they prescribe the rules

41 Rofi'i.

42 Hakim, "Perspektif Filsafat Hukum Islam Dan Pemikiran Orientalis Terhadap Sunnah, 14-72."

43 Muhin, "Hadist Menurut Mustafa Al-Siba'i Dan Ahmad Amin (Suatu Kajian Komparatif), 98-144."

in fiqh, but they make books or written sheets which are considered the wishes of the Prophet, the proof is that there is a problem of meaning in shodaqoh⁴⁴.

There are many oblique accusations and even unwarranted accusations from orientalists that do not have a sufficient basis in history. This is because the basis of the written texts that emerged in the first and second centuries cannot be accepted by the scholars as Goldziher's accusation, for example, which does not provide accuracy, on the authenticity of the hadith, therefore the scholars give the law of these texts with falsity. as in Ibn's text there is a bah and a dinar as well as Abi ad-dunya Al Ashaj and other figures⁴⁵. In this matter, Islam has challenges that are always present both internally and externally from outside Islam itself as well as the goldziher orientalists and their friends and students.

Hermeneutic analysis of hadith from the perspective of As Siba'i

According to Mustafa As-Siba'i, hadith occupies a high position in Islamic legislation and has been agreed upon by all Muslims to this day. It can be said that believing in hadith is part of accepting religion, this is revealed in a popular atsar, "Indeed the science of hadith is religion, so check from whom you took your religion." It is explained in Atsar about two important things, namely a very high assessment of the hadith, so accepting and justifying it is a must in faith. There needs to be a correct and standardized method for assessing and researching the truth of hadith⁴⁶.

Based on the need for a valid and standard method in assessing hadith, shows the seriousness of Muslims in preserving it as the main source of religious teachings. This can also be seen from the seriousness of the friends in getting and maintaining the purity of the hadith. The companions were enthusiastic in following everything they saw and heard from the Messenger of Allah. They were determined to record the sunnah of the Prophet Muhammad⁴⁷.

Therefore, some of them took turns following the assemblies of knowledge that were carried out by the Messenger of Allah. Those who were unable to attend the Prophet's knowledge assembly could obtain information through other companions who accompanied the Prophet. They do it alternately and continuously. Furthermore, the tradition carried out by these companions was then continued by the *tabi'in*, namely the generation after the companions, and continued to the next generation so that in the end it can be said that efforts to maintain the purity of hadith never stop. However, there is so much historical evidence regarding efforts to maintain the purity of the hadith, there are still people or groups who question its authenticity.

The thought of Mustafa As-Siba'i believes in the truth of the purity of the hadith which was maintained at the time of the Prophet Muhammad. From a historical point of view, certainly, there was never any falsification of hadith when the Prophet Muhammad was still alive, because he was surrounded by very honest friends. There have been doubts among some people that the hadith which reads:

⁴⁴ Mursyid Djawas et al., "The Construction of Islamic Inheritance Law: A Comparative Study of the Islamic Jurisprudence and the Compilation of Islamic Law," *Juris: Jurnal Ilmiah Syariah* 21, no. 2 (2022): 207–19, <https://doi.org/10.31958/JURIS.V21I2.7495>.

⁴⁵ Rofi'i, "Mustafa Al-Siba'i Dan Kritiknya Terhadap Pandangan Orientalis Tentang Hadis Dan Sunnah Nabi 135-167."

⁴⁶ Madjid, *Mustafa Al Siba'i Sunnah Dan Peranannya Dalam Penetapan Hukum Islam : Sebuah Pembelaan Kaum Sunni (Terjemahan)*, 247-234.

⁴⁷ Fikri, "Fungsi Hadis Terhadap Al-Quran, 1-11."

إِنَّ كَذِبًا عَلَيَّ لَيْسَ كَكَذِبٍ عَلَيَّ أَحَدٍ ، مَنْ كَذَبَ عَلَيَّ مُتَعَمِّدًا فَلْيَتَّبِعُوا مَقْعَدَهُ مِنَ النَّارِ⁴⁸

If examined in quantitative aspects, the hadith is included in the category of hadith ahad. If indeed the *asbab al-wurud* hadith is as suspected, then the transmission will be *mutawatir*, because forgery is something very evil. According to Mustafa As-Siba'i, the hadith does not have a strong historical *sanad* backing and there is also no *asbab al-wurud* as it can be read in various authentic books⁴⁹.

In addition to the historical argument, Mustafa As-Siba'i expresses his analysis of the *matan* hadith by stating that the hadith is part of the Prophet's warning to his companions to be careful in telling things that come from him and stay away from lies against him related to matters which he did not say⁵⁰. In contrast, Ahmad Amin, argues that the beginning of the falsification of hadith already exists when the Prophet Muhammad was still alive. He argues that hadith is highly suspected and there has been a falsification of hadith during the time of the Prophet Muhammad, or in other words that the *asbab al-wurud* hadith is an explanation of the events of hadith falsification that occurred during the time of the Prophet Muhammad. This view is supported by several reasons, such as because the hadith in the first period had not been recorded in a separate book. Then, it still includes only narrations based on memory, and for the reason that it is difficult to compile everything that has been said and done by the Messenger of Allah for 23 years. Ahmad Amin concludes that there are groups who dare to put down the hadiths that are based on the Messenger of Allah by lying⁵¹.

1) Bookkeeping (Codification) Hadith

Hadith codification is the effort, collection, and bookkeeping of hadith in one book or manuscript. Mustafa As-Siba'i thinks that there is no difference of opinion among the biographers of the Prophet and the narrators of hadith and the companions, that the Qur'an received special attention from the Messenger of Allah so that it was preserved by rote and written in sheets, palm fronds, and stone slabs. It became natural that when the Prophet Muhammad died, the Qur'an remained intact and orderly, nothing was lacking, except that it had not been put together in one manuscript. There is no difference of opinion that the hadith or sunnah have not been officially recorded like the Qur'an.

In a quote by M. Erfan Soebahar, according to Mustafa As-Siba'i, there are three reasons that the Messenger of Allah for 23 years with his companions wrote down his words, deeds, and associations in full in the manuscripts and the sheets were difficult to do because of the location problem. This required the presence of many people (friends), while at that time there were very few people who could write. Then, the majority of Arabs relied on their memorization to memory, while at that time the Companions were still concentrated on memorizing the Qur'an.

Furthermore, there is concern about the mixing of the Qur'an with the hadiths which are very much contextual. So, this does not mean that there has never been a hadith writing unofficially. There are several pieces of evidence shown by As-Siba'i regarding the recording of hadith at the time of the Prophet Muhammad, namely that he once wrote a

⁴⁸ "Surely lying on my behalf is not the same as lying to other than me. Whoever lies on my behalf intentionally, let him occupy his seat in hell." (Narrated by Bukhari No. 1291 and Muslim No. 4).

⁴⁹ Turmudi, "AL SUNNAH; Telaah Segi Kedudukan Dan Fungsinya Sebagai Sumber Hukum, 52-64."

⁵⁰ Badawi, "Leadership : An Islamic Perspective Leadership : An Islamic Perspective, 32-49."

⁵¹ Hairillah, "Kedudukan As-Sunnah Dan Tantangannya Dalam Hal Aktualisasi Hukum Islam, 66-71."

letter and sent it to the kings of the Arabian Peninsula, the contents of which were calls for embracing Islam. Imam Ahmad and al-Baihaqi narrated from Abu Hurairah that he said:

“There is no one who knows more about the hadith of the Prophet than I except 'Abdullah bin 'Amr bin 'Ash because he organizes what he hears from the Prophet and I do not record”.

The companion of the Prophet who is also his son-in-law Sayyidina Ali ra is certain to have a sheet on which the diyat (civil) laws are written. The Prophet also wrote a letter to the officer containing the provisions for zakat on camels and sheep⁵². Thus, some authentic evidence that Mustafa As-Siba'i put forward to strengthen his opinion which states that the recording of hadith has been done since the Prophet was still alive, although not in its entirety⁵³. It can be understood that hadith is a verbalization of sunnah or prophetic traditions in the form of words, actions, or provisions of the Prophet Muhammad which was then followed by the companions. This is in line with Amin's view regarding the bookkeeping of hadith, that at the time of the Prophet Muhammad SAW had not been recorded as the Qur'an, and we know that the Prophet Muhammad appointed several revelation writers who recorded the verses of the Qur'an at the time it was revealed, but he does not specify a person to record anything he says other than the Qur'an⁵⁴.

This statement became the starting point of Amin's criticism. He emphasized that the bookkeeping of hadith was not yet popular at the time of the Prophet Muhammad and there were no rules that were used as guidelines such as those that apply to the bookkeeping of the Qur'an, in other words, the transmission of hadith uses the memory method and not by recording. In strengthening his argument, Amin quotes the following hadith:

"Don't all of you write (something) from me. Whoever writes from me (something) other than the Qur'an, let him erase it. And say about me while this is okay, and whoever deliberately lies about myself then let him take his seat in hell (HR. Muslim from Abu Sa'id al-Khudri)."

2) Friends Credibility

This credibility is meant to assess the credibility of narrators who have moral-spiritual integrity and high intelligence. The meaning of friend here is the companion of the Messenger of Allah who narrated the hadith from him. This friend is someone who has mingled with the Messenger of Allah or saw him, believed in him, and died in a state of Islam. Responding to whether there is an opportunity for criticism of the credibility of the companions of the prophet, Mustafa As-Siba'i argues that there is no room for criticism in the companions of the prophet, as has been agreed by the tabi'in and generations after it and all scholars of hadith critics. They argue that the friends have high credibility and are free from lies and even forgeries⁵⁵.

⁵² Fikri, "Fungsi Hadis Terhadap Al-Quran", 7-15.

⁵³ Hairillah, "Kedudukan As-Sunnah Dan Tantangannya Dalam Hal Aktualisasi Hukum Islam", 23-41.

⁵⁴ Maimun, "Ontologi Sunnah Dan Hadis: Implikasinya Terhadap Perkembangan Pemikiran Hukum Islam.", 78-95.

⁵⁵ Muhin, "Hadist Menurut Mustafa Al-Siba'i Dan Ahmad Amin (Suatu Kajian Komparatif).", 40-62.

Mustafa As-Siba'i's view⁵⁶ differs from that of Ahmad Amin who states that not all critical scholars agree that the companions of the prophet are free from criticism of lies and forgeries. According to him, the critics of hadith treat the Companions like any other human being, who has the possibility of finding lies and falsehood in the Companions. The companions themselves in their time criticized each other (examined) the truth of one another. Ahmad Amin's statement is supported by several pieces of evidence, such as Bin 'Abbas' criticism of Abu Hurairah. The companions of this prophet when they hear a hadith narration, they ask the narrator of the hadith to prove its truth. The first piece of evidence, Ahmad Amin wants to explain that Bin 'Abbas and Aisyah's criticism of Abu Hurairah about the truth of the hadith which reads,

"Whoever brings (lifts) the body, then let him perform ablution⁵⁷."

Bin 'Abbas' critical attitude is that he does not want to accept the hadith due to differences in understanding. According to him, the hadith has the meaning that it does not require us to perform ablution after lifting dry wood. This is what Ahmad Amin understood, that Bin 'Abbas doubted the truth of the hadith narrated by Abu Hurairah. In another sense, he also questioned the level of justice of a friend like Abu Hurairah. Then, the demand for the presence of witnesses before accepting the hadith does apply among the companions of the Prophet Muhammad, as Abu Bakr did to al-Mughirah. Ahmad Amin understood it textually, that according to him the request for testimony was an indication that Abu Bakr did not believe in al-Mughirah. Even though it has become a habit that is always held when receiving hadith. This precautionary attitude also aims to educate Muslims to always look for evidence for the authenticity of hadith⁵⁸.

3) Theory of *Ta'dil* and *Tajrih* in Sanad Research

The definition of *ta'dil* in the term *'ulum al-hadith* has the meaning of an assessment of the quality, credibility, or level of justice of the hadith narrators. It can be said to be fair or have high credibility if in the narrator's personality there are integrated aspects of spirituality, morals, and high intelligence. If so, then the treatment is acceptable. As for *al-Jarb*, its original meaning revolves around the desire to seek reproach and injury, to save, and not based on hatred, revenge, or sentimentality.

In the context of hadith, it can be said that *al-Jarb* is done to save the hadith from something that pollutes it so that something that is injured or reproached results in low credibility or the level of justice of the hadith narrators. The highlighted credibility of the hadith narrators are matters relating to spirituality, morals, and intelligence. If these aspects cannot be fulfilled by the narrator, then the qualification has low credibility and results in the narration being rejected and even considered weak⁵⁹.

In this case, Mustafa As-Siba'i said that *ta'dil* and *al-Jarb's* assessment of a narrator must be based on objective knowledge about the condition of a narrator. If a narrator is honest, has faith, and has a strong memorization power, then the narrator can be said to be fair. On the other hand, if a narrator is known for his lies, ungodliness, and low memorization, then the narrator can be said to be flawed. Subjectivity motivated by differences in mazhab cannot be used as an excuse to *ta'dil* or harass someone. Ahmad

⁵⁶ Muhammad bin Ismail al-Kahlani San'ani, *Subul As-Salam, Juz 3* (Cairo: Syirkah Maktabah Mustafa al-Babi al-Halabi, 1950), 119-147.

⁵⁷ Hakim, "Perspektif Filsafat Hukum Islam Dan Pemikiran Orientalis Terhadap Sunnah.", 165-172.

⁵⁸ Rofi'i, "Mustafa Al-Siba'Iy Dan Kritiknya Terhadap Pandangan Orientalis Tentang Hadis Dan Sunnah Nabi.", 123-148.

⁵⁹ Abu Azam Alhadi, "Otoritas Al Sunnah Sebagai Sumber Ajaran Islam," *Akademika* 8, no. 1 (2014): 28-37.

Amin argues that *ta'dil* and *al-Jarb's* assessment of a narrator is more motivated by differences in schools of thought⁶⁰.

The *ablussunah* group did *al-Jarb* against many narrators with Shia backgrounds. On the other hand, the Shia group performs *al-Jarb* on narrators with a Sunni background.⁶¹ Thus, the *ta'dil* and *al-Jarb* traditions carried out by hadith critic scholars are the impact of differences in schools and even politics so what comes to the surface is the subjectivity of critics. From the description of the views of Mustafa As-Siba'i and Ahmad Amin, it is very clear that the difference is in the background or motivation of a hadith critic in doing *ta'dil* and *al-Jarb* to the narrators⁶².

Mustafa As-Siba'i argues that the assessment of *ta'dil* and *al-Jarb* carried out by hadith critic scholars is motivated by the desire to find the level of truth and defects of the narrator which can then be used as a basis for accepting or rejecting a narration. As for Ahmad Amin's view, the differences in schools or politics behind *ta'dil* and *al-Jarb*. According to Mustafa Al-Siba'i's view, he has generated different schools of thought in the discussion of *ta'dil* and *al-Jarb*. Whereas what makes the basis for assessing justice and the weaknesses of the hadith narrators is not solely based on the differences in these schools of thought. However, there are doubts about the truth or level of trustworthiness of the narrators from all aspects⁶³.

D. Conclusion

As-Siba'i is an extraordinary ulama' and has many monumental works and is an activist who has an extraordinary struggle for fighting the invaders and preaching Islam. In the course of his life, he struggled to purify Hadith or maintain the authenticity of hadith from orientalist figures and liberal ulama figures who doubted the purity of hadith as the second law after the Qur'an.

This struggle was carried out by writing monumental works such as *Assunah wamakanatuba* to be read by the world about his extraordinary thoughts to maintain the purity of the Prophet's hadith. In his works, various orientalist opinions corner Islam and doubt the authenticity of discounter hadith logically, systematically, and clearly so that they can reaffirm the beliefs of some Muslims who may be torn to the purity of the Prophet's Hadith as a basis for Islamic law and a reference in behavior in life apart from Al -The Qur'an, which was more or less influenced by the dangerous thoughts of these orientalists and liberal figures.

References

- Alhadi, Abu Azam. "Otoritas Al Sunnah Sebagai Sumber Ajaran Islam." *Akademika* 8, no. 1 (2014): 28–37.
- Alyona, Baltabayeva, Gabitov Tursun, Maldubek Akmaral, and Shamakhay Saira. "Spiritual Understanding of Human Rights in Muslim Culture (The Problem of 'Ruh' – 'Spirit')." *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 217 (February 5, 2016): 712–18. <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.SBSPRO.2016.02.131>.

⁶⁰ Madjid, *Mustafa Al Siba'i Sunnah Dan Peranannya Dalam Penetapan Hukum Islam : Sebuah Pembelaan Kaum Sunni (Terjemahan)*, 132-138.

⁶¹ Mu'min, "Hadis Dan Sunah Dalam Perspektif Fazlur Rahman", 77-83.

⁶² Fikri, "Fungsi Hadis Terhadap Al-Quran", 14-21.

⁶³ Maimun, "Ontologi Sunnah Dan Hadis: Implikasinya Terhadap Perkembangan Pemikiran Hukum Islam," 97-126.

- Amer, Amin Fateh. "A Critical Study of the Anti-Ḥadīth Ideology from a Qur'ānic Perspective." University of Birmingham, 2010.
- Badawi, Jamal A. "Leadership : An Islamic Perspective Leadership : An Islamic Perspective," no. January 1999 (2015).
- Bernard, Harvey Russell. *Research Methods in Anthropology : Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*. 2nd Editio. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications Inc., n.d.
- Denzin & Lincoln. *The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications Inc., 2011.
- Djawas, Mursyid, Khairuddin Hasballah, Soraya Devi, Muntasir A. Kadir, and Yusfriadi Abda. "The Construction of Islamic Inheritance Law: A Comparative Study of the Islamic Jurisprudence and the Compilation of Islamic Law." *Juris: Jurnal Ilmiah Syariah* 21, no. 2 (2022): 207–19. <https://doi.org/10.31958/JURIS.V21I2.7495>.
- Djazuli. *Ilmu Fiqh: Penggalan, Perkembangan, Dan Penerapan Hukum Islam*. Jakarta: Kencana, 2012.
- Fahimah, Siti. "Hermeneutika Hadis: Tinjauan Pemikiran Yusuf Al-Qordhawi Dalam Memahami Hadis." *Refleksi* 16, no. 1 (2018): 83–104. <https://doi.org/10.15408/ref.v16i1.10177>.
- Faiz, Fahrudin, and Ali Usman. "HERMENEUTIKA AL QUR'AN: Teori, Kritik Dan Implementasinya." *Dialektika*, 2019.
- Farida, Umma. "Diskursus Sunnah Sebagai Sumber Hukum Islam : Perspektif Ushuliyin Dan Muhadditsin." *Jurnal Pemikiran Hukum Dan Hukum Islam* 6, no. 1 (2015): 237–55.
- Fikri, Khairul H. "Fungsi Hadis Terhadap Al-Quran." *Fungsi Hadis Terhadap Al-Quran* 12, no. 2 (2015): 178–88.
- Hairillah. "Kedudukan As-Sunnah Dan Tantangannya Dalam Hal Aktualisasi Hukum Islam." *Mazahib* Vol. XIV, (2015): 193.
- Hakim, Nurul. "Perspektif Filsafat Hukum Islam Dan Pemikiran Orientalis Terhadap Sunnah." *Jurnal EduTech* 5, no. 1 (2019): 45–56. <http://journal.umsu.ac.id/index.php/edutech/article/view/2761/2692>.
- Hauqola, Nurkholis. "HERMENEUTIKA HADIS: Upaya Memecah Kebekuan Teks." *Jurnal THEOLOGIA* 24, no. 1 (2016): 261–84. <https://doi.org/10.21580/teo.2013.24.1.324>.
- Madjid, Nurkholis. *Mustafa Al Siba'i Sunnah Dan Peranannya Dalam Penetapan Hukum Islam : Sebuah Pembelaan Kaum Sunni (Terjemahan)*. Jakarta: Pustaka Firdaus, 1991.
- Maimun. "Ontologi Sunnah Dan Hadis: Implikasinya Terhadap Perkembangan Pemikiran Hukum Islam." *Asas* 7, no. 1 (2015): 11–24.
- Mu'min, Ma'mun. "Hadis Dan Sunah Dalam Perspektif Fazlur Rahman." *Jurnal Studi Hadis* 1, no. 2 (2016): 311–30.
- Muhin, Masrukhin. "Hadist Menurut Mustafa Al-Siba'i Dan Ahmad Amin (Suatu Kajian Komparatif)." *Al-Fath* 6, no. 1 (2012): 56–70.
- Mukhtar, Mukhtar, Basri Mahmud, and Hamzah Hamzah. "KONTROVERSI KESARJANAAN AL-QUR'AN KONTEMPORER (TELAAH KRITIS HERMENEUTIKA AL-QUR'AN NASR HAMID ABU ZAID)." *Zawiyah: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 8, no. 2 (2022): 141–58.
- Qohin, Abd, and Siti Kasiyati. "Criticism of Orientalist Critical Views Toward Hadith Studies." *Journal of Hadith Studies* 3, no. 1 (2020): 1–13.
- Rofi'i, Muhammad Arwani. "Mustafa Al-Siba'Iy Dan Kritiknya Terhadap Pandangan Orientalis Tentang Hadis Dan Sunnah Nabi." *KABILAH: Journal of Social Community* 4, no. 1 (2019): 90–107. <https://doi.org/10.35127/kbl.v4i1.3679>.

- San'ani, Muhammad bin Ismail al-Kahlani. *Subul As-Salam, Juz 3*. Cairo: Syirkah Maktabah Mustafa al-Babi al-Halabi, 1950.
- Turmudi, Moh. "AL SUNNAH; Telaah Segi Kedudukan Dan Fungsinya Sebagai Sumber Hukum." *Jurnal Pemikiran Keislaman* 27, no. 1 (2017): 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.33367/tribakti.v27i1.255>.
- Yakubu, A M. "The Caliph's Sister, Nana Asma'u, 1793–1865: Teacher, Poet, and Islamic Leader by Jean Boyd London and Totowa, NJ, Frank Cass, 1989. Pp. Xx+ 164.£ 19.50.£ 12.20" *The Journal of Modern African Studies*, 1990. <https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/journal-of-modern-african-studies/article/caliphs-sister-nana-asmau-17931865-teacher-poet-and-islamic-leader-by-boyd-jeanlondon-and-totowa-nj-frank-cass-1989-pp-xx-164-1950-1220-paperback/9E478D0B7630421D91DE8E29125>.